The European Association of
Development Research and Training Institutes (EADI)
Gender and Development Working Group
present

Occasional Paper No. 10

Proceedings of the
EADI-Workshop

Gender and Globalisation:
Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring

20-21 April 2001
Noordwijkerhout, The Netherlands

convened by

Dr. Joy Clancy
Technology and Development Group
University of Twente
PO Box 217
7500 AE Enschede
The Netherlands
j.s.clancy@tdg.utwente.nl
www.utwente.nl/tdg

Prof. Dr. Gudrun Lachenmann
Sociology of Development Research Centre
University of Bielefeld
P.O. Box 100131
33501 Bielefeld
Germany
gudrun.lachenmann@uni-bielefeld.de

Dr. Margaret Skutsch
Technology and Development Group
University of Twente
PO Box 217
7500 AE Enschede
The Netherlands
m.m.skutsch@tdg.utwente.nl
www.utwente.nl/tdg

in conjunction with

EADI executive committee member for the Netherlands:
Prof. Dr. Isa Baud
Inst. of Human Geography
Faculty of Environmental Sciences
University of Amsterdam:

University of Twente
Technology and Development Group
List of Contents

Preface

Introduction

Short summaries of presentations

Gender biases in finance
   Irene van Staveren

Feminisation of Textile Labour and Migration Patterns in Bangladesh and Malaysia
   Petra Dannecker

Doing Information Technology in the Philippines: a gender perspective
   Czarina Saloma

Globalisation, women and the politics of place: work in progress
   Wendy Harcourt

New knowledge about Muslim-women, narratives of women in six countries
   Selma Leydesdorff

A view from the sky: globalisation, gender, development and the energy sector
   Wendy Annecke

Gender Mainstreaming in International Research Organisations: the European Dimension
   Charlotte Martin

Mainland Brides: Marriages between Taiwan and Mainland China in the Context of Transnational Marriage Migration
   Lu Chia Wen Melody

Annex I: Information over EADI and convening institutes

Annex II: Programme

Annex III: Addresses of speakers

Annex IV: A selection from the ELAND catalogue on Globalisation and Gender

---

EADI-Workshop Gender and Globalisation: Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring
We would like to thank speakers and participants for sharing their ideas and giving new insights. We would also like to express personal thanks to Wendie Klieverik and Martina Teders for their excellent work in organising the Workshop, and to Mariëlle Feenstra and Annette Geelink for their help during the workshop. Mariëlle and Annette also need to be acknowledged for their efforts in preparing the workshop report both in hardcopy and for the web-site.

Without funds we would not have been able to organise this workshop. We thank the CERES Research School for Resource Studies for Development, the Belle van Zuylen Institute, RAWOO (Advisory Council on Research on Developing Countries), the University of Twente (Technology and Development Group and Emancipation Bureau (Freutelpot)) and the University of Amsterdam (University Board (CvB)) for their financial contribution.

Finally we would like to thank the EADI Secretariat for their permission to publish the proceedings of the workshop on Gender and Globalisation: Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring as a TDG Occasional Paper.

Dr. Joy Clancy, University of Twente
Dr. Margaret Skutsch, University of Twente
Prof. Dr. Gudrun Lachenmann, University of Bielefeld
Prof. Dr. Isa Baud, University of Amsterdam
The European Association of Development Research and Training Institutes (EADI) Gender and Development Working Group in conjunction with the EADI Executive Meeting organised a workshop on “Gender and Globalisation: Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring” from 20-21 April 2001 in Noordwijkerhout, The Netherlands. The workshop can be seen as a follow-up in the course of the EADI-Paris meeting “Europe and the South in the 21st Century”. In that meeting the issue of globalisation arose as a core issue for all EADI Working Groups. This workshop focussed on how gender interrelates to globalisation on the macro, meso and micro level.

The theme of the seminar Gender and Globalisation: Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring was outlined in four parts:

Part 1: Globalisation, macro-economic policy and gender
Part 2: Labour markets, gender and social policies
Part 3: Local restructuring of gendered economics
Part 4: Globalisation and local identities: gender, religion and social security

On the second day participants presented their work-in-progress.

In part 1 on globalisation, macro-economic policy and gender, Irene van Staveren discussed gender biases in global finance and pointed to the use of gender audits in transforming leading financial institutions. The second part on labour markets, gender and social policies unfortunately had to be cancelled due to illness of both speakers. Part 3, Local restructuring of gendered economics, then became part 2. Petra Dannecker and Czarina Saloma showed how agency (of women) is connected with the concept of embeddedness. Wendy Harcourt showed how poor women and women’s groups responded to and shape resistances to globalisation’s dominant neo-liberal capitalist discourses. In Part 3: Globalisation and local identities: gender, religion and social security Selma Leydesdorff reported on a qualitative method of listening to narratives to create new knowledge. And Carla Risseeuw introduced us to a new way of knowledge production by learning from ‘Southerners’ studying (on problems in) Western society. Finally, Ed Maan spoke about the need of a demand-driven, interactive approach to research programming based on the experience of their Philippine-Dutch research programme on biodiversity issues in the Philippines.
The second day work-in-progress was presented. Wendy Annecke presented her work on gender, poverty and energy in South Africa. She attended us on the HIV/AIDS situation and how that brings an urban-rural migration. Charlotte Martin gave an overview of her research on gender mainstreaming in international research organisations: the European dimension and introduced a transformative gender approach. Finally, Melody Lu Chia Wen spoke about her work-in-progress on mainland brides: "transnational" marriages migration between Taiwan and mainland China. Is it trade or do women have a say?

In EADI News, June 2001, abstracts of some of the papers can be viewed. These proceedings contain short summaries of all presentations, followed by papers or full text of most of the presentations. In the annexes you find an overview of the programme, an address list of speakers, more information on EADI and the Gender and Development Working Group and a bibliography on Gender and Globalisation. We also invite you to visit www.utwente.nl/tdg for further reading on the workshop.

We hope you will enjoy reading,

Joy Clancy, Margaret Skutsch, Gudrun Lachenmann
EADI Gender and Development Working Group
Part 1: Globalisation, macroeconomic policy and gender

Gender biases in finance

Dr. Irene van Staveren

The speaker introduced us into a new field of study: gender analysis of finance. With globalisation, the micro (including the intrahousehold level); the meso (industry, banking, government institutions, taxation); and the macro (national as well as global) levels of finance have become more and more interrelated. She examines how global finance influences, and is influenced by, the differentiated economic positions of women and men and the important role of the global women’s movement in this field.

The speaker described how four gender biases in global finance makes it more difficult to build effective and efficient financial markets. The first is the under-representation of women in financial decision-making. The second is the increased gender gaps in the economic positions of women and men. Another gender bias lays in the fact that the burden of financial instability falls on women. The (mainly female) care economy compensates for (mainly male) rent-seeking in financial markets. The response of the institutional framework (IMF, World Bank, G7) is reactive, inducing moral hazard that increase the likelihood of financial crisis. The fourth gender-bias is that gender discrimination leads to inefficient resource allocation in financial markets. Studies reveal that female repayment rates are higher, so not to invest in women is reducing a country’s annual per capita GDP growth.

Supported by the UN Conferences on Women and the internet, the global women’s movement integrated rapidly. With combined efforts they have taken up many activities to improve the economic and financial position of women. To overcome gender biases in financial markets the speaker suggests a shift of focus of women’s organisations from the micro to the macro level. Gender audits can monitor the gender impacts of public finance and add to the transparency of financial institutes; the IMF should be transformed from a reactive to a proactive body; the World Bank should provide grants (instead of loans) for human development and micro-credit programmes should focus on
control (instead of access) of women.

Part 2: Labour markets, gender and social policies

Unfortunately both speakers fell ill and this part of the programme was cancelled. Instead part 3 became part 2.

Part 3: Local restructuring of gendered economics

Feminisation of Textile Labour and Migration Patterns in Bangladesh and Malaysia

Dr. Petra Dannecker

The migration of production sites leads not only towards new employment patterns for women but furthermore to the construction of a “typical” female activity. The focus was on the social and relational aspects of these processes, to give more insights into the gendered embeddedness of economic transformations and activities. The gendered division of labour, the construction of skill, the mobility of the workers and the promotion possibilities in the garment sector in Bangladesh and Malaysia were used to show that economic phenomena are deeply gendered.

The speaker described how employers and employees explained the division of labour. Once a particular job is labelled “male” or “female”, it is difficult to dislodge it, indeed quite the opposite happens, it becomes naturalised. It is the definition of skills that creates the difference between men and women’s jobs. Independent tailoring in Bangladesh for example is, traditionally a male occupation. So whereas the work on sewing machines in the factories is defined as unskilled and therefore a typical female task, outside the same activity is defined as skilled and therefore typically male. The example showed that an activity gets degraded when women perform the work.

The presentation showed that women are active agents. Their rationalities are difficult to explain in pure economic terms since they are socially embedded. This has to be taken into consideration to understand the gender specific embeddedness of processes of economic globalisation. The speaker described the rationalities for changing workplaces. Only through change of workplace income can be
increased, nevertheless more often social interactions and relations were responsible for the observed mobility. The speaker also showed how promotion is personal as well as ethnic or gender based. When a woman expected negative social consequences she did not desire promotion.

**Doing Information Technology in the Philippines: a gender perspective**

*Czarina Saloma*

The speaker presented the Philippine Information Technology industry as an arena of the new economy, and as the site of the interfaces of global-local and male-female spheres of interaction. As a result of these interfaces, spaces for active, creative work have also been broadened. This is exemplified by the ‘middle group’, the group of information technology workers who consume and re-purpose the ‘elite’ technological material for the consuming majority.

With an analysis of the ‘social embeddedness of the economy’ from the gender perspective, spaces and interfaces were examined. Saloma’s research suggests that the arenas where the ‘middle group’ are to be found are indeed gendered. The questions why ‘female spaces’ are more likely to emerge in certain arenas of the new economy and why the presence of women does not mean the ‘feminization’ of such arenas, are addressed by focusing on the implications of hybridity as expressed in the transdisciplinarity of certain arenas of information technology.

What do changes in some technological arenas mean to social constructions of observable ‘female spaces’? According to the speaker an analysis of the creation of ‘female spaces’ in hybrid arenas is incomplete without addressing the question of resistance and networking that characterize interfaces. In her view certain conditions such as being a numerical minority (in contrast to the numerical predominance of women in assembly work) and informal office cultures that favour males shape the ways female members of the ‘middle group’ create spaces for themselves.

**Globalisation, women and the politics of place: work in progress**

*Dr. Wendy Harcourt*

The Globalisation, women and the politics of place: work in progress outlines the speakers initial research as part of a joint activist research project ‘Power, Culture and Justice: Women and the Politics of Place’ supported by the Rockefeller Foundation on how poor women and women’s groups
are responding to and shaping resistances to globalisation's dominant neo-liberal capitalist discourses. The central concept used to understand these activities is the politics of place. The speaker explained the conceptual approach of the project as well as giving some initial examples of the research to date.

The examples illustrate a modern defense of place by women's groups. It shows different strategies to politicize place. Place-based politics become more complex using different sources of globalisation. One of the examples given was about a group of Australian Aboriginals women, who petitioned the Federal Labour Government to stop the building of a bridge as this would disturb sacred women's sites. The women lost this case in court. Via internet and networking the women continued their fight with the support of a solidarity movement in Australia and were succesful.

Part 4: Globalisation and local identities: gender, religion and social security

Life stories of cultural change: gender and Islam in six countries

Prof. Dr. Selma Leydesdorff

The Tropical Institute in Amsterdam and the Belle van Zuylen Institute are involved in a project “Women, Islam and Development”. The aim of the project is the creation of new knowledge about Muslim-women through narratives of women in six countries, with a particular interest in changes in life, culture and mentality.

The speaker described how listening to narrated experiences of individual women is a unique method to gain a subjective understanding of time and context, which in her opinion cannot be obtained by traditional quantitative research. Even though unique experiences of life often cannot be compared, the continuing themes can lead to useful generalizations and better understanding.

Women, regardless of even the harshest context of their daily lives, have dreams and wishes and ideas about change. Their stories reflected on social and cultural change and showed their struggle with codes and normative patterns. The in-depth interviews also made visible if public discourse is silenced in fields of women’s agency. To understand these silences is important in order to create an adequate policy.
Globalisation in The Netherlands through Indian feminist’ eyes

*Prof. Dr. Carla Risseeuw*

The current retraction of state welfare is challenging the structure and content of familial relationships. This has led to a public debate in the Netherlands on the relation between state and individual/familial responsibility towards family and friends (i.e. the issue of "care-leave"). While some argue for a revival of the family, others plead for a further 'individualisation' of state welfare legislation, leading to individual family members receiving their own state benefits, irrespective of their family status.

The speaker spoke about an Indo-Dutch Programme for Academic Research project being conducted by three senior Indian scholars and the speaker. It aims at an analysis of the impact of the changing welfare system on relations within marriage, family and social networks in the Netherlands, as well as an analysis of the public debate on this process. In the selection of case-studies care was taken to address the socially weaker members of society, found in the category of senior citizens; (divorced) women, children of divorced parents and members of single parent homes. The methodology involved analysis of existing research and documentation; collection of quantitative data coupled with qualitative research, involving a structured interview schedule as well as open-ended, group interviews and ‘participant observation’. The debate on the welfare state was analyzed through analyzing written sources and extensive interviews with spokes-(wo)men on the debate.

The speaker reported on the ‘unusual aspects’ of this research, considering the usual North-South relation. Policy-makers in the Netherlands are not used being advised about issues in the North by researchers from the South. Also interesting was the Southern researchers’ reflection on Dutch habits and customs that Dutch researchers may not notice. The validity of quantitative research in the project was questioned. It appeared that the response rate of inquiries usually is not more than 20 per cent and these data are used for analysis and policy making. The speaker described how she ensured a good response rate by placing advertisements in newspapers to reach respondents.

Demand-driven research for development: an interactive approach to research programming

*Drs. Ed Maan*

The speaker explained the structure and policy principles of RAWOO. RAWOO is not a funding agency, but issues recommendations regarding research priorities and foster communication among
the various parties involved in research for development. Although funded by the Dutch Government, RAWOO is an independent body and has 15 full members, of which six of them are from developing countries. Their policy is that research for development must be needs-oriented and demand-driven; capacity building and institutional development are part of it and South-North partnerships must be equal, genuine and sustainable.

The presentation continues with the example of a current design of a South-North research programme in the Philippines in the field of biodiversity. The speaker described how the developing country takes the lead in defining its own national research agenda through a consultative process involving relevant stakeholders. Based on their needs Dutch research capacity is mobilized. A comprehensive approach combines research activities, human resources development, institution-building, networking and infrastructure development. Stakeholders are represented in the programme committees and both partners have an equal say and influence in decision-making and in the allocation of funds to research projects. An important aim of the project is to persuade minister Herfkens (Dutch Minister of Development Cooperation) to support demand-driven research.

"Work in Progress" on Gender and Development

A view from the sky; globalisation, gender, development and the energy sector

Wendy Annecke

Wendy Annecke is a South African researcher currently finishing her Ph.D. at the University of Cape Town. Her presentation showed how being a woman, and in particular how being a poor women in South Africa, affects interactions with the energy sector. In the developed countries most energy is used in commerce, industry and transport. In many developing countries the domestic and agricultural sectors account for the largest proportion of energy consumption.

A gender analysis of the energy sector reveals that there are very few women in decision making positions in the sectors with power and financial clout – electricity and petroleum. In contrast most women are clustered at the bottom of the pyramid as consumers of energy for domestic purposes. One would expect that significant policy, planning and investment should be devoted to these sectors, but up until recently, development has meant the provision of large-scale infrastructure in the hope that benefits would ‘trickle down’ and, when they didn’t, the targeting of women to channel resources and benefits for
the entire household. Only in the last 10-15 years have women begun to be treated as individuals to be empowered through income generating projects, adult literacy classes and health programmes. The speaker also pointed to the AIDS-problem and how it affects the lives of women and that of their children, as it often results in migration from the urban to the rural area. Grandmothers are left to bring up grandchildren (who are resentful of being plucked from their more interesting urban environment) since their mothers are too physically weak to care for them. The older generation of poor women now have many more mouths to feed without extra income.

The speaker returned to the experiences of poor women, and the role energy plays in being able to perform their productive and reproductive tasks. Not all women experience their gender roles in the same way as showed an example of a household where unusual gender relations operate. With this in mind the speaker posed the question of how to ensure that women do not remain forever vulnerable to the whims of men, and how to ensure that safe and affordable and sufficient energy services are accessible to all. The solutions are multi-faceted and every person working in the energy sector can contribute to them.

Gender Mainstreaming in International Research Organisations: the European dimension

*Dr. Charlotte Martin*

The speaker reported on work being done by the KIT gender team (and seven other autonomous teams) for the European Commission (Women and Science Unit). The gender team’s brief was to assess the progress of efforts to mainstream gender into the INCO programme, ‘Confirming the International Role of Community Research’. The status of gender as well as issues of partnership and North South links were investigated.

The speaker discussed the development of the conceptual framework, designed to provide a basis for their analytical work. The key issues identified pointed to the conclusion that effective mainstreaming is most likely to take place within a transformative gender approach i.e. one where gender is not merely integrated within an existing policy agenda but rather transforms the agenda. Such an approach requires action on all levels, i.e. both conceptual, organisational and at the level of implementation. Having identified the elements that were central to a transformative approach in research on science and technology, the OECD/DAC framework was adapted so that it was useful for the specific purpose of the study.

Then the speaker gave a preliminary assessment of the status of gender mainstreaming and
partnership issues within INCO, and the EU-Fifth Framework Programme (1998-2002) (the FP5 funds research in science and technology). They found that gender mainstreaming is still at an early stage in the FP5 and INCO, although equal opportunities policies are being implemented. Partnership issues receive a lot of attention within the INCO programme, although partnerships are conceived of in a rather narrow way. The Sixth Framework Programme will deal with the international dimension to research in a different way, and there are fears that it will lose its distinct character.

Mainland Brides: Marriages between Taiwan and Mainland China in the Context of Transnational Marriage Migration

Lu Chia Wen Melody

The speaker presented her research proposal about marriages between Mainland Chinese women and Taiwanese men. The “mainland bride phenomenon” is a recent development that started in the early 1990s. Via agencies and internet marriages are negotiated. Due to the cross-strait political tension, the Taiwanese government set up restrictive measures to regulate this kind of marriages, including a quota system of residential permits. In spite of the mounting pressure from the public to relax the measure, the Taiwanese authorities granted residential permits to less than one fourth of the registered brides so far. Governmental policies and the public discourse in Taiwan often portray mainland brides as the “inferior other”, putting them and their families in a marginalized and vulnerable situation. Meanwhile, the Chinese government defines commercial marriages as “trade in women” and has launched a campaign against it. However, little has been done to stop this trend.

One of the questions the speaker is interested in is why mainland brides, who often are educated women living in the cities, decide to marry overseas to become the wife of poor rural men. She feels that women have a say and that you cannot speak of a trade.

The research will study the experience of the actors involved, including the brides, husbands, families in both Taiwan and China, their friends, as well as brokers, governmental organizations and the public discourse. The study of Taiwanese-mainland Chinese marriages will yield important theoretical insights into the study of transnational marriages, Chinese migration and the reinvention of tradition(s). The linkage between macro socio-economic changes, cultural notions of marriages and gender relations, and people’s living experience will be developed in this research.
Gender biases in finance

Irene van Staveren
Institute of Social Studies, P.O. Box 29776, 2502 LT The Hague, NL, e-mail: staveren@iss.nl

This paper discusses some of the relationships between gender relations and finance, particularly at the meso- and macro-levels\(^2\) of financial transactions and trends. I focus on gender-based inequalities in finance, and the gender-based inefficiencies in finance that are created as a result. I argue that these gender biases in finance perpetuate both inequalities between women and men, and poverty.

