

Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

Volume 45

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/8913>

Mónika Ambrus · Ramses A. Wessel
Volume Editors

Netherlands Yearbook of International Law 2014

Between Pragmatism and Predictability:
Temporariness in International Law



ASSER PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Springer

Volume Editors

Mónika Ambrus
Department of International
and Constitutional Law
University of Groningen
Groningen
The Netherlands

Ramses A. Wessel
Centre for European Studies
University of Twente
Enschede
The Netherlands

ISSN 0167-6768 ISSN 1574-0951 (electronic)
Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
ISBN 978-94-6265-059-6 ISBN 978-94-6265-060-2 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-060-2

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2015

Library of Congress Control Number: 72-623109

This Volume is also available as a journal product, either as part of the subscription to Volume 61 of the Netherlands International Law Review, or as a stand-alone journal, both through Cambridge University Press. In addition to the electronic version published on <http://www.springerlink>, the Yearbook is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service.

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer Science+Business Media B.V. Dordrecht is part of Springer Science+Business Media
(www.springer.com)

Board of Editors

F. Amtenbrink
Erasmus University Rotterdam

H.G. van der Wilt
University of Amsterdam

W.J.M. van Genugten
(General Editor)
Tilburg University

M. den Heijer
University of Amsterdam

J.E. Nijman
University of Amsterdam

M. Kuijer
Ministry of Security and Justice

W.G. Werner
VU University, Amsterdam

D. Prévost
University of Maastricht

R.A. Wessel
(General Editor)
University of Twente

Managing Editor

M. Ambrus
Faculty of Law
University of Groningen
Oude Kijk in 't Jatstraat 26
9712 EK Groningen
The Netherlands

Aims and Scope

The Netherlands Yearbook of International Law (NYIL) was first published in 1970. As a double-blind peer-reviewed publication, the NYIL offers a forum for the publication of scholarly articles of a conceptual nature in a varying thematic area of public international law. In addition, each Yearbook includes a section *Dutch Practice in International Law*. The NYIL is published under the auspices of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut.

T.M.C. Asser Instituut

Located in the ‘international zone’ of The Hague—the City of Justice, Peace and Security, The T.M.C. Asser Instituut is a leading, inter-university research institute operating in the broad field of international law.

Founded in 1965, the Institute’s international community of scholars is engaged in research, postgraduate training and dissemination of knowledge in furtherance of the purposes and principles of international law. This inter-university institute cooperates closely with and supports the Dutch universities’ activities in the relevant disciplines. The academic fields covered by the Institute are Private International Law, Public International Law, Law of the European Union, International Commercial Arbitration, International Humanitarian Law, International Criminal Law and International Sports Law.

The Institute enjoys an excellent reputation at national and international level for its development, organisation and hosting of conferences and academic meetings, demand-driven postgraduate programmes and training. Its ancillary websites and data collections all contribute to a coherent and integral strategy in the area of knowledge transfer.

The Institute has its own publishing house, T.M.C. Asser Press. The T.M.C. Asser Press not only serves the publishing needs of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut, but also those of academics and practitioners worldwide in the fields of International and European Law.

T.M.C. Asser Instituut
Institute for Private and Public International Law
International Commercial Arbitration and European Law

Institute Address:
R.J. Schimmelpennincklaan 20–22
2517 JN, The Hague
The Netherlands

Mailing Address:
P.O. Box 30461
2500 GL The Hague
The Netherlands
Tel.: +3170 342 0300
Fax: +3170 342 0359
Email: NYIL@asser.nl
Internet: www.asser.nl

Contents

Part I Between Pragmatism and Predictability: Temporariness in International Law

1	Between Pragmatism and Predictability: Temporariness in International Law	3
	Mónika Ambrus and Ramses A. Wessel	
1.1	Introduction	4
1.2	Forms of Temporariness.	5
	1.2.1 Temporary Objects.	6
	1.2.2 Temporary Subjects	8
1.3	International Law and Change	9
	1.3.1 Temporary Objects and International Law.	9
	1.3.2 Temporary Subjects and International Law	13
1.4	Conclusion: All Relative?	15
	References.	16
2	Temporariness and Change in Global Governance	19
	Rene Uruena	
2.1	Introduction	20
2.2	International Law in a Constant Present	21
2.3	Change and Temporariness	26
	2.3.1 Change and Temporariness in a Global Regulatory Space.	28
	2.3.2 Thinking About Change in the Constant Present.	32
2.4	Normative Challenges	33
2.5	Conclusion.	37
	References.	38