Before I start, I want to emphasise that caution is needed. The discussion on these issues is at a very early, exploratory stage. So far, only a very few studies have been undertaken on the relations between gender and the meso- and macro-levels of finance (see van Staveren 2001). The majority of the existing studies of gender and finance have focused on the micro-level questions of how women and men benefit differently from credit programmes, and how they face different constraints. The few studies that focus on the higher levels of finance are very recent.\(^3\) The research on which this discussion draws has limitations. It starts from a recognition that distinctions exist between men’s and women’s roles, but without enough information on the precise nature of gender role differences within different countries.

A major problem for researchers who want to study gender issues in the field of finance is the lack of gender-disaggregated data. Data on financial markets, and evaluations of the effects of financial policies on poverty and development, tend to be completely gender-blind. It is still difficult to find data on women’s savings rates compared to men’s savings rates, or on women’s investments compared to men’s investments, or any indication of the difference between interest rates charged to women and men. In contrast, other sets of economic data, for example on labour markets, are increasingly likely to have been disaggregated for men and women. Almost every labour market statistic around the world now presents data on male and female labour force participation, and many countries have indications of the extent of the gap between men’s and women’s earnings. Because of this problem

---

1 We are grateful to Oxfam for their permission to publish this paper. The original publication source of this paper is: Gender and Development, volume 9, Number 1 March 2001, pp. 9-17, published by Oxfam GB.

2 The micro-level refers to the economic activities of individuals. The meso-level refers to financial institutions. The macro-level refers to the economy at national and international level.
with data, this paper makes use of all data available, of many different types, including case studies, annual reports, and modelling exercises performed with secondary data.

**Micro-, meso-, and macro- levels of finance**

We know that finance and gender are closely inter-related at various levels of the economy. At the micro-level, women and men in households have different levels of savings and investments; this is mainly attributable to lower female incomes, and the fact that considerably less property is registered in women’s names. Therefore, women’s access to, and benefits from, lending and saving through credit institutions differ significantly from those of men. This affects their demand for financial services. On the supply side, the staff of banks and credit programmes often have different attitudes towards female and male borrowers, and can be less willing to supply women with financial services. In addition to banking systems often not being prepared to respond to women’s needs for finance, financial markets tend to ignore the role of women in the supply and demand of finance, and government financial policies often suffer from inherent gender biases. Finally, at the macro-level, these gender-based inequalities affect a country’s gross domestic product (GDP), its levels of investment, its interest rates, and even the stability of financial markets.

**Gender-based inequality**

Financial trends and policies affect both women and men. However, they do this in different ways, since women and men have different roles in economies and societies. Although the gender division of labour differs in every cultural context, there are some widespread general patterns. Women tend to be active in unpaid work in the household, providing care for household members and the wider community, purchasing consumer goods for the household, and managing household living standards. As employees, women are disproportionately concentrated in low paid, insecure, ‘flexible’ work, and in work that is - or is perceived to be - low-skilled. Women are more active than men in the informal sector, including home-based work, and in the lower ranks of the public sector. Men concentrate on paid work outside the home, and are disproportionately numbered in paid employment, particularly in the private sector, and in the higher ranks of the public sector. On average, men earn more than women, are likely to have more secure contracts with better conditions, and to enjoy more leisure time. As a consequence of these facts, men do pay more income tax than women.

---

3 For example, Sing and Zammit 2000; Floro and Dymski 2000; Lim 2000; Aslanbegui and Summerfield 2000; Baden 1996.
Global financial trends and policies affect women particularly adversely. They have an impact on unpaid labour, and in the labour market they particularly affect the public sector - mainly the lower-end jobs - and the export industry sector (these issues will be explained in more detail later). Women often have to find ways to mitigate the effects on their households of reduced government expenditure on public goods and services. For example, reduced public expenditure can lead to fewer and lower subsidies on food, higher prices for energy, transport, and drinking water, and increased fees for schooling and health care.

Finally, there is a fiscal (public revenue-related) component of finance that has differential impacts on women and men. Whereas income taxes are often low, value-added tax (VAT) and local tax (for example fees for informal sector operators, levied by municipalities) tend to increase if governments are forced to increase their revenues in a financial crisis. While income tax falls most heavily on wealthier people, VAT and local taxes hurt the poor more than the rich, and hence, women more than men. In contrast with major tax revenues from income taxes in developed countries, income tax revenues are less than VAT tax revenues in developing countries. While men have higher incomes, they pay more income tax than women. However, men also receive tax reductions, dependent, for example, on the number of children they have. Women often do not enjoy such tax reductions, even when they are made responsible in the household for expenditures for the children. At the same time, women are made responsible for the purchase of household consumer goods, which includes VAT. Poor women who work in the informal sector have to pay local taxes to the municipality, for example for the space they use in the street for their food stalls. Moreover, women and the poor often lack political power to demand a shift of the tax burden from the poor to the rich, and from women to men. The next two sections give examples of the ways in which international trends and policies in finance have had negative consequences for women, compared to men.

The impact of economic crises on women’s work

Women’s lives and livelihoods are affected by economic crises in particular ways, rooted in the gender division of labour and attitudes about women’s role in the household. Recent trends show women increasing their participation in formal and informal paid employment, and simultaneously being more vulnerable than men to employment losses in the formal sector. This results in statistics showing higher levels of female unemployment compared with male unemployment. However, labour market statistics and time studies in developing countries indicate that during economic crises, and immediately afterwards, the amount of time that women spend doing both paid and unpaid work
increases. In contrast, men's time doing paid work, and their contribution to household and community tasks, remain fairly constant.

1. Increases in the time women spend earning money for their families

Female labour force participation rates tend to increase when household incomes go down and purchasing power is reduced. At the household level, unemployment of a male breadwinner seems to trigger a response on the part of female household members to substitute for the lost income by entering the labour market, or by increasing the number of hours they are already active in the labour market. Women also tend to increase their labour market supply when male wages are reduced or when, because of inflation and currency devaluation, these wages become insufficient to maintain household living standards. As a consequence, there is an increase in the number of hours women spend in paid labour. Women tend to find employment in low-skilled jobs, irregular contracts, and 'flexible' work, including home work (Carr, Chen, and Tate 2000), at the lower end of the wage ladder.

2. Decreases in women's formal sector employment

Women who are employed in industry and in the formal sector also face particular problems due to the increasing mobility of money, which has led to countries being unable to retain foreign capital investment.

In theory, increased capital mobility due to portfolio investment and direct foreign investments in developing countries is good news, in that those countries have gained more access to foreign capital. However, this capital is also able to move out of the country again, when financial markets signal political instability or an economic downturn. For example, during the Asian financial crisis in 1997, billions of portfolio investments moved out of countries like Indonesia, Thailand, and Malaysia, leading to the bankruptcy of banks and firms, to currency depreciations, and to enormous losses of central bank reserves and government resources. At the same time, multinational companies tended gradually to reduce their activity in Asia, away from the unstable financial environment.

---


2 Portfolio investments are a mix of different financial assets held by individuals, banks, or other organisations, that can be bought and sold in the short run. In contrast, direct foreign investments are held in a particular company and can only be sold with the sales of (part of) the company, hence, in the long run.
In Asia, this outflow of capital resulted in large-scale job losses in the private sector, in particular in the export industries that had previously attracted large amounts of foreign capital. The workforce of the export industries is about 75 per cent female. Throughout the public and private sectors, millions of employees lost their jobs in the year after the crisis. Women employees were disproportionately affected: in the banking and financial services sector of South Korea, 86 per cent of those who lost their jobs were women (World Bank 1998).

3. Increases in the time women spend in unpaid work

Redundancies and wage decreases threaten families' living standards. So too do decreases in public expenditure, which can also be associated with financial crises. In times of financial crisis, governments use large sums of money in an attempt to counter the out-flow of capital from the country, and the accompanying decrease in the value of their currency. Meanwhile, the decrease in exports (following a fall in demand in the crisis-hit region) reduces their tax revenue from export duties. A budget deficit is generated in consequence, which is addressed through cuts in public expenditure.

The impact on households of lower household incomes and decreased government services is at least partially compensated for by increased hours of female unpaid labour. Women react to lower consumption levels and reduced availability of public services by increasing their production of home-made goods and services. For example, they may grow vegetables or make meals with cheaper and more labour-intensive ingredients. They may decide to travel on foot rather than by bus, to fetch firewood rather than buy kerosene or electricity, or to try to treat family illnesses at home rather than consult a doctor or buy expensive medicine.

Overall, when the increase in women’s time spent in household and caring work is combined with the increase in the time they spend trying to earn an income, the total time women spend working is likely to increase substantially in an economic crisis. As pointed out at the start of the section, men’s labour time does not seem to change much. Circumstantial evidence from time-use data suggests that if they have lost paid employment, they may find a less productive job in the informal sector, but will not necessarily work longer hours. Their unpaid labour time is not likely to increase much either, scattered evidence suggests, because of the gender division of labour that prevents men from undertaking ‘women’s tasks’, even when men find themselves unemployed.
**Limits on women's access to financial resources**

As financial markets expanded, increasing amounts of money were transacted, and banks became more competitive, access to finance increased during the past decade. However, this has been the case far less for women than for men. In fact, financial markets suffer from 'gender distortions' - distortions that disadvantage female borrowers as well as female savers, aside from the lack of collateral that limits women's access to finance (Baden 1996).

In most developing country contexts, women have less information about financial products and services than men do. This can be explained partially by lower female literacy rates in most (but not all) developing countries, and the fact that women have less command over essential factors like transport to reach banking facilities than do men. It is also partly because financial information aimed at the household level tends to be controlled by men, through media, the marketing strategies of financial institutions, and government information channels. Thus, many women have less access than men to information about financial issues including investment opportunities, credit programmes, savings schemes, and market interest rates.

It is more difficult for women to get loans or credit than it is for men because most savings and lending institutions prioritise the needs of male customers. This relative difficulty is sometimes referred to as a higher 'negotiation cost'. Women and men often require different kinds of service from financial institutions. For example, women tend to want to save and borrow smaller amounts than men. This is partly explained by women's lower income levels, but also by the fact that women tend to borrow and lend more regularly, in order to meet cash flow irregularities in the household. Most banks are not used to these small-scale needs. It can be very difficult to convince a bank employee that value will be added to the bank's business if he or she goes against accepted policy and practice in order to lend unusually small amounts of money, or to accept regular savings deposits of small amounts. In fact, for a bank, regular, small transactions generally imply higher administrative costs.

Women borrowers have to confront the prejudice of bank employees concerning the profitability of their investments and their repayment rates. The majority of employees in banks and credit programmes continue to assume that women are likely to be less skilled entrepreneurs than men, and that women will be less reliable in terms of repayment of loans. In reality, however, as various credit scheme evaluation studies have indicated, women are better investors than men, and even when they use loans for consumption purposes, their repayment rates appear to be higher than those of men. Figures from Women's World Banking point out that programmes that lend exclusively or mainly to
women enjoy repayment rates of around 97 per cent - higher than in many programmes that provide credit to men.6

Monitoring costs of credit (costs related to the control over a loan, the subsequent investment, and its returns) are higher for female borrowers and savers. This is because men often control resources within households. Men tend to be breadwinners, but even when they are not, they often take up the role of head of household, dominating household decision making. A study of the Grameen Bank and three other credit institutions in Bangladesh has indicated that only 37 per cent of the female borrowers retain control over their loans within the household (Goetz and Sen Gupta 1996). This means that in 63 per cent of the households where women have taken a loan in their own name, men have partly or completely used the money for their own priorities. Nonetheless, a woman who takes a loan remains responsible for repayment by the bank, even when her husband uses the loan without generating any return on investment. Ultimately, some women may even be worse off with a loan than without it. (For another perspective on these issues, see the article in this issue by Juliet Hunter and Nalini Kasynathan.)

Women often come under more pressure than men to repay their loans. This is sometimes referred to as a higher 'enforcement cost'. This is an interesting point, in light of the fact that many lending institutions target women because they are such good repayers. It is tempting to believe that this better rate of repayment is because women are more efficient in business, or more honest, than men. However, it may be due in part to women’s greater vulnerability to coercion. Case study material suggests that women are more likely to be put under pressure than men to pay back their loans (Goetz and Sen Gupta 1996). This pressure can come from men in their own households, who have an interest in the loans their wives or daughters obtain, or it may come from creditors, who threaten women who they believe will not be able to repay their loans.

In conclusion, the opening-up of financial markets, and the transfer of money from the international financial institutions and international development organisations into local credit schemes, local employment generation, and national government resources, have a mixed impact on women.

Gender-based inefficiency in global finances

Gender biases in finance not only result in unequal treatment of women and men; they also result in economic inefficiency. A rather technical definition of economic inefficiency, still dominant in

6 http://www.womensworldbanking.org
economic textbooks, and often in economic policy, is that 'inefficiency' means that resources have not been allocated in an 'optimal' way, i.e. a way that would lead to maximum output with minimum input. For example, an efficient allocation of credit loans would be characterised by a maximum number of loans transacted at minimum costs. When the interest rate is too high, few loans will be taken, since people will judge credit to be too expensive. When the interest rate is too low, lenders will not earn enough to cover their costs so, again, only a few loans will be provided since for most creditors offering credit will not be profitable. The efficient interest level is the one that balances maximum credit against minimum cost.

In reality, this technical explanation of efficiency and inefficiency is of limited use, due to the complexity of real market situations. The assumptions underlying the standard definition of efficiency often do not hold in the real world. For example, they include assumptions that everyone has equal access to perfect information, that a particular historical context is not going to affect people's economic behaviour, and that the behaviour of everyone involved is motivated by self-interest, rather than by any other motive. Often, the free market fails to generate an efficient allocation of resources, and government policy is required to offset this.

Moreover, even if this definition of efficiency were accurate, it might very well lead to outcomes that would be undesirable from a social perspective, since inequality would result from those with limited purchasing power being excluded from the market. Alternatively, the outcome might be undesirable from an environmental perspective, since environmental impacts are difficult to price, and as a result the environmental costs of a particular transaction are not easily taken into account in the efficiency calculation. For example, selling the rainforest may be profitable for the selling company, its capital owners, and the value of its shares on the stock exchange. At the same time, society incurs considerable costs when rainforests are logged, in terms of global warming, conflict with indigenous peoples, and loss of biodiversity, including medicinal plants.

In 1934, dissatisfied with these shortcomings of the common notion of efficiency, Margaret Reid developed an alternative definition. It is helpful for environmental economics as well as for feminist economics. She defines efficiency as 'the minimisation of waste'. To determine the efficiency of a transaction, her approach requires that we define the waste of environmental, time, social, public, or private resources that occurred in the transaction. This definition is neither restricted to the market place, nor to non-realistic assumptions about economic behaviour. Inefficiency, according to Reid, can also be present in women's unpaid labour. When women need to walk an hour to fetch drinking
water, this may be a waste of time, if it could be have been used more productively in some other way.

**Two levels of inefficiency in financial markets**

In the standard definition of efficiency, credit markets operate efficiently when as much credit as possible is provided at minimum costs. Since credit in developing countries is always in short supply (because of the limited savings available for use by lenders in financial markets where incomes are low), there is never enough credit to satisfy demand. The focus is therefore on minimising costs and providing maximum credit. Banks and other 'mainstream' credit institutions tend to lend more to men than to women for two reasons. The costs to banks of lending to women may be high because women tend to ask for smaller and more regular loans. Banks also wrongly perceive that costs of loans to women will be higher, because they assume that lending to women will be less profitable than lending to men. As a result, many women find it difficult to gain access to credit. To those who simply aim for efficient allocation of credit through the market, the fact that women have limited access does not matter, because what matters is that the market is allowed to run efficiently.

This situation changes as soon as lending to women appears to be more profitable. Evaluation studies at the Grameen Bank in Bangladesh indicated that women borrowers were more efficient than men, with higher repayment rates. In 1991, 15.3 per cent of male borrowers from Grameen Bank missed repayments, against 1.3 per cent of female borrowers (Morduch 1999, 1583). These findings indicate that, even according to the common definition of efficiency with all its problems, credit markets are inefficient as soon as they discriminate against women.

When we use Margaret Reid’s definition of efficiency, we see how discrimination against women borrowers produces another negative social and economic outcome for entire countries. It appears that if women are excluded from credit markets, poverty cannot be reduced to the same extent that it might be if they were able to borrow. This is because loans to women appear to result in a higher amount of money being spent on the household than is the case with loans to men. On average, for every 91 (US) cents that women are loaned, an extra $1 will be spent on household consumption (for example, purchase of food, clothing, and other essentials). In comparison, it takes an average loan of $1.48 dollars to men to result in the same increase in household consumption (ibid., 1593). If credit is lent to women, higher increases in household living standards will be obtained than if it is lent to men. This finding parallels findings on differences in women’s and men’s spending on household needs. Men tend to keep a higher share of their incomes for personal expenditure rather than for household
consumption in the interest of all members of the household, whereas women tend to spend a higher share of their incomes on household consumption.

**Poverty based on inefficient allocation of finance**

Scaling up from households and individuals to the macro-level, gender-related inefficiencies in finance reduce the growth of GDP, limit the success of poverty-reduction policies, and result in macro-economic instability.

The law of diminishing marginal returns states that the returns from the last unit of a factor of production (labour, capital, or land) are lower than the returns from the units added earlier. For example, if you use 100kg of fertiliser on your crops, the first 10kg will cause the biggest increase in yield, while the last 10kg will cause the smallest increase. This law is true for most production factors, though not for all (for instance, human resources). It particularly holds for capital investments: more machines, tools and means of transport will help to increase production, but to a diminishing degree.

The law of diminishing marginal returns means we can say that lending to those who have the lowest starting levels of investment will bring higher marginal returns on the investment, assuming that entrepreneurial talents are more or less equally distributed. Men generally have more to invest in a business, so the marginal returns on investment by men will be lower than for women. Therefore, for an economy as a whole, a bias in credit provision in favour of men and against women will be inefficient, and may well lead to lower output levels in the economy than would be the case if women and men had equal access to, and control over, credit. So, for efficiency reasons, in the short run, more money should be lent to women and less to men. It is the stock of capital that is one of the major determinants of GDP growth, together with levels of technology and human resources. Since women have less access to these other production factors as well, it becomes clear that the combined gender biases in financial markets, technology markets, and education, together limit the potential growth rates of GDP, and result in a failure to reduce poverty.

**Poverty based on damaging risk strategies used by men**

'Moral hazard' refers to the results of a type of economic behaviour that shifts risks from oneself onto another person, while one keeps the benefits oneself. Financial markets are known to be risky, and even more so when we consider portfolio investments. Usually, each investor bears the risk of his or her own financial transactions. However, in recent financial crises, some investors have been bailed...
out' by governments or the International Monetary Fund (IMF), with the help of new credit loans. This creates a moral hazard, in that investors are likely to take excessive risks, in order to reap high returns, because they are confident that they will be refunded if they lose. This is an unintended side effect of financial crisis policies by governments and the IMF, whose actions are intended to prevent economic collapse and the spread of crisis to other economies.

From a gender perspective, another source of moral hazard functions in financial markets. In times of financial crisis, women bail out governments through their activities in the care economy. Women, who often bear primary responsibility for household living standards, tend to make up losses in purchasing power and public services provisioning with their own unpaid labour. The more they do so in times of financial crisis, as they did in Asia in 1997 and in Russia in 1998, the more moral hazard is increased in financial markets. At the micro-level, why should a man not engage in another risky investment adventure if the household's survival is guaranteed by his wife and daughter, whatever the outcome? At the macro-level, governments also rely on women's unpaid labour time, to compensate for a reduction in public expenditure. In effect, investors and governments shift the risk of financial instability to women, rather than bearing the costs of their risky financial market transactions themselves, or reducing financial market expansion. This reliance on women's unpaid labour enables financial markets to grow continuously, with increased risks of an outflow of capital, an accompanying fall in GDP, and an increase in income poverty, as well as time poverty.