3	Temporary International Legal Regimes as Frames for Permanent Ones	41
	Jean Galbraith	
3.1	Introduction	42
3.2	Why Use Temporary International Legal Regimes?	44
3.2.1	Factors Favouring the Use of Temporary Regimes	44
3.2.2	Sources of Strength for Temporary Regimes	47
3.3	Temporary Regimes as Foundations for Permanent Regimes	48
3.3.1	Causes	49
3.3.2	Implications	51
3.4	Case Studies	54
3.4.1	Refugee Law	54
3.4.2	International Criminal Law	58
3.4.3	Climate Change	61
3.5	Conclusion	63
	References	63
4	The International Rule of Law Time After Time: Temporary Institutions Between Change and Continuity	67
	Sofia Ranchordás	
4.1	Introduction	68
4.2	The (International) Rule of Law as a Source of Legal Certainty	71
4.2.1	The Rule of Law: Here, There and Everywhere?	71
4.2.2	The International Rule of Law and Time	76
4.2.3	The International Rule of Law as a Law of Lasting Rules?	78
4.3	Temporary Rules, Institutions and Measures	82
4.3.1	Temporary Legislation and the Rule of Law at Home	82
4.3.2	International Temporary Institutions, Rules and Measures	85
4.4	Conclusion	87
	References	89
5	International Law and Time: A Reflection of the Temporal Attitudes of International Lawyers Through Three Paradigms	93
	Christian Djeffal	
5.1	International Law in Time: The Familiar Stranger	94
5.2	Paradigm Shifts	96
5.2.1	The Temporalisation of International Law	97
5.2.2	The Flexibilisation of International Legal Time?	104
5.3	General Conclusions	115
	References	117

6	(Inter)Temporal Considerations in the Interpretative Process of the VCLT: Do Treaties Endure, Perdure or Exdure?	121
	Panos Merkouris	
6.1	Introduction	122
6.2	Definitional Issues	125
6.2.1	Endurantism, Perdurantism, and Exdurantism.	125
6.2.2	Intertemporal Law	128
6.2.3	Principle of Contemporaneity and Evolutive/Dynamic Interpretation	129
6.3	Silence Can Speak Volumes: The Lack of Explicit References to Intertemporal Considerations in the VCLT	134
6.3.1	Pre-VCLT Considerations on the Topic	134
6.3.2	Rejection of Explicit Incorporation of the Doctrine of Intertemporal Law in the VCLT: Draft Article 56	135
6.3.3	Rejection of Explicit Solutions to Intertemporal Considerations Through the Backdoor of Article 31	137
6.4	Points of Entry of Intertemporal Considerations in Article 31 VCLT.	139
6.4.1	Direct Point of Entry	139
6.4.2	Indirect Point of Entry	144
6.5	Limits	150
6.6	Conclusion	151
	References.	152
7	Shifting Demands in International Institutional Law: Securing the United Nations' Accountability for the Haitian Cholera Outbreak.	157
	Kate Nancy Taylor	
7.1	Introduction	158
7.2	The Responsibility of the UN for the Cholera Outbreak	159
7.3	The UN's Jurisdictional Immunity.	161
7.4	Alternative Modes of Dispute Settlement	164
7.4.1	The UN's Obligation to Settle Private Law Disputes.	164
7.4.2	Would the Cholera Claims Fall Within the Scope of the UN's Liability?.	165
7.4.3	Dispute Settlement Mechanisms in UN Peacekeeping Operations	169
7.5	Shifting Demands in the Law of International Organisations	172
7.5.1	Would a Domestic Court Be Willing to Adjudicate the Cholera Claims?.	172
7.5.2	Elevating the Cholera Claims to an International Level	176
7.5.3	The Rule of Law in the UN and the Handling of the Cholera Claims.	178
7.5.4	The Human Rights Imperative	180
7.5.5	Demands for the Enhanced Accountability of the UN.	183