Conclusion

I have argued that finance is a gender issue, at all levels of the economy, and pointed out that more research is needed into the linkages between finance and gender, particularly at the meso- and macro-levels. I have discussed two sets of issues relating to gender inequality and gender-based inefficiency. Gender biases in financial systems reinforce inequalities between women and men, and destabilise economies at the macro-level, resulting in GDP growing very slowly or even declining. At the micro-level, this means increased poverty for households and individuals, both in terms of reduced income and increased time-poverty, especially among women, as individuals struggle to work longer hours to make up the family income and substitute for services that the state used to provide.
Bibliography


Feminisation of textile labour and migration patterns in Bangladesh and Malaysia (Draft)

Petra Dannecker
Sociology of Development Research Centre, University of Bielefeld, P.O. Box 100131, D-33501 Bielefeld, e-mail: Petra.Dannecker@uni-bielefeld.de

As you all have probably recognized the title of the presentation is rather broad whereas the time frame is limited. Thus I decided to focus on empirical material to show how the work especially in garment factories is organized and embedded in the respective local society. Certain work patterns will be worked out which can be found in garment factories in Bangladesh as well as in garment factories in Malaysia where nowadays a great number of Bangladeshi migrants are employed. The aim of the presentation is to show that throughout Asia certain characteristics concerning this kind of employment can be found which are closely related to the specific export oriented industrialization despite the local embeddedness of these processes. The most obvious characteristic is that mainly women are the ones who mediate these processes and who are the key selling points of these nations ambitions to become players in the global marketplace.

The presentation is based on empirical data I have collected in Bangladesh during a one year field research and some findings from a shorter research period in Malaysia. The data consists of interviews with garment workers with a biographical perspective and group interviews in different social arenas and observations in different settings. Furthermore I have visited a number of factories and talked additionally with factory owners, representatives of union and federations and NGOs in working in this sector. Last year I conducted some interviews with returned migrants from Malaysia and organizations working with Bangladeshi migrants in Malaysia.

Introduction

I think we all know, that the contemporary global economy consistently relies on women, in countries around the world, as the foundation of a cheap and compliant work force. The reliance on female labor is especially pronounced in textile and electronics industries that have dominated the shift to globally dispersed production sites. Whereas in some countries this is rather a long-stay phenomenon, like in Malaysia or Thailand in Bangladesh women have only recently been linked to the global economy. But also here women’s labor is attractive because of the persistent assumptions by
employers regarding what kind of workers women are, like docile, cheap and mobile. This of course is not new. Throughout the history of industrialization manufacturers have sought out female workers, especially where production conditions are characterized by low pay, high turn over and a labor-intensive, highly repetitive work process. Even though the pattern is not new, what contemporary is the extent to which it now replicates itself in the diverse regions of the globe which has given rise to catchphrases as „The New International Division of Labor“, „Global Feminization“ or „The feminization of Labor“ (Standing 1989). Additionally this kind of industrialization also gives rise to the feminization of migration. Especially in Asia but also in industrialized countries (sweatshops) it can be observed that more and more women migrate especially from the so called underdeveloped countries to seek employment in export oriented factories in the so-called new developed countries. The migration of Bangladeshi women to Malaysia is a striking example of this development showing the regional economic diversification that took place during the last 20 years.

A lot of studies and papers try to explain and analyse the observed transformations. We have statistics delivering a quite concrete picture of women’s formal sector employment, we have interpretations on the basis of demographic characteristics or political and economical conditions and labor market approaches focusing either on the “demand” or “supply” side trying to explain the increased female labor force participation. Whereas some studies conclude that women are the winners of the global restructuring other see them as the losers. But we actually know little about the social and relational aspects of the new division of labor and the complex and contradictory relations among individual and groups in the “new” settings. Focussing on the actors and thus on the gendered embeddedness of economic processes will give us first of all more insides about the economic transformations and its processes and practical activities which operationalize gender images and gender relations. Secondly this approach will show that the Bangladeshi female worker in Bangladesh as well as in Malaysia are well aware that they are part of the ongoing economic and social transformations that take place and the exploitation going on but they also try to find their places and create new spaces within these processes.

In the following I will focus on the gendered division of labor, skill, the mobility of workers and promotion to show that no “innocent economic phenomena” (Milkman and Townsley 1994) exist that they are all gendered.

**Gendered division of labor**

Officially employers claim that they have practiced no discrimination in their recruitment policy
neither with regard to gender, age, nor area of origin, even though the gender distribution and the concentration of women in the low paid occupational categories is obvious and empirically proved for Bangladesh as elsewhere. In the garment factories in Bangladesh employment patterns, which can be found all over, especially in the "global" factories producing for the global market, are reproduced. Women are confined to the low-paid jobs, mainly in the sewing section as operators, whereas the management positions almost exclusively consists of men. In accordance with the different employment structures of men and women the earning also differ, generally women earn even for the same job only two third of what men get paid. A similar scenario can be found in studies concentrating on export-oriented sectors all over the world.

The reasons given by the management interviewed for this distribution are the lack of education and skill on the part of the women and the generally higher productivity of men, which makes them more entitled to perform management and supervisory positions. But, as the interviews show, gender stereotypes based on so-called "natural qualifications" are the underlying reasons for the management's decisions regarding recruitment. Several managers told me that women are biologically extremely suitable to work on sewing machines while men are too clumsy for this work (see also Kabeer 2000, 70). On the other hand men are better supervisors because they have, as one manager puts it, "natural authority" and greater assertiveness while women lack self-confidence. Often the biological logic is linked additionally to variations in efficiency by sex and age. Not only are women more productive on the sewing machines - "this work is designed for women" - they are, according to the managers, when under thirty easily trained and adapt quicker to the function they have to perform. The interviews with the women workers show that the women themselves justify to a large extent the discrimination on socially accepted grounds of male superiority. Several women stated that superiors have to be men. Once a particular job is labeled "male" or "female", as in the garment factories, it is difficult to dislodge it, indeed quite the opposite happens, it becomes naturalized. Thus the highly gender-specific segmentation along the lines of occupation, sector of employment and gender identity of activity is widely accepted and reproduced by the workers as well as the management. Nevertheless it has to be added that like in the case of Malaysia a certain flexibility occurs if a shortage of female migrant women appears. Out of Bangladesh it seems that according to the interviews male migrant workers have no problems to fulfill the so-called typical female tasks.

Generally it can be analyzed that a specific international gender ideology has grown around this kind of factory work. The employment of women has been defined and constructed as quite "natural". In the age of "globalisation", the whole industries are 'migrating' reconstituting the mostly female labor
forces in the respective countries into a nimble fingered group “naturally” predestined to work on sewing machines in assembly lines.

This is in so far exceptional as the sex segregation, i.e. the concentration of women and men in different jobs that are predominantly of a single sex, varies across societies as to which gender is expected to do what job. Most occupational sex typing is influenced by cultural constructions of gender, which does not mean that this occupational typing is static, it changes and varies overtime and within societies. Nonetheless with regard to sex segregation in the export-oriented sectors, women constitute worldwide the majority of workers in the production section of these industries. A particular labor market and the crystallization of a gender division of labor developed on a global level which is unique in its dimension as well as its expansion and became institutionally elaborated and reproduced across different social structures and time and places. This gender segregation is embedded in the global economic order so deeply that “a willful act of discrimination is not really necessary to maintain gender inequality” (Milkman and Townsley 1994, 611).

Because the sex segregation in this sector is so deeply embedded it is even more important to stress that labor markets are not a gender neutral context to which “women simply bring a set of preconditioned attitudes, but is permeated by implicit gender ideology activated through the practices of management, unions, male workers and women themselves” (Sinclair 1991, 2). Especially the practices and the interactions have to be highlighted since they are embedded in broader social relations and “produce and reproduce gender at the same time that they produce wages, workers and commodities” (Milkman and Townsley 1994, 600).

I will with regard to skill, promotion and turnover show their shortcomings and engender the theoretical concepts. Labor markets are not “innocent economic phenomena”, wage differences between men and women cannot only be explained by the dynamics of the markets and imperfect competition. Gender plays an important role. Already the fact that jobs get downgraded when they are performed by women shows that labor markets do not value male and female labor independently of gender. Labor institutions are shaped by social practices and cultural values.

Skill and its construction is a good example to show that it is the sex of those who do the work rather than its content which leads to the identification as skilled or unskilled and that men and women’s labor is valued differently according to gender.
The Construction of Skill

The so-called lack of skill and education is, according to most of the labor market approaches the main reasons why women work in narrowly-specified, repetitive and dead end jobs. Thus the feminization of labor is due to the increase of unqualified jobs. It is further argued that because women are not skilled and less educated they are extremely well suited to this type of employment. But this argument cannot explain why the integration of women is so selective, i.e. they work only in certain sectors like for example the garment industries but not in other wage-employment sectors (see Brinton 1993, 118). More than that, the question arises why employers favor unskilled women when there is no shortage of unskilled men. In Bangladesh for example, depending on the definition, the extent of unemployment and underemployment range between 18 and 37% in 1990 (Rahman 1994, 34).

According to the empirical data collected it seems more likely that the jobs become modified or newly created to fit the available and cheap female workforce. Although the demand for cheap female labor is characterizing the export-oriented industrialization strategies since the 70s, women were not the ones creating these new jobs just by transforming their domestic tasks into jobs in the market economy, since this kind of formal sector employment, as for instance in Bangladesh, was never open to women.

Women are unqualified, with regards to education and skill, according to the factory owners in Bangladesh, therefore they only can perform the simplest and most repetitive tasks, operating the sewing machines. Women’s so-called “natural abilities” are not defined as skill, as the interviews reveal. Interestingly none of the factory owners could explain exactly how he defines skill. Often the employers used gender stereotypes to make their points. Women’s inability to handle electricity was one argument to amplify why women workers are hardly found in the ironing section where the salaries are higher, or it was argued that women are not able to work with scissors and therefore lack the necessary skill to work in the cutting section. Nonetheless as the interviews revealed, the majority of the interviewed operators were able to repair their sewing machines, or to change the needles without male support, i.e. to perform technical tasks. Often the supervisors, who hardly ever had experience with the work on the sewing machines, lacked that “skill”. The work itself has to be done with extreme care and attention, otherwise the whole working process would be interrupted. Furthermore if skill is, as the employers were stating, the main reason for the sex segregation in the factories, the question arises why not more emphasis was put on training beforehand, for example through training centers, and why the few male operators earn twice as much as the female operators.
despite the similarity in education as well as in experience (Paul-Majumder 1995, 86; see Pearson 1994, 346 for a general overview).

None of the women interviewed had experiences in running a sewing machine but nor did the majority of supervisors interviewed. Most female workers learnt the work in an informal way when they were working as helpers, thus depending on the goodwill and support of the operator in charge. Typically, informal training or the informal acquisition of skills is not recognized. On the job training is the rule. The women were willing to improve their skill, even using their free time to learn the work processes on the sewing machines, but their desire did not correspond with training opportunities. Wichterich (1998, 24) argues that providing training is not profitable for the owners.

Tailoring, which one could assume would be the required skill for this kind of factory work, is in Bangladesh, like elsewhere, traditionally a male occupation. In local markets as well as in bigger shops men sit behind the sewing machines. Since the tailors are very much exposed to the public, especially on markets, women are excluded from this occupation. Yet tailors are hardly working in the garment factories because, as one union representative explained, they would be too expensive compared to the women workers. One tailor on the market told me that he tried to get employment in one of the first factories but was rejected with the argument that it is cheaper to employ a woman even though she does not have the necessary experience on the sewing machine. As discussed already the work in the garment factories on sewing machines is defined as a typical female task because men are too "clumsy", whereas outside the factories the same activity is defined as typically male. The construction of male and female abilities and thus activities depends on the context and the respective arena as the example illustrates. Furthermore it shows that the activity gets degraded when women perform the work, as concluded above already (see Ibrahim 1989, 1098; Sinclair 1991, 12; Humphrey 1987, 221). Tailoring is valued as an occupation in public while the same task performed by women in the factories has no value per se.

This example shows the social construction of ‘men’s’ and ‘women’s’ jobs or occupations. The magic word for the construction of difference is "skill" (see Krais 1993, 166). It is the definition of skill, of who is skilled and who not, of who is professional and who not, of who has the ‘natural’ ability to supervise others and who not, that creates the difference between men’s and women’s jobs. Thus as the biographies of the women reveal, even when the women improve their skills, like for example by running the sewing machines and repairing them when no mechanic was available, the workers were still said to be “unskilled” and thus paid less than their male colleagues even for the same work. The denial of the female labor capacity, as in this case, is the “normal” mechanism of devaluing the work.
done by women. The correlation drawn between skill and job grading and salaries is constructed, corresponds to the gender order in society and operates by the social recognition or denial of competence and skills. Gender and not skill, the sex of those who do the work, rather than the content, defines a job as skilled and unskilled.

As this typical line of argumentation from the side of the employers shows, education is required because it is equated with the ability to supervise others. Following this rationality it is thus not astonishing that most of the male supervisors have no experience as operators, since this skill is not the precondition. But apparently half of the interviewed female workers went up to class 10 and one fifth even have an M.A. or B.A., i.e. a quite solid education level and should therefore, following the logic of the employers, be well equipped for the better graded positions inside the factories. Nevertheless the interviews reveal that the majority of these women work as operators as do the other women without an educational background. Female factory workers in the export oriented factories are better educated than women on average in most countries in the South. This trend, which can be found in Bangladesh as well, nevertheless is very contradictory. None of the educated women in my sample had been eager to work in a garment factory, on the contrary the job was taken because of the lack of opportunities on the labor market. Nonetheless only a small proportion of the educated women was found in higher positions within the factories’ job hierarchies, for example as qualities checkers or supervisors. This finding supports again the argument already made that gender and not education or skill defines a woman’s place within the factories, the jobs available for them and thus their salaries.

The different educational levels of the workers within the factories definitely have some positive aspects for the employers. The most important one is the social stratification which is reconstructed within the factories. The educated women do not mix with others even though they perform the same tasks, which has a negative impact on solidarity and organization building. Furthermore the owners benefit in so far as the educated women seem to integrate more easily and have fewer problems with the work processes, since they were eager to find some kind of employment and in contrast to the uneducated women who, in the majority of cases had to work due to the economic situation of their families, decided by themselves to seek wage-employment.

Women remain subordinated in the work-place as well as in the labor market despite their increasing education and skill levels. A systematic over-valuation of male attributes and a corresponding under-valuation of female ones, independent of education and skill, characterizes the gender division of labor within the factories studied accompanied by the construction of an uneducated female labor
force with certain ‘natural’ abilities.

Mobility

The high turnover rates of the female workers is an important finding of this study and needs to be analyzed in more detail, since it provides insights into the different logics of action of the different actors involved. Mobility is, according to the literature, necessary at the beginning of the working lives of people so as to try out jobs and learn about the market and their own skills, but “persistent turnover denoting little investments in specific capital” (Mincer and Jovanovic 1981, 38). The low mobility of women and thus the lower amount of work experiences of women relative to men has traditionally been cited as an important reason for their lower earnings in lower job segments (Blau and Ferber 1986, 75). The mobility of the workers is very high especially in the garment sector, thus cannot be the reason for the lower earnings. Furthermore the high turnovers are perceived by the workers as a strategy to improve skill and thus a specific capital. Therefore the women interviewed changed factories on average 4 times giving a working life of generally 5 years by the time the interviews were conducted. In Malaysia on the contrary the women workers stay normally in one factory due to the arrangement between the owners, the recruitment agencies and the workers. This shows that arguments, which are based on the individual behavior or characteristics of the female workers, cannot be generalized to explain certain labor market behavior like “job hopping”.

The work histories show that economic as well as non-economic reasons are responsible for changing the factories. Social interactions and relations, which developed between employers and workers as well as between the workers themselves, are the main reason for the frequent change of the workplaces rather than individual decisions. The social construction of careers and the embeddedness of economic behavior characterizes the strategies of the female agents.

“One’s mobility depends on that of others”, as Granovetter (1992, 240) argues, is one important aspect to characterize the mobility of the workers. That does not mean that the mobility histories can be reduced to the behavior of others but is as important as the expected better opportunities in another factory. Often decisions are influenced by more experienced workers because “they know better”, means decision are closely related to the evaluations of older colleagues. Some workers changed the workplace not because they faced problems in the factory they worked in or because of better opportunities in another factory but to join a friend who decided to move. The social relations and friendships which developed at the workplace often replaced family or kinship ties. For quite a number of women these new relations became more important than “older” ones outside the factory.
and led to changes of the workplaces that cannot be explained by economic reasons. Interestingly it can be observed that the female workers build up new ties and friendships very quickly. One reason was due to the high mobility of the workers. Within a relatively short time frame of some months ties developed which often became very useful later in the career. Especially the relations between the former operator and the helper often lasted even though the helper normally changed the workplace after some months to start as an operator as well. Several women still have close contact to the “teacher”, whom they trust and ask for help if they face problems in their career. In some cases the “older” woman informs her former helper so she can join her when she changes to work together again. The older operators often take over the role of an older sister in the new environment. These examples show that the assumption made in most economic models that individuals are autonomous rational agents trying to improve their individual welfare or making choices on the basis of profit maximizing, as the rational choice models assumes, does not hold. Nevertheless that does not mean that the decisions and choices of the women are not rational but these rationalities are different from those underlying classical economic assumptions.

Information networks about different factories, the working conditions there and the behavior of the management were widespread inside and beyond the factories. Not in all cases did the networks within the factories or the mobility of co-workers influence the change of the workplaces; furthermore networks between neighbors who may be garment workers as well but not co-workers in the same factory were significant. These outside connections can be as important as inside networks, depending much more on the living situation and the contacts built up there than on the workplace relations. The fact that most of the workers live in settlements which consist to a high percentage of garment workers support these kinds of networks and the mutual support is not limited to mutual help in the daily organization of the household tasks or borrowing money in times of crisis but is often a precondition for recruitment and possible changes of the factories. The female workers do not distinguish between the life-worlds in and outside the factories, both are closely connected, often overlapping and intermingled. The networks and social relations also influence women to stay in a factory even though salaries are not paid or overtime money is due.

The rationality of the female workers in job interviews is another aspect to be analyzed. Most of the interviewed workers strategically plan job interviews in advance since the workers know already what the supervisors or manager in charge of the recruitment would ask. That meant that they learnt to count in English, because that is nearly always expected and they decided beforehand already how high they will set the last salary when asked. (It has to be mentioned that all salaries are negotiated individually which can be interpreted as a divide and rule strategy chosen by the management about
possible collective actions.) All workers exaggerated when asked for their last income. Even though the supervisors or managers in charge of recruitment are well aware of this strategy, according to the interviews, both sides normally felt satisfied after negotiations. The women workers because they could increase their incomes and the management because the compromise was in most of the cases still under the minimum wage fixed by the government. Nevertheless the women gained self-confidence when they felt that their strategy was successful. It should be kept in mind that the majority of workers got their first job through the help of a relative or neighbor, whereas the second job was in most of the cases organized by the women themselves or with the help of the new relationships built up inside or outside the factory. To enter a factory and face a situation like an interview and be personally responsible for the possible outcome was a challenge the women had never gone through before. Therefore even though the salary negotiated was, in most of the cases, still under the wage which the management is supposed to pay according the Labor Law, the immaterial outcome for the women workers, the gain in self-confidence in bargaining through the moves to other factories, was often more important at least for the time being.

These examples show the social context in which employers and workers develop expectations about one another’s behavior, as Granovetter (1992, 244) points out. The two actors in this interface situation do not meet as strangers, relying just on institutional arrangements to determine incentives, but have information about each other and certain reactions beforehand from friends and colleagues. Both use this information in interview situations. Since the wages in the factory are a result of the negotiation processes and not fixed beforehand by the management for certain groups, like for example junior operators, the changes of workplaces are nearly the only way for the workers to improve their incomes. They will not automatically reach a different wage group after working in the same factory for a certain amount of time, one reason for the high mobility of the workers. Thus as the biographical interviews reveal, the women learn very quickly to cope with and use these structures in their own interest, in this case the change of the factory.