7.6	Permanent Versus <i>Ad Hoc</i> Solutions	187
7.6.1	Theorising Permanent Solutions	187
7.6.2	<i>Ad Hoc</i> Solutions: A Revised Role for Domestic Courts?	189
7.7	Conclusion	191
	References.	192
8	Protecting Human Rights During Emergencies: Delegation, Derogation, and Deference	197
	Evan J. Criddle	
8.1	Introduction	198
8.2	The Resilience of Derogation Standards	201
8.3	Derogation Standards as Delegations	206
8.4	Deference for an Altruistic Regime	212
8.5	Conclusion	218
	References.	219
9	Temporary Protection: Hovering at the Edges of Refugee Law.	221
	Jean-François Durieux	
9.1	Introduction	222
9.2	Time in the International Legal Regime	226
9.2.1	Time as ‘Attachment’	226
9.2.2	Time as Deadline	227
9.2.3	A Clash of Times	230
9.3	Temporary Protection in Europe, 1992–2001	232
9.3.1	A Time of Crisis	233
9.3.2	After the Crisis	240
9.4	Hovering on	244
9.5	Conclusion: Time for a Showdown	249
	References.	252
10	Between the Devil and the Deep Blue Sea: Enhancing Flexibility in International Climate Change Law	255
	Harro van Asselt	
10.1	Introduction	256
10.2	Flexibility in the United Nations Climate Change Regime	258
10.2.1	Delegated Law-Making	259
10.2.2	Scientific Input	260
10.2.3	Review and Amendment	262
10.2.4	Entry into Force, Reservations and Withdrawal	265
10.2.5	Differentiation	266
10.2.6	Implementation	268
10.2.7	Compliance	269
10.2.8	Flexibility in the Climate Change Regime: Advances and Limitations	271

10.3	A Pluralist Approach to International Climate Change Law as an Alternative Model	272
10.3.1	The Virtues of a Pluralist Approach.	273
10.3.2	The Baby and the Bathwater	276
10.4	Enhancing Flexibility in International Climate Change Law	278
10.5	Conclusions	281
	References.	282
11	Commissions of Inquiry: Flexible Temporariness or Permanent Predictability?	287
	Christian Henderson	
11.1	Introduction	288
11.2	Commissions of Inquiry as Temporary Adjudicative Bodies of International Law.	289
11.3	The Impact of Temporary Commissions of Inquiry Upon International Legal Adjudication	295
11.3.1	The Formality of International Legal Adjudication.	295
11.3.2	The Principle of Non-intervention.	300
11.3.3	Procedural Fairness	303
11.4	Concluding Remarks: A Permanent Commission of Inquiry?	307
	References.	310
12	Special Temporary Measures and the Norm of Equality	311
	Adeno Addis	
12.1	Introduction	312
12.2	The Nature of Special Temporary Measures	317
12.2.1	Special Rights and Special Measures	317
12.2.2	The Nature of Special Measures	318
12.3	Equality and Special Measures	321
12.3.1	Equality as Non-discrimination (Equality of Treatment)	321
12.3.2	Equality as Equality of Opportunity	322
12.4	Temporariness and Predictability: The Issue of Durational Limit	325
12.5	Temporariness and Predictability: The Virtue of Candor.	327
12.6	Conclusion	329
	References.	330
13	Paradise Postponed? For a Judge-Led Generic Model of International Criminal Procedure and an End to ‘Draft-as-You-Go’	331
	Michael Bohlander	
13.1	Introduction	332
13.2	A Case in Point: The STL	337
13.3	The Conceptual Framework: Purpose, Fairness and Efficiency	341
13.3.1	Characteristics of Domestic Procedures	341

- 13.3.2 Problems of International Procedure: Geo-Politics, Mass Atrocities and Creation of a Historical Record . . . 342
- 13.3.3 Sources of International Criminal Procedure: The Limited Role of Human Rights Law 343
- 13.3.4 International Criminal Procedure and General Sources of International Law 344
- 13.3.5 Efficiency in Fairness: The Path Forward 345
- 13.4 Preferring the Judge-Led Model: Reasons and Parameters 346
 - 13.4.1 Romantic Views of the Role of the Judge in the Adversarial Trial 346
 - 13.4.2 Absence of the Dichotomy Between Spheres of Professional and Lay Adjudication 347
 - 13.4.3 Efficiency Aspects: Adversarial Versus Judge-Led Model 348
- 13.5 Conclusion 354
- References 355

Part II Dutch Practice in International Law

- 14 Platforms, Protestors and Provisional Measures: The Arctic Sunrise Dispute and Environmental Activism at Sea 359**
 - Richard Caddell
 - 14.1 Introduction 360
 - 14.2 The *Arctic Sunrise* Dispute 362
 - 14.2.1 Jurisdiction of the Tribunal 365
 - 14.2.2 Non-participation of the Respondent State 368
 - 14.2.3 Prompt Release and Provisional Measures 370
 - 14.3 Platforms and Protest Activism 374
 - 14.3.1 Offshore Installations and the Law of the Sea 374
 - 14.3.2 Freedom of Speech at Sea 378
 - 14.4 Concluding Remarks 382
 - References 383
- Table of Cases 385**
- Index 393**