The high mobility of the workers is not as seen a result of their “instability and their lack of interest in the job” as one manager put it nor “their tendency to leave whenever a family problem occurs”, but closely related to the organization of the labor market and the structures within the factories the women have to cope with. The working conditions as well as the low wages which are often not paid at all force women to develop and create strategies to survive within this environment. Mobility can be defined as a strategy developed and implemented to extend their room for manoeuvre and thus improve their working and living situation.
Promotion

Not only the concentration of women in low paid jobs is an indicator for the segmentation of labor markets but the lack of promotion prospects is as well. The jobs in the garment factories are dead-end jobs with few opportunities for on-the-job training and promotion (Blau and Ferber 1986, 278). Often the low mobility of women in particular is analyzed in structural approaches as another reason why their chances of promotion are lower than those of men. But the mobility of women in the garment sector is high and thus their experience increases which should make it more likely to get promoted. Nevertheless the promotion prospects of the female workers stop when they become a senior operator because no further career possibilities exist and thus no upward mobility. Within half a year the women normally learn how to operate a machine, change their factory and start working as a junior operator. After some years of experience the next attainable step is that of a senior operator. None of the women interviewed went through all these different positions in one factory. Promotion is always linked to the change of workplace.

When the women workers have reached the position of a senior operator, promotion is defined by the workers as an increase of salary and not a higher position within the occupational setting. Astonishingly becoming a supervisor was not perceived as a future perspective by the majority of the workers interviewed. They gave among their reasons their lack of education, their lack of experience and their lack of social relations with the management level. The women implicitly stressed an argument often highlighted in the literature (see Granovetter 1992, 249f.; Joekes 1987, 18) - that promotion is personal as well as ethnic or gender based. "My possibility of getting promoted is very low, perhaps one out of thousand. Men get promoted very easily although most of the workers are women and we are all experienced but that does not count" (Sabina, No. 27C).

Despite these arguments several women did not express any desire to be promoted to a higher position after they have reached the position of a senior operator. Several arguments were given. The fear that the necessary respect from the other female workers or the management cannot be obtained was pointed out as well as the fear becoming an object of envy on the part of the other women. Furthermore it was highlighted that a possible promotion would have negative consequences in the everyday interactions with the former co-workers.

These arguments reveal anew how personal relations and interactions influence the behavior and the ambitions of the women workers. Not individual income maximization is the basis and the main motive but being part of a “we-group” built up inside the factory. The reasons given indicate that the
women worker have built up an occupational identity as operators which distinguish them from the others, mainly the male staff in the factories. Identity is here used not in a psychological sense but as social identity and is related to certain characteristics, in this case the position within the social and occupational hierarchy of the factory, for distinction processes. Furthermore most interviewed women do not want to leave the female spaces created within the boundaries of the factories. These spaces created through the new work patterns of women very often become the primary social comfort of women replacing family or household. The biographical interviews show that women do not want to leave these spaces, a result of the gender segmentation within the factories, even though they could improve their position within the hierarchy of the respective factory (see Ong 1987, 160; Dannecker 2000). Promotion is therefore an option the women do not necessarily follow up or fight for. Being part of the group of the operators for instance offers other benefits which are not as easy to measure such as for example a higher position and thus a higher salary. Security and social acceptance were mentioned as well as mutual support in times of crisis.

The examples given above show that the distinctions among jobs along gender categories, are not only artificially created but often reinforced by the women themselves to create and keep female spaces. Thus promotion is not perceived as desirable by all female workers which shows the embeddedness of promotion judgments and action in social structures. Nevertheless these structures are gendered and thus difficult to renegotiate.

Conclusion

The migration of production sites as part of the global restructuring lead in countries like Bangladesh not only to the development of a new occupational sector for women but furthermore to the construction of a “typical” female activity, which did not exist before. The fact that this activity is defined as unqualified reveals that not the content of the work is important but the sex of those who perform this activity.

Nevertheless this does not mean that the women are pure victims of this “transnational” gender order which developed around this kind of employment. All too often studies were focussing on the exploitation of the workers, which no doubt exists, ignoring that the female workers are active agents. Embeddedness in these studies meant first of all the transfer of patriarchal structures into the global factories. Pearson expressed her intention concerning her earlier studies as following: “Our eagerness to examine the processes which connect the ‘modern’ experience of industrial employment with ‘traditional’ modes of gender control allowed us to to posit for heuristic purposes an uncontested und
undifferentiated notion of traditional gender identities and controls, and an experience of interaction which was structurally determined by capital and patriarchy rather than open to negotiation and reconstitution by women workers themselves." (1998, 180). The gendered structure of the economy but also the embeddedness of labor market decisions by the workers were not reflected or taken into account in these approaches. As I tried to show the workers are active agents on the labor market. The mobility of the workers and their networks for example are often more important then promotion. Their rationalities are difficult to explain in pure economic terms thus not taken into consideration in most of the economic models (Lachenmann 1997). But only if we understand the contextualized actions of the workers and their rationalities we understand the gender specific embeddedness of economic and global processes.

References

Blau, Francine; Marianne Ferber 1986: The Economics of Women, Men, and Work, Engelwood Cliffs: Prentice Hall
Brinton, Mary 1993: Women and the Economic Miracle, Berkeley: University of California Press
Wichterich, Christa 1998: Die globalisierte Frau, Hamburg: Rowohlt Verlag
Czarina Saloma
Ph.D. student, Sociology of Development Research Center, Bielefeld University, P.O. Box 10 01 31, D-33501 Bielefeld, Germany and faculty member, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Ateneo de Manila University, P.O. Box 154, 0917 Manila, Philippines. E-mail: czarina.saloma@uni-bielefeld.de

Abstract
As the topic of the ‘new economy’ grows in importance, it becomes necessary to discuss some very basic issues. One issue is the ‘gendered embeddedness’ of such economies. Following an approach which is being elaborated at Bielefeld University, the analysis of the ‘social embeddedness of the economy’ from the gender perspective shifts the focus from a feminist economists’ concern with equality and efficiency to a more contextualized examination of women’s activities and the gendered structuration of (new) economic fields.

I present the information technology industry in the Philippines as an arena of the new economy, and as the site of the interfaces of global-local, social-technical, and masculine-feminine spheres. Contrary to expectations, this arena is not purely a ‘dependent’ ‘assembly’ sector, and typical ‘female’ jobs such as assembly and data processing coexist with other types of knowledge utilization. My aim is to treat asymmetric gender structures (e.g., prevalence of male-spaces in certain information technology occupations) not as problematic but rather as manifestations of the social organization and segregation within the Philippine information technology arena according to criteria that not only include gender per se, but also its interaction with other social categories.

Two sources form the basis of my research interest in the doing of information technology in a developing country such as the Philippines: a future-oriented government plan and an empirically oriented body of research literature. In 1997, the Philippine government came up with IT 21 or The National Information Technology Plan for the 21st Century. This document presents the vision and the broad strategy to make the Philippines a knowledge center in Asia,

"a leader in IT education, in IT-assisted training, and in the application of information and knowledge to business, professional services and the arts" (NITP 1997: 5).

Yet, the literature on technological development in developing countries notes that among the three principal stages in the IT production process, namely, design, fabrication, and assembly, the first two processes normally take place in the IT company's 'mother' country, and require scientific, technical and engineering labor. Fabricated products are then sent to assembly plants in developing countries where they are assembled into final products. The finished products are sent back to their major markets (Webster 1996: 86).

Given these considerations, the question about how information technology is being done in a developing country is inevitably about rethinking dependency. Dependency, in the sense of a limiting condition that is detrimental to the long-term economic and political interests of a group or reliance on inputs from advanced industrial countries, is manifested in the global division of technological labor. There are two points about this global division of technological labor. One, that it retains some of the features of the international division of labor that emerged in the 1970s, and two, that it is a sexual division of labor. The international division of labor refers to the specialization of particular countries in distinct areas of production whether in certain products or in selected parts of the production process. Fröbel, Heinrich and Kreye (1980) described it as 'new' on account of how the industrialization of selected developing countries in the 1970s, characterized by the transfer of a significant portion of low-skill industrial activity to these countries, has resulted in the creation of a new working class (mostly women) who worked for lower wages and in inferior conditions. The sexual division of labor, on the other hand, refers to the allocation of tasks throughout society on the basis of sex. In this paper, I give attention to social relationships based on perceived differences between the sexes, that is, gender relations. I agree with Webster that women are not entirely marginalized from the process of IT creation, but because this conclusion was drawn out in the context of women who "occupy a very particular and restricted set of roles" (Webster 1996: 85) in companies located in southeast Asian, Chinese, Indian and Latin American free-trade zones, there is a need to temporarily and spatially widen the empirical areas of inquiry. Thus, this paper examines the new forms and organization of IT activities in an urban center of a developing country.

As an alternative to concepts of dependency, I use the notion of 'social interface' or the "point of intersection or linkage between different social systems, fields or levels of social order where structural discontinuities, based upon differences of normative value and social interests, are likely to
be found" (Long 1989: 2). The interface involves encounters of different actors and different social situations and manifest themselves in negotiations, exchanges, and strategies (Arce and Long 1992: 214, Long 1992: 6, Lachenmann 1995: 24ff). One interface situation is embodied in the concept of ‘glocalization’ or global localization which refers to the adaptation of goods and services that are operating in the global level to local and specific conditions (Robertson 1995: 28). The coupling of the global division of technological labor and the gender division of technological labor makes it necessary to extend the concept of glocalization to include interfaces between the social and the technical, as well as the feminine and the masculine. In these interfaces, actors create spaces that bear on “social forms and commitments that shape future possibilities for action” (Long 1992: 9); therefore such spaces are sites of changes.

Thus, while there are empirical evidences that in offshore subsidiaries, women dominate the data entry and/or semi-skilled assembly workforce (Webster 1996:83), changes in the work organization in some of these companies are at the same time noted. Software engineering, for example, has been carried out by women in India and other parts of Southeast Asia (Cast 1995, in Webster 1996: 83), and in the Philippines. Japanese companies have been doing contracts for hardware design, including microprocessors.

**Socially embedded new economy**

How are interfaces and spaces structured within the new economy? I shall suggest an answer to this question by employing two concepts. One is Granovetter’s concept of the ‘social embeddedness of the economy’, and the other is ‘gendered embeddedness’ an approach that is being elaborated at Bielefeld University (see, for example, Lachenmann 1999). The social embeddedness approach brings my inquiry in parallel terms with the sociological critique of the view in classical and neo-classical economics of rational behavior that is affected minimally by social relations. In relation to technology, this view in economics--- what is called an undersocialized account of actors--- is manifested in ‘technological determinism’. The concept of ‘technological determinism’ has one of its central elements the view that “technology impinges on society from outside of society” (MacKenzie and Wajcman 1985: 4). Such view of technology as having a logic of its own and as impervious to human interventions is moreover cultivated by social studies that focus on the 'effects' of technology.

In opposition to what can be called an undersocialized account of actors vis-a-vis economics and technology, there is a tendency, no less faulty, to subscribe to the oversocialized account of an actor
where behavioral patterns have been internalized so that ongoing social relations have minimal effects on behavior. Granovetter resolving the extremes of the two conceptions points out that both share a common view of action and decision as being carried out by atomized actors. He subsequently argues that

"[a]ctors do not behave or decide as atoms outside a social context, nor do they adhere slavishly to a script written for them by the particular intersection of social categories that they happen to occupy. Their attempts at purposive action are instead embedded in concrete ongoing systems of social relations" (Granovetter 1985: 487).

Granovetter (1985: 490) distinguishes between ‘relational’ embeddedness which refers to the dynamics and norms of one’s personal relations with one another, and ‘structural’ embeddedness which corresponds to the broader networks of social relations which are affected by the ripple effect of an economic transaction. Barber (1995: 388), arguing that other embedding contexts have been analytically left out of Granovetter’s concept of ‘networks of interpersonal relations’, writes about the importance of larger social systems such as kinship, stratification, knowledge, religious, and government institutions.

The second concept is ‘gendered embeddedness of the economy’, which aims to analyze the ‘social embeddedness of the economy’ from the gender perspective. This approach looks at the contexts of women’s activities and the gendered structuration of economic fields, and offers a correction to the tendency and the deficiency of the use of ‘gender’ in development theory only in the sense of excluded, poverty-stricken and vulnerable groups (Lachenmann 1999: 1). As a way of looking at multi-layered interactions of women’s economy with reproductive, subsistence, informal and formal economies, Lachenmann (1998: 298) suggests the concept of ‘women’s economy’ whose crucial characteristic is the interaction and complementarity of women’s employment to their life-worlds. My aim is to treat the asymmetric gender structures as manifestations of the social organization, networks and segregation within the Philippine information technology industry according to criteria that includes, but not exclusively, gender.

A map of the new economy

My research interest in the doing of IT span questions about types and arenas of knowledge and practices which in turn is related to the question of who is doing what and why in the new economy.
Borrowing from Schutz and Luckmann (1973), who elaborated on the difference between the 'layman', the 'well-informed', and the 'specialist', I refer to the different activities and the structure of social roles within the IT arena as the 'social distribution of knowledge'. Inherent in the use of the concept are two assumptions: one, that the IT arena is inhabited by a variety of knowledge forms and actors, and two, that knowledge is expressed in the realm of practices.

Information technology, the key enabling technology of the new economy, generally applies to the electronic exchange and management of data, and has three components. These are hardware (the computer system), software (the programs that control and coordinate the computer system), and networking (the connectivity of computers). In the 1960s this arena was called 'computer technology', comprised mainly of data processing and 'Büroindustrie', but with the merging of telecommunications and computers in the 1980s, it became 'information and communications technology'. The arena keeps on growing by the day. At CeBIT 2001, Deutsche Telekom, for example, identified along with telecommunications and information technology, multi-media entertainment and security as key technologies.

Since technology includes not only the artifacts but the physical and mental know-how to make use of these artifacts, the definition of information technology necessarily includes the occupational map and the arenas of IT activities. One way of presenting the occupational map is to divide the terrain into information and communication technology (ICT), e-business, and calls-center professions. Information and communication technology professions include those who are engaged in the development, design, implementation and maintenance of ICT systems: systems administrators, IT consultants, hardware and software programmers and designers. E-business professions include those which uses the Internet as the central element of work, while calls center experts use the telephone as main instrument of work. A presentation of the occupational map in this form creates the impression that the IT arena relies exclusively on the Commission of Higher Education and Technical Education (CHED)---which regulates programs for university and college levels---to supply its workforce.

Another presentation of the occupational map would be to show the supply chain of IT workers as a division of labor between CHED and the Technical Skills Development Authority (TESDA), which develops regulations for training programs for so-called middle-level workforce (e.g., short-term programs that develop data encoder, computer programmer, computer technician and network technician). In this map, the occupations are structured in three groups: programming development, customer support group and data encoding group. The hierarchy in the 'programming development group' starts with the TESDA-supplied programmer and is filled up by the CHED-supplied systems.
analyst and project manager. The most basic tasks in the customer support group are performed by TESDA’s computer technician and network technician; its ladder progresses with CHED’s supply of systems engineer, network engineer, database administrator, systems administrator, network administrator, and project manager. The last group, the data encoding group, appears to be the domain of TESDA which supplies the group’s data encoders and its variants, the data control clerk and the lead encoder. The data entry supervisor might eventually be supplied by CHED programs.

Furthermore, the information and communication technology arena can also be mapped out according to the industries where they are pursued:

a) manufacturing (e.g., publishing, printing, and reproduction of recording media, manufacture of machinery and equipment, electrical apparatus, radio, TV and communication equipment and apparatus, medical, precision and optical instruments, watches and clocks),

b) wholesale and retail trade (e.g., wholesale of household goods, machinery, equipment, and supplies, retail trade of goods in specialized stores, retail trade via mail/telephone, repair of personal and household goods),

c) transport, storage and communications (e.g., telecommunications including transmission of sound, images or other information via cables, broadcasting, relay or satellite),

d) real estate renting and business accounting (e.g., renting of personal household goods, machinery and equipment, hardware and software consultancy, data processing and conversion services, database activities, maintenance and repair of office, accounting and computing machines, research and development),

e) education (private technical and vocational post secondary non-degree education, private higher education), and

f) other community, social and personal services (e.g., motion picture and video production and distribution including production in a motion picture studio or in special laboratories for animated

---

8 The information technology industry has existed for more than three decades in the Philippines, but the move to classify it as a separate industry in the Philippine Standard Industrial Classification (PSIC) System started only last year. This was initiated by the Philippine Computer Society and the National Statistics Office.
films or cartoons, news agency activities, library, archives, museums and other cultural activities). The manufacture of radio, TV and communication equipment and apparatus has the highest mean employment (total employment/number of establishments) with 448 persons, while hardware/software development and consultancy, data processing, database management and R&D establishments—are areas where I did most of my biographic interviews and direct observations—has an average employment size of 25 persons (1997 Annual Survey of Establishments, National Statistics Office).

Considering that the majority of the actors in the information technology arena in the Philippines are in the manufacturing sector, I will use the activities of an electronics manufacturer as an entry point to the examination of the social distribution of knowledge in the new economy.

Electronics industry revisited

I asked the owner of an electronics manufacturing company which runs research and development activities on leading edge technologies (which it identified as technologies related to electronics, communications, and the environment) about how he chooses areas to go into. His account displays one theme that will be repeated all throughout this paper: the new economy does not mean a displacement but rather a diversification of old forms of practices:

This was four years ago. Telecommunications was growing, we had a lot of workers, but we had to compete against China. Therefore, we have to have the technology, and all these factors came in. We decided to get into fiber optics so I looked around. Companies were making cables with specific length, but if it is not a standard line, it will take two-three months to get an order. We went to a company that makes fiber optic cables, and told them we want to get into specialized cables. In fiber optic cables, there are two connectors, one at each end and that was to be done manually. So what are we looking at is that women will be working on that, it is hand-made, and there is a market...The women are factors because they more flexible. So that's why there is an age requirement, ages 18-23. After 23, the performance deteriorates.

These figures correspond to existing industries where ICT and ICT-related activities are to be found. The second biggest industry is the manufacture of medical, precision and optical instruments, watches and clocks whose establishments employ, on the average, 379 persons. The next highest mean employment figures are found in private higher education establishments (108 persons), telecommunications establishments (60 persons), and research and development (52 persons).
(Julius, 01/09/2000)

The same facilities and workers who had produced parts for TV sets, had also produced connectors for fiber optic cables, and electronic ballasts for solarium lamps and microwave ovens. Julius’s account points to a fact that is rarely considered in any discussion of rates of technological change (Schwartz Cowan 1985: 53): the conversion to another technology (e.g., fiber optics) is accelerated by the availability of female workers.

First, the forms of work in the 1970s, described as monotonous and one that required little training, as well as the multi-skilled assembly work in the 1980s, have remained to exist in the new economy. Braverman (1974) introduces the concept of ‘de-skilling’ to describe the fragmentation of work in the 1970s into smaller, simpler and unskilled tasks and the consequent displacement of skilled labor by unskilled labor, chiefly women and untrained young people. Several studies either confirm and challenge the de-skilling thesis. In the 1980s studies point out that while some women may have lost jobs as certain skilled occupations disappeared, others experience skills upgrading. Women who have been de-skilled of their former skills of nimbleness and dexterity have acquired new skills such as reasoning, problem-solving, simple machinery repair, and statistical process control.

Second, these women continue to perform the ‘invisible’ activities (e.g., from the assembly of a TV component to the assembly of fiber optics cables) that service the strategic sectors that have evolved from supporting the earlier forms of the electronic media society to a networked society.

Third, although less-known, there is an innovative aspect to assembly work in the Philippines. In most studies of the electronic manufacturing/semi-conductor industry, the research question has been framed by dependent assembly technology (e.g., where the definition and design of components are being done in developed countries). Although dependent relations have indeed remained, I would like to draw attention to what is in-between specialized technology (e.g., the design of the microwave oven) and assembly (e.g., producing the microwave in Chinese factories). There lies assembly work that is preceded by R&D. Julius tells about a product (an electronic ballast) which he presented at a fair in Hanover in 1998. There, he was asked by a major producer of microwave ovens to come up with an application of the electronic ballast that would significantly lower the cost of the power supply of microwave ovens. What is the reason behind the business offer? While there a number of design companies in Europe, these companies are usually fully-booked and the waiting time for a client to be taken in is usually three months. Moreover bringing out a product means looking at the ‘manufacture ability’, or the ability to run a prototype. This means producing, for example, a thousand
pieces to test if the products will be viable. The question, according to Julius, would be to find a factory that will stop it operations to make 1,000 prototypes or one that will stop its operations after producing 1,000,000 pieces because on market reasons.

As subcontractors, manufacturing companies like Julius’s have production spaces in between contracts, and this was not lost to the purchasing manager of microwave company who said: ‘You have the facilities there, the engineers there. We don’t have to train the engineers, and you are a lower-cost country. You are telling me that in eight months, we can test this up to the productivity level. And you are telling me that you can train our Chinese managers in the Philippines.’

Julius did the R&D for adapting the electronic ballast to a new application (e.g., the microwave oven), without getting R&D funds from the microwave oven company. Taking as an example a similar contract for another application of the electronic ballast for solarium lamps, he explains:

It cannot be the case that the American company will give us the money. Suppose someone comes up with a better idea? Which is why the patent is so important. Anyway, we did not charge them. We are very liberal. Remember, this is our first time in the international market. We develop a product and it is a niche product. And besides, we have to move back a little because they are world’s biggest maker of ultraviolet lamps. If we get that market, it is already OK. It is not a good idea to say, OK, give us start-up research funds of 10,000 dollars. They might be turned off. So it is the normal way. First of all, we don’t have a track record. This is our first design. If we had a track record, it would have been better.

(Julius, 25/08/2000)

The ‘Middle Group’

Continuities and changes have not only emerged in the electronics industry. They are also observable in arenas of the new economy which are highly linked to a new form of the global division of technological labor. This division of technological labor involves three distinct groups: a group that produces ‘elite’ or cutting-edge information, knowledge or technology, a group that consumes what the elite group produces, and a group that consumes the stuff that the elite group produces, processes it and re-purpose it for the great consuming majority. This group mediates the activities between the elite and the consuming groups, hence I refer to it as the ‘middle group’.
In a framework for exploring disjunctures of the global cultural economy, Appadurai (1996: 34) introduces the concept ‘technoscape’ to mean the fluid, global configuration of technology, both high and low, both mechanical and informational, and how the distribution of technologies is being driven, among others, by the increasingly complex relationships among money flows, political possibilities and availability of both un- and highly skilled labor. In the present technoscape, one must recognize that in-between unskilled and highly skilled labor are varied intersections of knowledge systems and practices. I will now look at the sites and causes of the emergence of the ‘middle group’.

A. User-friendly Technologies

Connie, who was among the first group of computer professionals recruited by NCR Corporation in the Philippines in 1966, narrates the changes in the arena of information technology:

During my time, it was the mainframe and towards the later stage, the mini computers, then the micro computers. In terms of the mainframe, in terms of education and training, the people who were involved in these really got to have intensive training. And then, unlike now where the computers are very user-friendly, there were no user-friendly computers before. You had to understand the intricacies of the computer inside and out. You had to know the internal workings. You had to be able to visualize how the computer is working inside, because programming was dependent on that. Unlike now, when you say user-friendly, you are just taught to press a few buttons. There are software programs and you can go. You don’t have to understand what’s happening inside. You don’t have to know the software. In the 60s, no software was ready-made. We had to develop everything. That meant people were more careful with details, with logic. It was not supposed to be for everyone. Like you got a flair for it, some skills, like an eye for details, like if you put a comma instead of a period, everything goes berserk. (laughs). Unlike now, they give so much room for error. (Connie, 22/06/2000)

These changes correspond to the diversification of the activities and technologies of the ‘middle group’, suggesting that not all activities related to information technology have to be as complex as those attendant to the mainframes and mini-computers. Moreover, as Tijdsens (1994 in Webster 1996: 6) suggests, the move from monolithic mainframe to smaller computers imply the breaking of strangleholds of selected individuals over computing facilities, and an increasing ability by end-users to use their own systems in their own ways. Connie later left NCR to establish a computer learning center...
for one of the universities in Manila in the late seventies which offered short computer courses such as introduction to computers, COBOL, Fortran, and Pascal programming and use of Lotus software. She describes how the reduction in size of technologies, accompanied by a reduction in costs, also resulted in more people having access to these technologies:

I could not have done what I did in Ateneo if it were not for the advent of the microcomputers. Because the mainframe, the first and the second generations of computers were just too expensive. So that’s one consideration, you cannot bring it to the academe. Therefore you cannot bring it to lot of people. Just like with any electronic device, after a while, they become cheaper. Like the mobile phones. In the beginning they were as big as radios. Now they are becoming smaller and cheaper. So that with the advent of micro computers, more people would have access to it and use it as a tool.

B. Hybrid arenas

I proceeded to ask Connie whether the pioneers of IT in the Philippines differ from the current group of IT professionals:

I was telling you that almost all of the people in our group from IBM and NCR were what you would consider well-rounded people. They were technically competent, they had sales and marketing skills, had teaching skills. Our salesmen for example, and our incoming technical guys would follow the same training path. That is one year. After this one year, the technical and the field people would undergo selling skills and customer services training. So you can imagine, they have people skills, other than the technical.

(Connie, 22/06/2000)

The ‘middle group’ does not only benefit from ‘user-friendly technologies’. The group also traffic in some arenas in the new economy such as e-business and call-center arenas which are characterized by the amalgamation of disciplines—computer science, business and industrial management, communication arts, psychology, etc. As pointed out by Weingart and Stehr (2000: xii), interdisciplinarity and its hybrid character are essential in generating knowledge in order to solve problems or innovate, two of the supreme goals in the information technology industry. The ‘well-versed’ employees of NCR Corporation suggest that hybridity and interdisciplinarity are not recent in the IT industry. Since working with computers at that time required passing a computer aptitude test
and meant, pluralism of disciplines and skills meant absolutely 'no specification' or 'no preference' for any discipline. Caloy, sales director of a Philippine subsidiary of a Dutch software house which sells, supports and implements the mother company's software products in the Philippine market, tells how nowadays pluralism had come to mean 'disciplinary combinations':

...the hiring policy is that they should be familiar with the accounting process...In the office, we have people who have backgrounds in accountancy. My boss is a manufacturing engineer. In our case, you have to have an accounting background, or a manufacturing background, but not necessarily a computer science background. I almost did not get accepted for work because my background was computer science, so I had to revise my resume to make it appear that I have an accounting background. Which is true because I really took accounting courses.
(Caloy, 30/07/2000)

It is implied in my interviews with software people that computer skills are not the only, not even the main, determinant of one's life chances within this arena of the new economy. 'Technical', in the context of a company selling accounting software, is defined as familiarity with the hardware and computer network, and familiarity with the accounting processes (since every business and manufacturing transaction produces an accounting entry). The cumulative nature of knowledge and practices to be learned on the job requires familiarity with computers but not necessarily a degree in computer science. This implies that the new economy is not a homogenized arena of specific technical backgrounds, an important factor considering that CHED projections indicate that in 2000, those enrolled in IT courses were only quarter of the enrollment in maritime courses, and a seventh of those enrolled in commerce.

The second concept of hybridity is the interface between so-called IT skills and non-IT skills. There are tasks in the new economy that require more subject matter expertise than IT expertise. The pervasiveness of computers in everyday-life means that encoding have now been farmed out to users who key-in information into databases themselves. As a result, encoders are now almost gone from certain arenas (e.g., manufacturing). Nevertheless, specialized uses of encoders have emerged. Content processing (which includes the production, aggregation, distribution, syndication, administration, etc. of data) and meta-data services (which includes machine-understandable content description, cataloguing, classification and taxonomy) are some of the specialized uses which are anchored upon processes that are resistant to full automation. An abstractor must process a range of reading materials; for each article, he or she must write the main ideas in an 'indicative', not 'descriptive' form (done by starting the entries
with verbs), and classify the main ideas according to pre-existing categories. Since taxonomy requires subject matter expertise and the ability to use word processors, 'encoding' has broadened from the sense of 'punching cards' to content processing where abstractors, for example, index literature for the Library of Congress. However, this does not imply that the 'punching-card' encoders have moved on to taxonomy work. Nor does it mean that the vocational-technical education system has stopped producing encoders in the sense of secretarial, office, and paper work. The data encoder vocational instructional program, for example, is a one-year post secondary program, designed to prepare students for employment as "data typist, data encoder operator, computer operator, terminal system operator and word processor operator" (TESDA 1999: 17).

A third aspect of hybridity is the interface between what is considered as art and what is considered as technical. A web designer comments:

Information technology is not purely technical anymore. Not like in the old days when computers will still difficult to use. Now, computers are no longer limited to computing numbers and statistics. Now it is art. A lot of web designs contain a lot of graphics and animations. If it is purely technical, you might have an excellent page, but in terms of aesthetics, it might not be good to look at. And there are people who make aesthetically excellent webpages, and when you look at the codes, they are simple. Now it is more on the impact of the design.

(Falx, web designer, 17/15/2000)

Technological know-how has been a basis of the capacity to command higher incomes and scarce jobs. However, in some arenas computerization causes a two-tiered de-skilling that is based on the ideological opposition between art (as creativity) and technology (as manual). First, this de-skilling is caused by the imperative to upgrade skills (e.g., learning a computer program) which resulted in a devaluation of the traditional notions of art. Second, because computer programs are designed to facilitate creativity, they simplify the process of creation. This leads to the second form of de-skilling: the simplification of the process of creation has the end-result of increasing productivity so that the worker, paid by the number of art frames he or she has drawn, feels he is producing more for less pay. These dynamics are illustrated in the following quote:

A friend who works at an advertising company told me: "I am no longer paid as an artist, I am now only being paid as a computer operator." Everything is being done on the computer. "You just open my computer, even if you are not an artist you can draw". He asked me what I
can call him: an artist or a computer operator. He was the one who feed the design but he said he is no longer paid as an artist. The demanding power for a higher salary is gone. You cannot say, I am a good artist, pay me. I am a good accountant, pay me. Are you good when you don’t know how to use a computer?
(Rey, customer care supervisor of an internet service provider, 26/04/2000)

C. Horizontal knowledge structures

The professionals in ‘the middle-group’ do not only prosper in the nature of technologies or activities, they also profit in the mode in which knowledge and skills in certain arenas are learned. One recurrent response I was getting when asking IT professionals how they learned these technologies is that they are ‘self-taught’.

It is born out of a hobby. And curiosity led me to discover new things about computers. How it works, what does not work. On my first month with my own computer, I screwed it up every week and had to bring it to the shop every time. I asked them what is wrong with my computer and they’d because you did this and that. And I watched them fix it and took note. With web design, I took an existing webpage and copied the codes. The next thing I did was to see what if I change this, what if I delete this line, and see how it changed from the original page. I played with the codes and some programs have wizards and editors. So it is like filling up the blanks.
(Falx, web designer, 17/05/2000)

This however does not mean that some information technologies cannot be learned formally in structured settings of learning, (considering that in the school year 2000, the Commission on Higher Education projected the third largest number of enrollees to be in information technology courses), nor that learning it is a pure solitary pursuit.

Maybe it is not completely ‘self’. I work in the lab and someone would say, you look at these places, they will tell you how to do it. Sit in front of the computer and you say, this is cool, let me try this. Follow some tutorials online and when you got stuck, you go out and you talk to other fellow students. It’s really learning by doing. You have your other sources, other people or sources in the Internet. But it is not a formal learned thing, perhaps. You can certainly learn it formally but you don’t have to take the course.
There is no formula as to how one learns IT: some learned by ‘studying’ an existing webpage or doing online tutorials, some learned by taking jobs at a multinational company, still others learned by enrolling in short-term programming courses. But all answers exhibit similar patterns: at least some IT skills are learned by doing, and informally and this is facilitated by the availability of online information and online-user groups. Moreover, there is an emphasis on problem-solving, learning by doing, and just-in-time knowledge where instead of spending months in structured courses, people can use social networks and databases to answer questions and solve problems as they crop up.

The possibility of learning IT on one’s own means that it can be learned quite informally, but also implies having the desire and the persistence to learn, as well as access to the technology. Feminist writers (e.g., Cockburn, Wajcman) argued that technology is the privileged possession of certain social groups. In the light of horizontal and proactive structures for learning being created by information and communication technologies (Youngs 2000: 5-8), there has been widening access, not only to information and knowledge, but more importantly to the tools and know-how of information technologies which are fodder for the creation and maintenance of the ‘middle group’. As noted by Youngs (2000), horizontal and proactive structures of learning also have an empowering effect on social groups who have their own ways of dealing with technologies. Falx, who learned to create webpages by ‘playing’ with the codes of existing webpages is a social science student. Another source of this understanding is Nissen’s research experience of not being able to find a female hacker in the light of hacking being about mastery and control of technology (Nissen 1996: 241). Also, it seems that among my respondents, women are more likely to emphasize the social aspect of learning, while men are more likely to emphasize mastery in controlling technology. Considering findings of gender differentiation in the use of technology, the Internet has enabled groups such as women to use technologies in their own ways.

A map of the gendered new economy

Technology is gendered. Certain technologies such as textiles, food technology, and manual agriculture, are strongly associated with women while others such as hunting, mechanized agriculture, transport and weapons are equally strongly associated with men. Design and fabrication of IT products do not only take place mostly in developed countries; they are done mostly by men. Likewise, assembly is not only being done mostly in developing countries; they are done mostly by
women (Webster 1996: 86). My thesis is that the new economy, invariably described as an arena in which people work with their brains instead of their hands, not only supports the social embeddedness of economic activities as seen in the local manifestations of changes in the global division of technological labor but also the gendered embeddedness of economic activities as seen in the locations of men and women within the social distribution of knowledge.

Technology, it is argued, is an arena dominated by men. This is because it is an arena which puts much value on physical strength, where "many machines have been developed precisely to substitute for human physical strength" (Cockburn 1985: 56). With technology being historically and materially masculine, gendered locations also include 'female social spaces'. Thus, in contrast to studies (e.g., Dannecker 1998, Mirza 1999) which examine 'female spaces' in terms of women's proactive attempts to create separate spaces within purdah or gendered norms of segregation. I use 'female spaces' in the sense of 'hitherto male-spaces where women are found'. Working on Schutz's and Luckmann's (1973) formulation that the epistemological division of labor which structures society and social roles is also a source of the differentiation in sexual roles, I examine the social distribution of knowledge in the Philippine IT industry as a 'gender order' (Lachenmann 1999: 6). The concept of 'gender order' embodies a deeper understanding of the social distribution of knowledge as a gendered structure in terms of entitlements and the social matrix in which macro-economic processes are embedded. It acknowledges that gender means difference but that it is necessary to consider these difference as taking place at an interface (Lachenmann 1999: 6) of various factors: overall supply chain of IT professionals, nature of IT work, global capital and technological flows, changing attitudes, etc. The 'gender order' in the information technology arena can be examined in at least two ways. One, by looking at the 'gendered division of labor' which serves to allocate women to, and usually segregate them in particular occupational areas. Another, by examining 'gendered jobs' which serve to allocate women to tasks which carry the imprint of their socially-constructed roles in the family and in the workplace.

I will begin with the interface between the spaces in the new economy and the spaces in the Philippine social order which is expressed in the following quotation from an interview with Connie:

The more I travel, especially in Asia, the more I appreciated being a Filipina. Because here, it is mostly a case of corporate preferences. The only objection to women would be the

---

10 Webster mentions that IT companies in Europe which are concentrated in Scotland and Ireland also let women carry out semi- and unskilled production operations. However, these companies carry out complex product manufacture and on a batch production basis, unlike the assembly and mass production being in Southeast Asian off-shore companies. (Webster 1996: 87).
maternity leave which takes a long time. As far as I know that’s the main objection. But some companies don’t mind. If the person really exhibits a lot of skills, especially when you combine technical with people-skills, they will take you. Because when you are in sales, you’ve got to be good technically and you’ve got to have people-skills. And that is very difficult to find. And then shifting is also no longer an issue now. Because women are willing to work on the graveyard shift, unlike in the past where it was mostly men who did that.

In the Philippines, there is a perception of a gender-fair system that scholars say is imprinted in all indigenous languages which do not have sexual demarcations in the third person (Santiago 1995: 111). Moreover, the perception of the relatively high position of Filipino women in comparison to the women of many Asian countries appears to derive credence from the United Nations Human Development Report (1996), which shows the country as having a Gender Development Index (GDI) rank of 70 and a Gender Empowerment (GEM) rank of 39, only behind Japan and the People’s Republic of China (Illo 1997: xi).

I conducted direct observations in a company providing web solutions where I observed that there are more men and women and that there are women web designers and web applications associates but not women network engineers; in an internet service provider (ISP) company, where the technical support group has an equal number of male and female members; in a hardware and software design house where software engineers and hardware design engineers are mostly males and there is only one female (who was doing software design); in a semi-conductor company, where 90 percent of the workforce are direct laborers who are mostly females; and in a content processing company where there is almost an equal number of male and female abstractors.

This theoretical sample suggests that the structure of work in the IT industry is gendered in the sense that certain job categories remained associated with men, and in the sense that women are found in specific job categories. It is notable that one, there are more men in hardware development and web designing, and two, there is a more or less equal number of men and women in software development, content processing, and technical support services. There are no arenas where women are predominant in number.

I will now turn to two general questions: why women are likely to be in certain arenas of the new economy and why their presence has not resulted in the ‘feminization’ of such arenas not only in the sense of ‘transformation of jobs traditionally held by men’ (Standing 1989: 1079) but more in the sense of economic disadvantages to women.
Statistics show that the gender tracking \(^{11}\) at the tertiary level of education in the Philippines is one where more females than males get to secondary and tertiary school. Business education which includes commerce and accounting courses has the third highest ratio of female to male students, after education and health-related courses. Among female enrollees, it has the highest percentage. The emergence of a number of arenas which require business background, a ‘feminine’ track, and alternatively, arenas which do not specify ‘masculine’ backgrounds (e.g., engineering track) suggest that the gender bias that favors men not only in placement but in on-the-job training and promotion practices as well (Illo 1997: 24) is dissolving. Hybrid practices therefore prevent, to some extent, the gender tracking in education from structuring occupational arenas.

While there are more females than males enrolled in higher education courses, women enrollees are still a minority in vocational/technical courses in automotive, machine shop, electronics, refrigeration and air-conditioning, welding and electricity. In developing training regulations for information technology occupations, gender differences were not considered:

> We know that IT is a light work, especially data encoder and computer programming. There are many women who enroll in these courses. But this is also true in other industrial skills program. Like in automotive. I think women don’t like going under the car. It’s dirty work. But now women are encouraged to enroll in welding because we have had a champion woman welder. So we find women in heavy industries. When women want to do it, they will do it. We have designed the curriculum so that both men and women can do it (Gil, chief curriculum specialist TESDA, 09/06/2000)

Given the ‘masculine’ history of vocational/technical courses, the social perception of some IT courses as ‘light’, in the sense that they lead to occupations that have a strong semblance to feminine secretarial work, creates optimism that the choice of information technology courses will finally become ‘non-gendered’, e.g. available to both men and women. But this same set of social perceptions might also work to ensure that gender tracking in vocational/technical courses would remain. Unless women actively choose hitherto male-dominated IT courses, --- like the women who have created ‘female spaces’ within the ‘old’ industrial economy---- the entry of more women into information technology would only mean the ‘feminization’ of IT. This means that women are not only the minority in the information technology arena, but the majority in limited, less-socially valued IT occupations.
Hybrid practices and the shift away from gendered disciplinary orientations also explain why content processing is, contrary to expectations, not predominated by women. First, abstractors work through a variety of topics from general information to the natural sciences, to computers to the social sciences. The variety of topics, as well as the way in which materials to be abstracted are assigned (each abstractor gets a bundle of literature by lottery) give companies no reason to specify courses. In one morning, Jill, a fine arts graduate from one of the best universities in Manila, has read, summarized and categorized main ideas of articles as varied as “Try shooting from behind instead of in front” which was an article on how to create a more compelling photograph, and “Geochemical and Nd isotopic evidence…” which presented neodymium isotopes and geochemical data for basin-filled strata of the Devonian Cordillera. Nevertheless, arenas such as these are not completely free of the gendered division of labor: a closer look at the social division of knowledge within the company shows that one division is doing the contract for engineering literature. Most of the abstractors in the division have backgrounds in engineering.

Aside from preventing some of the gender tracking in schools from structuring the social distribution of knowledge in the IT arena, hybrid practices also prevent the gender tracking in the compensation structure. The literature documents ways in which the gender division of society has affected technological change through the different wages paid to women and men (MacKenzie and Wajcman 1985: 22). While there is no reason to dismiss these findings, the compensation structure in some arenas of the new economy present itself as a deterrent to the feminization of these arenas. In software companies, career progression follows the programming-implementation-sales-training track but this does not necessarily imply a hierarchical, ladder type of compensation structure.

This is illustrated by one applications software company. Software development is being done by a team comprised of a project manager, systems analysts, business analysts and programmers. The project manager meets with the clients and designates the tasks to the other members of the team. The systems analyst looks at the functions, how the systems design will look like, and how it will be done. Systems analysis pertains to the logical design of the program which includes the database, the relationships, and the appearance of the system. The business analyst looks at the client’s business procedures that are to be incorporated in the system. Aside from the logical design, a system also has a physical design which refers to the program itself. When the logical design is done, the programmers will then do the physical design. How does the compensation structure look like? In this company, programmers and analysts share the same salary scale and individuals get promoted within job

---

11 From selected statistics presented by Illo (1997: 19).
categories:

...although business consultants tend to earn more than systems analysts and than programmers, this is not an automatic staircase. Some people make great programmers but end up very mediocre analysts. There also is a premium for very technical designers and programmers at the other end. So we have a shallow U curve between business and technical orientation. Programmers, designers, systems analysts have computer science backgrounds, and normally get the same pay. The business analyst may be get a higher pay depending on whether this person has an MBA.

(Mano, president, software development house, e-mail, 06/12/2000)

The absence of a ladder-type structure, where a programmer does not have to become a systems analysts or vice versa in order to have a higher pay, is relevant in the light of prevailing observations among IT people that men are good programmers (e.g., working with the specifics), and that women are good systems analysts (e.g., working with ambiguous entities such as assessing what customers need). Gender tracking in such niches therefore need not result in feminization of the tasks.

Socially constructed knowledge, differences and practices

Women can be excluded from the traditional industrial-based (as opposed to new) technological arena for a variety of reasons, among them women’s lack of physical strength, and the threat that activities pose to women’s welfare. Alternatively, social perceptions can also include women into specific arenas. Mirza (1999: 146), examining the market integration of lower-middle class women into the office sector in Pakistan, notes that this integration has concentrated in technical occupations (e.g., architectural drafting, designing and computer related-occupations such as computer operators, hardware repairers) and secretarial occupations (e.g., secretaries, receptionists, telephone operators). According to her, technical occupations recruit women on the basis of their qualifications, while secretarial occupations recruit workers on the basis of beauty and outward appearance. In the Philippines, examples of recruitment according to societal perceptions of what is feminine and masculine work abound in the manufacturing and semi-conductor industries, e.g., women do most of the production processes since these require ‘nimble fingers’ while men do the packing since this activity involve moving heavy objects and tightly packing end-products.

Social constructions regarding ‘female spaces’ and the actual creation by actors of ‘female spaces’
are mutually implicative. I will now present an anecdote that was narrated to me by a male IT professional which shows some of the social constructions of the gender and technology relationship that emerged in the context of and in reaction to observable ‘female spaces’ in the new economy:

At the start, when we were hiring technicians we had to have males. Because they had to carry things. Somebody came to my office... and I was trying to avoid being sexist, this segregation of males and females. She passed the exam, although I was hoping that she would fail. So I told her, “do you realize that you have to move all these equipment, that you are going to get dirty because you are going to install cables, network.” She said, “sir, just give me a try.” “So do you know how to dismantle a machine?” “Yes, sir.” “Can you please clean that machine.”

She carried the PC! I had nothing to say. When I sent her to the customers, the customers were asking for her. They found out that it is easier to shout at a man than at a woman. So when a technician commits mistakes, you can just scold him. She was a plus factor for me because when we made mistakes, they magnified these mistakes. But it was done in by the woman’s charms... You are bound to make mistakes regardless of whether you are male or female. But if a girl handles it and the one who is repairing the machine is a girl, they are more patient. They would say, “I will help you there. Is there something you need?” They would say, “can you please let Josie come back to us?”.

(Titus, information technology consultant, 11/08/2000)

One reading of this anecdote is that within the new economy a utilitarian view of women’s ascribed skills still remains. However, the presence of and more importantly the everyday-encounters with women professionals have resulted in the re-calibration, to some extent, of the taken-for-granted assumption that technology is a man’s world. Such a reading brings into awareness that while the presence of women is facilitated by the miniaturization of technologies and the shifts in the paradigm norms of technology work from heavy, physical work to knowledge work, women have also actively created this presence by engaging in ‘male’ norms of technology work (e.g., ‘getting dirty’, ‘going under’). Thus, conclusions regarding user-friendliness of technologies must consider that “when a new technology is implemented, users don’t just have to be qualified and to ‘accept’ the innovation: they must change their own work routines and find their ways around problems and difficulties” (Holtgrewe 1996: 113). Women are not only acted upon by the conditions they find themselves in, they have contributed actively to the shaping of these conditions. Schutz and Luckmann (1973: 19) and Long (1992: 23) argued that ‘agency’ is about how an individual, in this case, a woman IT worker, being acted and enacted upon by actors around her or him, is able to attain his or her desired pragmatic concerns.
These few examples show that the distinction between ‘male’ and ‘female’ in some arenas of the new economy is dissolving. However, in some arenas of information technology, gender differences can be viewed as very useful. In some contexts, such as web designing, societal perception of feminine qualities are not phrased in utilitarian terms, but rather in terms of ‘epistemic privileges’ (in Sandra Harding’s sense) on so-called feminine tastes and preferences.

I want to have female programmers because our product is being developed by programmers. For whatever, I want to have everything. It is very important to know what visual work with women. A ‘true blue’ woman will really tell me what clicks with them. It is really hard to find women programmers. Gender composition is very important. Generational, too but mostly we have young people with us. More on the interface side of thing because I do not think that if you are female programmer, you will have a different art of programming. There is no such thing as male or female, but more on the interface, on what people see. Maybe, I don’t know, it could just be one interface that could work for a variety.
(Dcm, founder, free e-mail service provider, 10/04/2000)

Central here is ‘a true blue’ woman will really tell me what clicks with them’. Dom’s point of view acknowledges, in Harding’s (1992) terms, that one’s positioning as a woman is a factor in gaining knowledge and understanding of other women. But unlike Dom who believes that the creator’s social identities become expressed in artifacts, Kay believes that one ‘cannot judge a web designer by the web site he or she has done’. Company policies and procedures (e.g., ‘total client satisfaction’) ensure that outcomes (e.g., interface, what people see) were unstructured by gender:

There was this design, and the client thought it was K’s (a male designer). And because we follow the specifications of the company. But if it were a personal site, then you would see the traits of the designer. In these sites, we express what we want. When you don’t have to follow specifications. But I really do not have an intention to communicate that a girl does it. My site is simply my outlet for personal insights. But maybe, depending on the experience of the designer, it would be difficult to give your work gender. You are limited by your skills. But you can see that S’s work is done by a male. There are monsters.

CS: What about your way of doing things?

KF: No difference. We have the same procedures, the same approach. But if you see flowers
(shows a page done by a male friend), would you be able to say that this is done by a male? Not really. But this (opens a website). A bit crude because when you are not yet that good, this is how your site will appear. You are limited.
(conversation with Kay, 09/02/2000)

Both Dom and Kay concurred that there are no differences between female and the male know-how. The view that there are no significant essentialist differences in the way men and women do technology, and to some extent, in the end-products that they create, reflects the complexity of the gender and technology relation that is being referred to by Gill and Grint (1995: 12-14) as ‘dilemmas of ideology’. The dilemma is built around the prevalence of male actors, and male actors who act in terms of male interests. The first part of this dilemma is anchored upon the masculine nature of technologies being a result of the domination by men of the creation of technology. In this view, men create technologies on account of their own (male) interests, and implies that women would design different technologies. The dilemma comes to a full circle because the historical and cultural construction of technology as masculine means that the presence of more women designers has not and will not result to fundamental changes in the nature of technology.

Non-gendered practices

The nature of information technologies shows that while gender structures knowledge requirements, it is not the only criteria in the organization and segregation of the information technology industry in the Philippines. Following Lachenmann (1999: 4) who suggests an analysis of the social organization and segregation of markets and the social networks guiding them according to different criteria other than gender, I look at how the new economy is informed by the interaction between macro- and micro-processes. This approach is important in gaining entry into an arena that generally views gender relations as non-problematic:

In the IT that I handled, gender does not matter. Although, maybe. Initially the Internet was dominated by males or male-oriented. But I think it is more about utilization and access.
(Nina, 28/04/2000)

The president of a subsidiary of a German hardware and software design company narrates an incident while he was on training at the company’s headquarters in Germany: someone had asked a German woman worker for help but she had answered that it was not her job. When asked if
conclusions were to be made about the difference between Asian and Western women, he concludes that:

the typical reaction here (in the Philippines), not only of women but for all other employees would have been to sit down and help, even neglecting your own work.

(Yeng, 16/03/2000)

Feminist studies of information technologies highlight the culture of masculinity in the work process. Hayes (1984 in Webster 1996: 84) argues that there is a machismo about working individually without helping or cooperating with fellow programmers. However from Yeng’s point of view, this is not only about gender but is more about culture, where the Filipino culture is seen to more conducive to teamwork.

Some instances in the evaluation of skills are also structured according to criteria other than gender. Observers note that age is now a mediating factor in the reorganization of work, and this is irrespective of gender so that younger men and women replace older female and male workers. In certain arenas of the new economy however, I would like to point out that age is being considered as a factor but not in the sense of marginalizing one age group by another. The school director of a new computer college informs me that difference between the ‘other’ schools and his college lies in the structure of the faculty:

The faculty members in other schools are tied to the school and this means that they no longer have time to work for the industry. Fifty percent of our staff are composed of consultants, who eat and drink IT everyday. We also tap retirees who have 20-30 years of experience. You need their expertise in the upper courses on project management, systems analysis because the basics remain the same. This way, we teach our students to respect the older ones. Theories after all are related to experience.

(Jojo, 17/03/2000)

Age, rather than gender, was also seen as the major determinant in the Y2K brain drain in the Philippines:

That’s why there was a lot of brain drain for the Y2K. Because the Y2K bug needed our kind of expertise. Because you will work with the internal workings of the computer and the language is COBOL and very few young people know anything about COBOL.
But contrary to popular views, the bulk of Y2K jobs were done in the Philippines. Unlike software development which requires proximity to the user for the prototyping, the part of the program that contained the problematic two digits can be easily exported into the Philippines. Thus, while those who left the country for Y2K jobs in 1997 and 1998 are more likely to be people with considerable experience in the industry, the Y2K shortage was mostly a shortage of young graduates whose job was to search for the things to be modified in the program.

Final Remarks

In this paper, I examined the Philippine information technology industry as an arena of the new economy. The ‘social distribution of knowledge’ within the Philippines information technology arena shows activities and actors as being embedded in the interfaces of the global division of technological labor. As a result of these interfaces, certain forms and arrangements characteristic of assembly work persist to exist, but spaces have also been created as exemplified by the ‘middle group’, the group of IT workers who consume, process and re purposes the ‘elite’ technological stuff mostly coming from outside the country. Next, I pointed out that the social distribution of knowledge in the new economy is gendered, but that some arenas such as software development and consultancy and technical support services are more conducive to the creation of ‘female social spaces’ than others. Considering the masculine culture of technology, these ‘spaces’ are not separate female spaces, but rather spaces where women are, more or less, no longer the numerical minority. Likewise, I also noted that the relationship between female social spaces and gendered discourses are mutually implicative.

The interface approach allowed for the existence of ambiguity and contradictory scenarios. The creation of spaces within the social distribution of knowledge in the new economy are uneven. Some arenas and activities such as software development seems to be more conducive to the creation of such spaces. But even within these arenas, there is also uneven development so that while women are now found in the client support group, the sales group is still male-dominated. In certain tasks, there are also differences in perceptions. ‘Going outside’ is a male job in a software house, while it is a female job in web designing and even in hardware maintenance. For some, programming is a male job while systems analysis is a female job. The dichotomy is rooted in programming being viewed as technical, and in systems analysis being viewed as business oriented. Yet for others, programming is a domesticated job, a passive endeavor that is suited for women.
Likewise, by using an interface approach, I avoided the pitfall of technological determinism and showed how women workers, acting and being enacted upon, have contributed to the creation of spaces themselves. I am aware that my presentation of the broadening of spaces in the IT industry does not include facets of resistance and networking in the sense of reshaping and creating new room for maneuver that characterize reproduction and transformation of social discontinuities (Lachenmann 1997: 9). Dannecker (1998: 204), in a study of garment workers in Bangladesh, documents forms of resistance that included sporadic acts of individual or group defiance, as well as other forms of ‘social control from below’ such as hiding information, exchanging jokes or making fun at supervisors and male colleagues. Long (1992: 6) suggests that power dynamics are inherent in interfaces, but my view is that different kinds of workers---made different by the conditions they find themselves---addressed power dynamics differently.

For example, Tierney writes about how informal workplace culture benefits the career progression of men in a software company. The informal workplace culture which includes playing football and poker, eating lunch and drinking together, works in favor of men because being sponsored by someone higher (on account of the masculine culture of technology, usually a male) is a pre-requisite to moving up (Tierney 1995: 202). Although there is no evidence that the informal work culture has disadvantaged women’s careers in a web solutions provider company, it does affect how a man and women relate to one another:

In the case of the Webphilippines, the design team is divided into two. One is internal, the other is external. I head the ‘external’ which takes care of Webphilippines’s contracts for website designing and hosting), so I go out a lot. ‘Internal’ takes care of Webphilippines’s website itself and trabaho.com (an on-line job site which along with other sites are operated by the company). Right now, J (a male colleague) is in-charge of the internal team. I see the difference in running the team. Like when we have meetings. When it comes to implementation with company policies, J gives in more. I mean, he is lenient. I am not. Like you know we have a difference in opinions. I don’t know, maybe it is a guy thing. Or they can always say, ‘pare, we can’t make that work’. To me, work is work. So for example, deadline has not been met’. I demand for an explanation why it was not done, while J will probably think of ways why the person is not able to do it. He’ll consider it, while I think of the company policies. It may also be J. It’s just most of the people who are involved are guys and a woman has a different relationship with the guys. Guys are more opened to talk with guys than, you know. And it is a male-dominated profession, so they actually to prefer to talk
with the guys.
(Kay, 27/04/2000)

Women are expected to carry human preoccupations into the job: nursing, teaching, and social work (Cockburn 1985: 58), and it seems that by imposing company norms, Kay has reneged on societal expectations. Yet, the narrative illustrates the gender-specific embeddedness of the economy: the nature of the new economy which allows the creation of ‘female social spaces’ and the gendered social distribution of knowledge where women are still a minority in some arenas shape the way women respond to male structures.

By looking at the information technology arena in the Philippines in terms of interfaces, I have shown that this arena is characterized by a broadening and diversification of activities and actors. The scope of the broadening and diversification is however still contested and its ultimate implications are still unclear.

References


EADI-Workshop Gender and Globalisation: Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring 70
Globalisation, women and the politics of place: work in progress

Wendy Harcourt, Society for International Development
Editor Development Director, Programmes
Society for International Development, Via Panisperna 207, 00184 Rome Italy, e-mail: wendyh@sidint.org

Abstract

The paper outlines my initial research as part of a joint activist research project on how poor women and women’s groups are responding to and shaping resistances to globalisation’s dominant neo-liberal capitalist discourses. The central concept used to understand these activities is the politics of place. (Escobar and Harcourt 1998) In the paper I explain the conceptual approach of the project as well as giving some initial examples of the research to date.12

Meanings of place in global times

In mainstream and critical debates alike, globalisation is presented as a totalizing economic and cultural phenomenon with no alternative possible. As such, concrete places seem to disappear. Globalisation is seen as driven by global capitalist processes advanced under the rubric of neo-liberal principles, particularly those of free trade (trade liberalization under the World Trade Organization, WTO), privatization of all economic activities, significant dismantling of welfare state policies, and the overall de-regulation of the economy, which gives unprecedented power to transnational corporations (TNCs). Secondly, globalisation is understood in terms of the increased interconnectedness of social groups world wide in ways that are greatly uneven (in terms of types and intensity of connections), culturally driven (that is, dominated by cultures of European origin, particularly North American culture), and fundamentally facilitated by new information and communication technologies (ICTs). These two facets of what we might call neo-liberal capitalist globalisation - is what many people assume dominates all that we do. And therefore, the best strategy for women at the national, regional or local level is to negotiate for better terms of connection to the

12 This paper is based on a longer article written together with Arturo Escobar ‘Women and the Politics of Place: an Introduction’. The article is currently being rewritten for publication in June 2001. There is also a special journal issue of the SID journal Development ‘Place, Politics and Justice: Women negotiating globalisation’ being prepared from the outcome of this research project to be published in March 2001

EADI-Workshop Gender and Globalisation: Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring
71
global economy and the global society, via the production of commodities or information that fit into the dominant social dynamic.

Another understanding of how women are negotiating globalisation is to look at how women’s groups in their struggle to defend place are responding to and shaping globalisation. It is misleading to imagine that globalisation can be seen as all encompassing and that concrete places are disappearing or being rendered inconsequential for women’s lives. Rather political struggles around place are a source for strategic vision that provides us with clues about the meaning of politics and development in the global age.

In order to give shape to a place-based view of global processes and political action we analyze below the emergent politics of place through the actions of poor women and women’s groups within and among themselves and in their interaction with different social movements. By working out simultaneously a set of questions and a set of concepts around place-based processes, we can construct a culturally nuanced, collective, grounded and gender sensitive framework for the ‘the politics of place.’

A global sense of place

The concept of ‘place’ has become a topic of intense study in the last decade in fields such as geography, anthropology, environmental studies and feminist theory. The richness of these debates is in many ways a response to the proliferation of academic discussions about globalisation. The geographer Doreen Massey and historian Arif Dirlik provide two constructive points of departures. For Massey (1997), it is possible to speak about a ‘global sense of place.’ This is not a contradiction in terms, as it might at first appear, but rather an indication of the fact that the role of place in social life has changed. Places are no longer isolated, nor are they pure, static, or just traditional; places are clearly produced in their encounter with the global—but this does not render places irrelevant for people’s lives. Dirlik suggests something similar, although starting with a different observation: that there is a fundamental asymmetry between ‘the local’ and ‘the global’ in most of the debates on globalisation (1998). This asymmetry simply means that there is always the hidden assumption in these debates that ‘the global’ is where power resides, and ‘the local’ –and place—can only adapt or perish. According to this globalocentric perspective, it is the global networks and flows of information, commodities, and the like that constitute the dominant structure of the so-called global network society (Castells 1996). While this perspective seems in many ways correct, it leaves much to be desired if one adopts a perspective of place.
Anthropologists and geographers have tried to come up with a balanced perspective on these issues. To this end, they seek to avoid two extremes: the idea that in today's world what counts the most is the rapid pace of change and its concomitant mobility: people's diasporas, migrations, traveling, orientation towards the global, etc. The second extreme is a notion of place that does not pay enough attention to the global aspect of all places. There is then a new view being built that simultaneously looks at local specificity and global construction. Examples of this new trend are how people develop a sense of 'belonging' despite movement, or attachment to places despite their insertion in global networks, or senses of place despite environmental destruction, or a sense of 'boundaries' that are clearly not natural. Another focus is on social movements, and how in many cases these movements are built on a concern for difference, the defense of territory, and the crafting of collective identities that, although rooted somehow in long-standing cultural practices, are nevertheless created in their critical engagement with modernity, development, and globalisation. Finally, others focus on how local people develop perceptions and experiences of place, endowing them with meaning and significance. The rationale for this approach is the belief that 'culture sits in places,' and that there is something about this production of culture that cannot be reduced to outside forces or the global (see Escobar 2000a for a review of this literature).

A framework to understand women and place

Taking this approach to place and globalisation there are also some gender specificities in relation to place, politics and globalisation that we are proposing to explore in the following framework (Harcourt, 2000):

Women's bodies are the first place that defines political struggle – for autonomy, for reproductive and sexual integrity and right, for safe motherhood for freedom from violence and sexual oppression. The body is the site for many struggles over different modern/ traditional -hybrid- identities.

A second place is that of the home and the environment that for many women still define their primary social and cultural identity and lived domain and immediate political struggle within the family and every day work in the home and on the land. The home and immediate community and environment are the safe places for women to express themselves, though also the places where violence and oppression can be the most savage.
The third place is the social public space—the male dominated domain to which most women still have limited access, and where many women find their gender-based concerns silenced or missing. For many years, women’s movements have been creating diverse avenues for entry into that space, even if they are still marginal to the pulse of dominant forms of political power.

A place-based strategy for women recognizes that political change can only come about by changes in power relations so that women are able to act on all three levels of place in their every day life activities, fostering their current questionings of hierarchies, resistance to male domination and confidence in their own creativity.

**Body as place ‘closest in’**

The bodily experience of particular bodies perceived and lived as female, construct a concept of self and place that has a political meaning and is based on fleshly experience. As feminists it is important to validate the bodily experience of particular bodies perceived and lived as female, constructing a concept of self and place that has a political meaning and experience that forms the basis for political actions. In writing about the experiences of globalisation from a perspective of women’s lives we need to explore the different cultural and ideological constructs of the body in its fleshly political being, with the body being understood as not bound to the private and to the self but linked integrally to material expressions of community and public space. In this sense there is no neat divide between the corporeal and the social, there is instead what has been called ‘social flesh’. (Beasley and Bacchi 2000) In this sense, the body is understood as a political site or place that mediates the lived experiences of social and cultural relationships. What is interesting is how the theorizing of place can speak to the concepts of political embodiment, aware of the uneasiness still in feminist theorizing around the body. While avoiding the pitfalls of essentialism and biologism and the seductiveness of the abstract theorizing of the body as narrative or metaphor we cannot avoid the important of the body as we analyze material inequities, racism/ethnicities, disabilities. We still need to work against the concept of an essential other, and refuse to see women, in all their diversities of history, race, experience, age ‘being lashed to their bodies’ at one remove from a ‘true’ self as Adrienne Rich (1976) described it.

This theorizing of the body aims to move beyond the dualism of body/mind, body/spirit, body/politic, able/disabled, reproductive/productive, public/private, to look at lived experiences of bodies as part of social, cultural and political institutions. It tries to work with tensions in the constructions of power/knowledge around the particularities of female bodies, their fleshly capacity to nurture another
life, acknowledging that the body for women is a conscious and material entry point to their political identity. Women deal with the material result of being sexualized subjects.

Feminist writers (such as Liz Grosz) since the 1970s have theorized the body as the place ‘closest in’ as an important political terrain for women’s identity and politics. Using their work we can look at the relationship of ‘being in the body’ and ‘being in place’. The body in most political theories is not a subject of politics but an object of political control and is the exteriorized terrain of public regulation. There is an implicit disconnection from the ‘private’ experience of the lived body and a person’s subjectivity. Instead a feminist theory of the body builds on a Foucauldian understanding of the body as critical to modern operations of power. Bodies are not separate from politics rather their very embodiment, their corporeal, fleshly, material existence are determining our relations. In calling attention to the bodies as political subjects, we recognize that ‘we are our bodies’. The political self is not distinct from the body, or to put it another way, the body is the place ‘closest in’. Our experience of ourselves, our cultural, political and social identity is a lived one, determined by our relations to other bodies. In order to lodge bodies in their physical and social particularities, theoretically we have to move from the instrumentalizing of the body as an object, to understanding the body as a subject, central to power, gender and culture. By focusing on the fleshly bodies of women, on birth, breast, breast milk, menstruation, their material experience of sex, pregnancy, violation, rape, it is not dismissing the experiences of bodies as outside political discourse. It is taking women’s lived experiences as participating subjects in politics. This understanding reverses the suggestion that a body ‘conventionally regarded as mired in biology’ (Beasly and Bacchi 2000) is disqualified from politics. The body is inherently part of social and political participation. Female, black, disabled bodies do not have biological limitations to overcome or to be negotiated; their fleshliness is present and integral to political subjectivity.

A major theoretical challenge is to embed our understanding of political bodies or ‘social flesh’ with other concepts of place. The language of place, networks, and glocality are key concepts in this endeavour. At the basis of these concepts are particular understandings of culture, power, and identity. The conventional understanding of culture as embedded in beliefs, habits, customs and mores has contributed greatly to making invisible everyday cultural practices and meanings as the terrain for, and source of, political practices and identities. Instead we understand culture as a collective and incessant process of producing meanings that shapes social experience and configures social relations. This is akin to what Raymond Williams calls structures of feeling that may best be analyzed as the lived experiences of people in society. This view highlights a conception of culture as interactive and historical. It can be said that there is always a cultural politics at play in the inevitable
interaction among people with partially different sets of cultural understanding. This encounter takes place in contexts of power. While of course all cultures are hybrid today, cultural politics can be seen as enacted when sets of social actors shaped by, and embodying, different cultural meanings and practices come into conflict with each other. In other words, culture is political because meanings are constitutive of processes that, implicitly or explicitly, seek to redefine social power. When place-based movements, for instance, deploy alternative conceptions of woman, body, nature, race, democracy, or economy that unsettle dominant cultural meanings, they can be seen as enacting a cultural politics.

Ethnicity, gender, religion, sexuality and livelihood inform women’s politics of place. In this sense culture will be seen as a fluid process that can allow disempowered groups of women to negotiate power differences and to make sense of their world as they struggle in their everyday life. Culture is therefore not about a backward past or deprived present nor is it about romantic views of tradition or about nationalist pride.

Let us take below some experiences of women and the politics of place.

Women defending place: Some examples.

In 1995 a group of Australian Aboriginal Ngarrindjeri women petitioned the Federal Labour Government to stop the building of a bridge from the South Australian mainland to Kumarangk (or Hindmarsh Island as it is known by whites). The women argued that the building of the bridge would disturb sacred women’s sites. During a subsequent enquiry and Royal Commission the Ngarrindjeri women were asked to defend their women’s business (laws, customs and religion that are specific to women) even though traditionally no men can know about the law. Because the women would not defend their religion and sacred place in the court the ‘secret women’s business’ was declared a fabrication. Despite the ruling and the media hounding around their struggle, the women have continued to defend their rights to the land and knowledge. Their fight continues with the support of a growing solidarity movement marked by national Sorry Days and demonstrations in capital cities where 100,000s of black and white Australians publicly march against the Federal Government’s institutional racial discrimination of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders. Their struggle over land and cultural rights is linked to many other once hidden battles of urban and rural Aboriginal tribes as well as to the international women’s networks fighting to combat gender discrimination, racism and fundamentalism.
In the famous struggles of the indigenous people of Chiapas, the indigenous women produced ‘The Revolutionary Women’s Laws’. The demands featured two sets of specific demands, one addressed to the Mexican state for fair salaries, reproductive rights, education, health, protection against and punishment towards rape and other forms of violence. And the other to their community addressing the right to choose their partners, the right not to be forced into marriage, the right not to be beaten or physically mistreated by their family members or by strangers, for severe punishment against rape, and the right for women to occupy positions of leadership in the organization and to hold military ranks. These demands were reduced in the official demands of the Zapatistas subcomandante Marcos to demand 29 out of 34 and referred only to the set of conditions that guaranteed women’s role as mothers and nurturers - specifically for childcare and bakeries. The strong and telling demands for their right to rest and their demand for autonomy, for freedom against violence was silenced. The national and international support of NGOs and women groups for the demands of the Chiapas women tries to give space for Chiapas women’s voices to be heard.

The active involvement of Bal Rashmi, a Jaipur based NGO, in the struggle for women’s autonomy and rights and against women’s sexual exploitation such as child marriage, rape, dowry deaths and wife torture drew the negative attention of the conservative State Government of Rajasthan. The Government filed bogus criminal cases and the leaders of Bal Rashmi were arrested. In fighting back, Bal Rashmi members used the Internet to contact immediately international human rights and women’s networks in India, South Asia, Europe and North America. Their call set off an appeal that within a few weeks led to faxes and letters flooding into the National Human Rights Commission, the Rajasthan State and Indian Government. The Internet campaign forced a legal investigation of the cases and within a few months they were squashed. This example illustrates different levels of a gendered placed-based politics. First, the defense of women’s body as the first level of place (Bal Rashmi aims to protect and defend women’s sexual autonomy - stop sexual abuse, child marriage, rape in prisons and the like) in the ‘feudal’ conservative place (community or environment) of Jaipur, Rajasthan. When the group was directly and forcibly challenged, with false cases made against them, arrested and imprisoned by corrupt political authority they used networking to defend their political action – by appealing to women’s groups world wide that are also fighting to defend women’s bodies and against patriarchal oppression. This is an important example of a unique political placed-based action by a women’s groups that succeeded because they could harness the Internet’s potential for rapid networking and support.

These three examples illustrate a modern defense of place by women’s groups working politically on very different issues, and with very different strategies. They illustrate the complex connections
among the various levels that place operates in global times of the 1990s. A political defense of place by these women focuses not just on the defense of a community’s land or environment or traditional culture in the face of global change but also on a struggle for women’s freedom and right to bodily integrity, autonomy, knowledge and identity that is a mix of modern and traditional discourses. The politics of women’s groups defending their place, be it their sacred ground, their land, their body or their right to rest is not simply at the local level, it is intermeshed with national and international networks; the political work performed by these networks is geared towards pushing for women’s economic, social and political rights.

Women’s ‘politics of place’ is a description of how different women’s groups are engaging in complex multilevel strategies of politics of place: changing their sense of self, their place in the community, their cultural identity, and opening up new types of public political spaces to negotiate gender, economic and social justice as part of local and global process. As the three examples suggest, ‘place-based politics’ are not purely forms of resistance to modernization or modern capital in the defense of traditional culture and land. They are multiple political activities carried out by women around the body, the environment, the community and the public arena where women’s groups are redefining political action to take into account their gender concerns based on their own needs and in response to various forms of globalisation as it is experienced at the level of their daily lives. This process of placed-based politics links localities horizontally to other political activities by women’s groups that maybe located geographically in other places, building networks that are creating new configurations of culture, power and identity that are not determined solely by the global, but also by place-based practices. There is then a network component to all politics of place, meaning that place is neither simply local nor its politics place-bound, even if it continues to be fundamental to people’s daily lives.

In order to explore this further the project will be looking at the experiences of women on the margins of modernity/tradition such as migrant women, sex workers, women in industrial zones, guerilla fighters, refugee women and displaced women in war zones. These women live and shape the negative narratives of globalisation. Their stories chart out the lines of escape, the subaltern experiences and the struggles women (in communities and as individuals) are experiencing to meet livelihoods in an increasingly harsh conditions of globalisation.

A future research agenda on women and the politics of place

In focusing on women’s particular experience of place and in what is new in globalisation for women
in shaping those places, the project is looking at place as a new site of politics that allows for a rethinking of globalisation and disrupts notions of a binary relationship between ‘the’ local and global. Key to that analysis is to explain how women’s politics around the body, environment and public place is reconfiguring globalisation. In exploring the historical continuities and discontinuities of today’s experience of globalisation, we are also exploring ways to create counter imaginaries to the dominant view of globalisation as all encompassing and immobilizing for women’s political activity. The project aims to bring out the sites of conflict and tension; to map out what constitutes different kinds of bodily experiences of the environment as central to women’s political and creative (generative) diverse struggles in place. In this way we aim to set out more clearly what are the relationships between globalisation, women’s places, what are the relations of bodies/places to modernity, what are the dialectics, the casualities, the delinking, the escaping, the reconfigurations and the strategies of recovery.

References


Rich Adrienne 1976 Of Woman Born. Motherhood as Experience and Institution London: Virago
New knowledge about Muslim-women, narratives of women in six countries
(abstract)

Selma Leydesdorff
Belle van Zuylen Institute, University of Amsterdam, Rokin 84-90, 1012 KX Amsterdam, The Netherlands, e-mail: leydesdorff@pscw.uva.nl

Every individual has her or his own perception about the surrounding world, as everyone has her or his own history. Over the last years a group of researchers in the project “Women, Islam, and Development” have been listening to women in six countries: Yemen, Bangladesh, Sudan Ethiopia, Mali and Senegal. They helped to construct a new kind of knowledge about the women living there and have tried to understand and see the world through their eyes. The kind of information they gathered is new. Traditional quantitative research based upon scientifically drawn random samples provide the ability to make valid statements about the population within a measurable margin of error. What it cannot do is to look at individuals in that population in greater depth. That is our task: we deal with perceptions of life and histories that are all unique and not comparable. We have particularly been dealing with changes in life, culture and mentality.

During this paper I want to discuss some of my observations. My role in the project is finished now, unfortunately, initiatives to further collaboration with some of the better researchers were blocked by a new politics of the gender division of the Ministry. It is sad since there is an enormous wish to present the findings, which is now only done in a report which is action directed. One of my, and not only mine, had been to help some women in individual careers towards academic and intellectual leadership.

Listening to the narrated experiences has made us understand a variety of individual histories, individual responses to social context and we learned about words and actions at certain moments and spaces. We have come to understand when they are reactions to constraints, agency or resignation. In short we dealt with a subjective understanding of times and context. Unique experiences of life often cannot be compared, yet the continuing themes of these stories can lead to useful generalizations and better understanding. Also the individual can reflect the changes in her story, she can be an example of how societies are transformed. She can make us aware of the many things we don’t know, but of which we should be aware. Thus, one of the results of the project consists of individual reflections on change. Women became alive in this new and changing world. They are the subjects reflecting changes in attitudes, agency, and resistance to the traditional ways of subordination to the old world of class, male
oriented tradition and religion that at one time seemed unchangeable. The women we interviewed, knowingly or not, reflected in their stories that they live in times of societal, cultural and religious transition. The fluid character of this qualitative research has shown its capacity to enlighten us with an insight into the experiences of change and its resulting conflicts, its confusion, its informal settlement of cultural codes, new searches for self definition and the reshaping of worlds and languages. We have been looking at worlds in which resources can become constraints and vice versa in which constraints can provide safety and resources, such as social networks and family codes.

Listening to the voices of women in this project has given a chance to look at the emerging social transformation of societies and women’s lives. Through the prism of these women’s experiences of the human condition, they have shown new capabilities and forms of well being, perspectives on the organization of personal life, accountability, domains of empowerment in civil society, equity and sustainability. We are witnessing their new understandings of the right to life: human centered rights. The interviews have enabled us to make record, a kaleidoscope of responses that include wishes, dreams and fantasies in the reactions of these women to their life and society. Some might have seemed extreme in the past, but presage the norm at some future time. We search for the extremes of the past that are normal at this time. We have found that people have dreams and wishes even in the harshest of conditions; that women have ideas about change, regardless of the present context of their daily lives.

Whoever looks at the transcripts in a superficial way might be confirmed in their prejudices that women’s lives are set within inescapable boundaries of traditional societies. Such a reading might show us that hardly any woman tries to escape her fate, she simply tries to make the best of her circumstances. A more analytic and sensitive reading, will see patterns in the interviews, efforts to acknowledge change when old local values fight with the changing cultural demands of modernity. Since times are changing, so are social and cultural norms. Small events, changes in values hardly visible in quantitative research, can have an enormous impact.

We read about many older women who told us that they had no say in the choices of their spouses. They said they could not refuse when their parents proposed a spouse whom they met for the first time at their wedding. This is a practice still going on in all countries in which we have been interviewing. In most such interviews though, the same elderly women would tell us that the chance to say ‘ho’ to an arranged marriage seems now at least open to discussion. A woman who does not want to marry a chosen husband has the possibility to escape. Modern transportation and women’s non-governmental organizations have created the possibility, in extreme cases, of leaving an unwanted marriage. It should
also be hopefully noted that in many cases, spousal violence is no longer accepted.

It is one of the ironies of social and cultural change that the relaxation of traditional norms sometimes produce unintended and negative consequences for women. Although traditional social cohesion and control often left women in fixed roles of severe subordination, they had at the same time protected them. This is the case for instance in Yemen, where there are several stories of women being protected by the elders from their village against abuse, even if this was an intervention in the private life of the nuclear or extended family.

But this social cohesion can also be the last resource in times of economic catastrophe, when the need is big. Galila in Sudan referred to it when she mentioned that in old times her brothers would have been able to help her "I did not receive any support from any one, because people have changed. Particularly nowadays. They are unlike the people in the past when they were pledging charity to the wretched and deprived. — In the past people's understanding of life was simple, they were kind, the relation between people stemmed from the real and strong belief in God'. This implies that help does not come automatically. The family is too far away, suffers from the shock of endless migrations, or has fallen apart for reasons that have to do with modern lifestyle.

Women react to these changes, often in ways of telling that reflect their struggle with codes and normative patterns. But that changes the quality of their narrative, a narrative that reflects a new way of life and perception. But there is not yet an accepted symbolism and language by which the narrators can deal with unavoidable change. They have to use old language and symbols that are familiar in order to address and confront the changing world around them.

The rapid process of change that affects women in all countries is evident from general reviews of their literature. It is known that modern culture seeps through the shut doors of even the most remote village. Women may be exposed to election campaigns. Medical care introduced by foreigners brings with it their normative and often western or different views of the world. Traditionally raised women meet modern forms of political Islamic fundamentalism which, while confining women more than any other political movement in their traditional role, is able to reach them by giving the only education available to them.

We do find agency when it is not expected. Since agency arises from a variety of intersections in personal life, time and chance, agency itself is a process, a development that by the sheer nature of its volatile character can not be generalised. Agency is not abstract, but should always be placed within context, it is not a psychological phenomenon, nor an unique event, but it consists of words and deeds which belong to
a certain time and space. It is the moment the individual breaks the codes of a culture or family, steps outside the normative values of her surroundings or adapt in new ways, using codes and laws in order to reinterpret and in the end to change them. She may also use the traditional as a basis to adapt to change.

Some women use tradition to be agents in the improvement of their lives. As an illustration, there are cases in which women don’t dispute that women obey their husbands within Islamic tradition and without complaint. Outwardly they will agree that it is the husband who decides about life, the spending of the money, and the spacing of pregnancies. But no one, not even their husband, is going to stop them from struggling against poverty, from taking care of their children, or wishing to be independent. In these stories, there are cases in which women guarantee the basic existence of the family by working very hard in the fields and in the markets, by taking meticulously care of the education of the children, by taking care of the old and passing on Islamic traditions and values. But they do these things the way they think is best. Women can live and speak according to Islamic tradition. They can behave independently and can adapt tradition to their own needs. This does not imply a rupture in deeds or feelings.

Is the only way to tell us hidden within traditional frameworks? Are there no other genres to tell about dissent available? Or are there only the NGO’s and other such organisations that are doing good works, but remain outside the private perception? We would suggest that there are instances in which women proclaim their attitudes towards change, and we will look at some of them. But those instances can be non-verbal though as good as outspoken new narratives; they can be at the margins, as if they are outside their life, agency, and mental world. If this way of looking at them is able to reflect daily perceptions and context, it will influence the ways in which we can reach out to those women.

Contraception is a major field of women’s agency. Women carry the burden of pregnancies, they deal with spacing of children, prevention, and the number of children. Most of all they deal with the daily exhaustion of having so many babies. Improvement in nutrition and health care have increased the number of pregnancies carried to term, and have also affected fertility. It is a cruel irony that with improved health and prenatal care, women are able to have healthier babies, but they do not necessarily want more babies. It falls on the woman then to carry the feelings of guilt when contemplating contraception, an act that is forbidden by Islam. Though most women do think contraception is forbidden- haram, many nonetheless describe their willingness to prevent conception. We have many stories of women who used contraceptives without telling their husband. But what does it mean that a woman tells you so? Do the other woman know, or are you the listener/interviewer the exception? Can she talk openly about defying her husband since it is her health and life, or does she commit herself to secrecy? If it is normal for a woman to use contraceptives and not talk to her husband about it, this is a
sign that attitudes are changing since the practice is at odds with tradition. If this should be the case, these attitudes should be reinforced by accessibility and visibility. If the use of contraceptives is kept in the dark, it is public discourse that needs to be changed. This discourse is too often about tradition and religion. It should better be focused on attitudes of public health and the life and well being of woman and their offspring. Shocking are the stories of failing contraceptives, or those that cause bleedings and other complaints, which raises the question which kind of contraceptives are available in those countries. Women's stories are our only sources of information. In the interviews there is much distrust about doctors and science, not knowing about women, about what they feel and experience. This is understandable given some of the side affects.

The erosion of some traditions has had the negative effect of changing customs which protected women against too many pregnancies. Sex is now begun sooner after delivery than had been previously allowed. In many cases in the past, women would go to their family after delivery or sleep in the room of an older woman of the family after giving birth. In Mali for instance women might go to their parents for longer periods. In Bangladesh there used to be so called hygienic rules. In Mali and Senegal the co-wife would sexually tend the husband. In this instance, polygamy seems to be a protection against too many pregnancies by the same wife. Seldom were two wives reported to be pregnant at the same time. Despite all this reporting, many women would also say they will only use contraception if the husband agrees. Even in those cases, they actually use contraceptive devices without their husbands knowing. "It is Allah who decides the number of children" The widespread belief in predestination helps to counter regret, guilt or the feeling of acting against Islam. Where pregnancies are threatening to health, women adjust their values on contraceptives.

Not talking about sex might be part of cultural codes or part of actual trauma. Sexuality is not talked about, but sex is there all the time. In all examples, themes that are not told and discussed turn up in other parts of the life story, certainly sexual problems. Women can walk away from violence that often includes rude sexual treatment. Women are disappointed in what married life brings them other than hard work and childbearing. There has been an often mystical secret about the pleasures of marriage, and they find out that it is not sex, but children and social acceptance.

The advantages and disadvantages of polygamy are also part of the silence. Women seem to accept the co-spouses, they have to. They refer to arrangements in the house. Sometimes co-spouses have separate rooms, sometimes children are shared. The infertile co-spouse might even get one of the fertile woman's children. The co-spouse takes the place in bed for the woman who has too many children or of those who don't have children. Co-spouses know everything about the other. But one gets an unclear picture.
regarding competition, love, partnership in survival. There are glimpses however, that may be attained by putting together fragments that are spread over the narratives. Again we wanted to expand here the research; no money.

It would be too easy to merely say that most women are in favor of education. Since this message is layered in other opinions, it is as if it is a way to tell something else. In the first place it is a way to regret one's own lack of education. Many women think they would have been better off if they had been in school, learned the alphabet or just knew the basics of household economy and the economy of small trade. They know life is easier if they could write letters. In past times they needed this less, since society was not organised in a way in which women had public responsibility. But since old social structures have collapsed they do have a different kind of responsibility, one they find more difficult to handle. It is as one woman from Sudan said, a girl who goes to school is much more master of her world and of her own life. Second, hopes for a better future are invested in the daughter, they hope that they will be less the victim than the beneficiary of social change.

Education comes first in the sense that it helps in material survival. Stories about education are stories about changing conditions and a woman's role within these changes.

It is clear that women don't tell us only what we hear at a first instance. They tell us much more. This becomes evident after going over the interviews again and again. They will not tell us directly about agency, but will describe their patterns of life. They will describe a world that is connected and embedded in many respects to a public life often not available to them. They are stories of detailed knowledge and women's perceptions.

We already saw that no formal genre or symbolic order is available for women to tell their stories. In some places, there is a woman's oral tradition, but precisely those kind of traditions are becoming lost. A woman migrating to the city, as millions have done, can not fall back on the oral tradition that sings about the desert, the countryside, the harvest. Women have to invent new ways to express themselves.

**Storytelling is a way to participate in cultural change, and in the change of one's every day existence.** Together with the researchers, women give meaning to their lives, and together with women researchers they create new symbolic orders, places where certain experiences can be discussed. The act of speaking itself is an act of empowerment that needs to be understood as such. The act of speaking itself comprises a transformation of the life story. Let me end by quoting the story of Ebtissam, who strongly believed God and justice to be on her side. She is the modern in the story, and the abusing husband and his family are backward. She left her daughter with her family-in-law in order to behave as a good Muslim. She has always behaved well and was sad and worried to leave her child that she loved so much. But she said 'ho' when her husband wanted her back because he saw she was such a good wife and
mother. 'Stars in the skies are closer to him than I am'; a proverb she used poetically expressing how great her distance is from the father of her daughter.

Life stories tell about time and space. Life stories give meaning to a scattered dialogue between women, and prevent women from being caught up in a world without means of communicating their experiences.
A view from the sky:
globalisation, gender, development and the energy sector

Wendy Annecke

Gender, Energy and Environment, 270 Main Road, St James, South Africa, 7945, e-mail: gloworm@iafrica.com

Abstract

The paper draws its title from a narrative, which is used to illustrate the contradictory nature of globalisation, its impact on the energy sector and women’s access to energy. The paper highlights the characteristics of the energy sector in developing countries, the links between gender, energy and poverty and how these will be affected by global trends. In particular the paper examines the pressures from global markets and potential investors to liberalize and privatize parastals, in this case the electricity utility in South Africa. The restructuring of the Electricity Supply Industry is currently being undertaken and is likely to impact significantly on the household electrification programme and on poor women’s ability to ‘get connected’. The contradictory nature of the aspirations of poor women and the actual benefits brought by electricity are explored. The paper then turns to the ‘fuels of the poor’ – kerosene and biomass – and examines how global influences such as those on pricing and global impacts such as those of climate change, which are remote from poor women’s lives nonetheless affect women’s ability to fulfil their daily tasks. For poor women access to energy services depends, among other factors, on spatial location; what is available and acceptable in rural, informal urban and formal urban areas.

The second part of the paper attempts to unravel some of the questions. The development challenge is clearly how to ensure access to safe, affordable and sufficient energy services so that daily productive and reproductive responsibilities may be fulfilled. The gender challenge is to ensure that alleviating women’s burdens does not further entrench their gender roles. A workshop at the University of Twente last year challenged women working in the energy sector to answer a question which was posed thus: Knowing as much as we do about energy poverty and the increased hardship it causes women, what would be the best way of addressing the problem - through policy, projects or the market? The group was recalcitrant in answering the question, but it needs addressing. It is unlikely to be policy which delivers to women in the near future. In Africa there is no such thing as gender sensitive energy policy, and although there is positive rhetoric, potential changes fall victim to a lack
of resources, political will and capacity. Projects have not delivered significant improvements to women’s lives on any scale worth mentioning. There have been too few projects that, for a variety of reasons, have been able to deliver on their promises or be maintained over time. And according to this analysis in this paper, energy poverty will not be solved through the markets. Various combinations of tactics may work and the paper concludes with suggestions of what each one of us can do to counter the powerful trends of globalisation which were highlighted in the opening paragraph.

Energy

The energy sector is conveniently divided into sub-sectors

- The electricity sector. Electricity is the quintessential modern energy carrier needed for life in the 21st century. It is usually generated by burning coal, using hydro-power or nuclear conversion. It can also be generated by wind, sun and waves which are known as renewables

- The fossil fuel sector. These are also known as hydro-carbons or transition fuels when moving 'up the fuel ladder'. Coal, petroleum and petroleum products such as kerosene (paraffin) and LPGas are included in this sector

- The bio-fuel sector includes woodfuel, crop waste, dung and bio-gas, bio-gel and fuel cells. There is some dissension as to which of these are renewable.

North and South energy use

In the north most energy is consumed in the commercial, industrial and transport sectors, whereas in the south the domestic sector and agriculture often account for major proportions of energy consumption.

In Africa less than 30% of all households have access to electricity (Reddy 1999), so that generally the hydro-carbons (coal, LPGas, kerosene) are used in conjunction with biofuels fuels (woodfuel, crop waste, dung). According to FAO estimates at least 60% of rural women in Africa are affected by fuelwood scarcity which means they cannot fulfil their daily energy requirements (Reddy 1999). Continuing dependence on bio-fuels is the crux of the matter. Worldwide more than two billion people still rely entirely on biomass for cooking (Reddy 1999). This is despite the general trend towards fuel substitution in rural and urban areas, and the fact that the proportion of people using bio-energy has decreased in all continents except Africa (Reddy 1999).
Energy sector – a gender analysis

International
The energy sector is a male dominated field. A gender analysis of the commercial energy sector from the coal mines, through the synthetic fuels plants, to oil refineries, chemical laboratories, planning offices, power stations, transmission and distribution networks, to those who install new connections for household use, to Boards of Trustees and directors, will demonstrates that the overwhelming majority of these positions are held by men.

Africa
A gendered analysis of the positions which women hold all along the energy chain, from production to end-use, will reveal that only a few women have been appointed to decision making positions in the big sectors – electricity, petroleum and gas – although this is changing. There are also still too few women engineers and technicians in the power stations and laboratories. Women in the sector generally hold low-status positions of administrators and secretaries. Many women in Africa still have little option but to remain at home struggling to maintain agricultural or home based productive activities, tending the cooking fires and caring for households. It is very difficult for these women to improve their conditions on their own. This is because women, especially poor rural women, are at the bottom of the pile when it comes to obtaining and controlling resources such as access to education, energy services or a vote in the fiscus.

In South Africa
For most of this century the decision-makers in the energy sector have been white men; women were just about invisible both as workers in the sector (where they held subordinate positions as secretaries and administrators) and as users of energy services. From the turn of the century the mineral-energy sector has been pre-occupied with activities which traditionally fall within the masculine domain: these include the production of relatively cheap coal, and the generation, transmission and distribution of electricity to the gold mines and other industrial, commercial and middle class interests. Petroleum began to play an increasingly important role post World War II, and came to be of strategic importance during the late apartheid years (1970s onwards) when the oil embargo began to take effect. The research and development agendas were also driven by men who had a strong interest in securing self-sufficiency in electricity and oil. Vast generating capacity was developed by the national electricity utility, Eskom, and the establishment of plants to produce synthetic fuels was heavily subsidised, as was a nuclear power plant, while renewables and energy for development and domestic users, in particular poor (black) women, were neglected.
In fact the apartheid government was so obsessed with strategic fuel reserves and secrecy that as late as 1987 when the Minister of Mineral and Energy Affairs was asked in parliament what he intended doing about the growing wood shortages, both he and his Director general were puzzled by the question and asked what wood had to do with their portfolio (Marquard 1999:11)

A positive trend for women in energy is that despite the difficulties there are a growing number of women in the energy sector. Africa is fortunate in having several women in top positions in Energy Ministries and allied departments: Ghana, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa, Zimbabwe and Uganda among others, all boast women at very senior levels. In South Africa the electricity utility has begun to appoint women to senior technical positions and a woman has been appointed Chief Executive Officer to the Central Energy Fund. While the presence of women does not guarantee attention to gender issues, promoting women to decision making positions is a start.

Poverty

We have become very sophisticated at measuring and describing poverty. The Human Development Index uses and suggests a variety of quantitative and sophisticated qualitative methods to describe what being poor means. Poverty is no longer described by a clumsy GDP or personal income statistic, it is no longer measured infant mortality rates or life expectancy, but includes a range of access and inclusion or exclusion factors. Whatever measure is used most of the poor are women (Cecelski 2000:1)

I was wondering how to describe poverty to those who have not seen of heard or smelled or touched it. I cannot tell you what it is like to be hungry during school and drink water so that I can concentrate (like the child told Archbishop Tutu), I cannot tell you what it is like not to have water, or a house to sleep in or money to buy bread – although I have seen these things.

As a woman I can tell you only two things about poverty. The first is that I have never come across a middle class woman who regrets, who truly wishes she had not had any of her children but I know many poor women who wish they had not had theirs. These women have had no joy, no pleasure, no fun from their children, so great has been the burden and the stress of caring for them. The second is that I have heard one young mother who truly loved her baby girl – she described her as the only thing she had in the world – I heard her describe how she killed her greatest love-child with rat poison
because she could not bear to hear her crying of hunger any more. She used to boil water to boil to pretend to the child that food was cooking and eventually the child who fall asleep from crying but and she had run out of paraffin to burn and water to boil and the baby could not stop crying....

Energy wealth or poverty

Energy wealth (as opposed to energy poverty) could be determined by access to safe, affordable and secure energy services, and perhaps by the amount of energy used KJ or emissions that one is responsible for.

Energy poverty is the term applied to the condition of not having sufficient fuel of any sort to fulfill daily needs, so that, for example food cannot be cooked, or refined food which takes less cooking is used, or space-heating is not possible so that people are cold, or water to wash cannot be heated or, perhaps the worst, contaminated water for drinking cannot be boiled. But prior to resorting to these measures there would have been the struggle to find, collect or buy fuel.

Over the past twenty years the documentation of energy-use patterns and energy poverty has increased significantly so that we now know a great deal about the struggles of women to obtain fuel. Both qualitative and quantitative data about woodfuel use has been collected from southern Africa in terms of distances walked to collect wood (up to 7kms), time spent chopping bundling, and carrying (1-5 hours a day), the weight of headloads (up to 35kgs), the effect of this on women’s health (including neck, back and child bearing complications), the effect of wood smoke on respiratory and eye health (especially of women and small children), the impacts of energy poverty on nutrition, and the effect on girl-children of having to share the energy-related tasks rather than attend school. The quantitative data is supported by case studies which add depth and provide multi-faceted and richly textured accounts of the hardships women experience in fulfillmnet of their every day dealings with energy (Tinker 1982, Cecelski 1984, Ross 1993). It is estimated that at least 60% of rural women in Africa are affected by fuelwood scarcity which means that in order to fulfill their daily energy requirements they have to use crop waste, dung or decrease their cooking and heating times.

A similar situation pertains in paraffin use. The significance of paraffin in South Africa was highlighted only in the early 1990s (Annecke 1992, Ross 1993). Since then considerable data has been rapidly collected in a national longitudinal study as well as other individual studies. Research shows that as many as 87% of all households in South Africa use paraffin (Davis and Ward, 1995). Women,
who are primarily responsible for buying and using paraffin generally dislike it because it is dirty, smelly and expensive. It is also poisonous, and ingestion among small children regularly results in deaths. Households which use paraffin for cooking usually use candles for lighting. This is a lethal combination especially in shacklands in urban areas where fires spread rapidly. Children are frequently the victims in these fires (Cape Times 10 April 2000). Nonetheless paraffin is considered by many as a ‘step up the fuel ladder’ and efforts to make paraffin and LPG more readily available in rural areas Africa are being made. For poor women access to energy services depends, among other factors, on spatial location; what is available and acceptable in rural, informal urban and formal urban areas. Current studies of energy poverty show that women are already under considerable stress. The common manifestations of these stresses are low level chronic illnesses such as headaches, flu symptoms, tiredness and coughs. Under-nourishment or malnutrition may be exacerbated when refined staples (rice, maize, cassava) with less nutritional value are cooked in preference to unrefined, because they take less cooking time and therefore less fuel.

The hardest part of my life is having to collect wood and I am always sick. But it was worst when I had to collect wood and I was sick and my children were not there and it was raining. I stayed without cooking food for two days (Annecke, 1997:15).

The conditions of energy poverty are about to be exacerbated by the HIV/AIDS pandemic and climate change, particularly in rural areas. What we are seeing in rural areas is an influx of young women (28-35) who are too ill to work and or care for their children, bring them ‘home’ to their mothers to care for. The mothers are in the 52-58 year old category, too old to start again carrying wood and water for five or six people, too young to be eligible for the state pension of R500 a month. The children are urban born and bred and resentful of being in a rural area, so they are not about to help, and then there is the stigma – so few people want to say its AIDS. In South Africa more women than men are HIV positive.

Climate change will also affect women adversely, particularly because in Africa women are the farmers and will be directly affected by changes in the vulnerable sectors. The Vulnerability and Adaptability study undertaken in South Africa (Kiker 2000) determined that all of the sectors examined (agriculture, biodiversity, forestry, human health, ranching, and water) were sensitive to climate change. Their vulnerability may be increased by limited choices and coping mechanisms, reducing their adaptability. Maladaptive practices could lead to worsening of conditions.

The great stride that has been made in South Africa recently is the zero rating of paraffin for VAT purposes (Budget 2001).
Development

There are volumes of thoughtful development and anti-development literature (Baden & Goetz 1998, Crush 1995, Sittirak 1998, Visvanathan et al 1997). In the 60s energy for development meant vast infrastructure projects such as dams for hydro-power, (and thinking of the Lesotho Highlands project still under construction in 2001, it sometimes still does). But many international agencies have turned their energy for development focus towards smaller projects and energy services which would enable income generation. There is a healthy critique of development as income generation (James 1995), while it does have a place in the alleviation of poverty, the backlash experienced by women in the United States of America serves as a warning that financial independence is only one facet of gaining equality for women – although energy for development projects are usually some way from achieving this sort of independence!

The development challenge this paper focuses on is access to safe, affordable and sufficient energy services so that daily productive and reproductive responsibilities may be fulfilled and the conceptual and practical challenge of whose responsibility it is to perform these tasks.

Many energy for development projects have focused on the delivery of energy services in which alleviate women’s burden. There is a wealth of development and project experience among NGOs and women’s groups, there is an active donor community and there are some sympathetic men who are allies in the struggle for poverty alleviation and the improvement of women’s quality of life. These groups have collaborated in different ways, their strategies have included planting woodlots, improving the efficiency of stoves, and providing women with access to more modern energy sources such as LPGas, photovoltaic lighting systems and solar drying systems. Unfortunately the lack of involvement of local women at all stages of the project cycle has been identified in many countries as one of the main reasons for the limited success and sustainability of these projects thus far. Dr Joy Clancy knows of a project in Malawi which provides a remarkable example of not to do energy for income generation. In the early 90s it was thought that universal electrification would solve many of the health and resources problems related to energy and development particularly in rural areas But there has proved to be no ready correlation between electrification and economic development. However in South Africa electrification has been advocated as an essential component of development and is an important signifier of political and social delivery.

"Electricity for all" was one of the ANC’s slogans leading up to the first democratic elections in 1994,
but the White Paper on Energy Policy in South Africa records a significant shift to 'energy for all'. The link between electrification and providing effective energy services to the poor, which was assumed to be straightforward in the early 90s, has proved problematic, as has the link between electrification and development. While universal electrification appeared to be the answer to many local development problems, in particular the health hazards of kerosene and biomass use, supplying electricity often means shifting the environmental problem from one location to another (for example out of women's cooking space to the space surrounding the coal-fired power plant as in the case in Mpumulanga). Universal electrification is often not financially viable because putting in the grid is so expensive and the uptake is so low (Davis 1997). Recently I looked at the difference between the assumed benefits of electrification and the 'real' experienced ones, and I looked at the difference between a grid electricity supply and solar home systems (SHS) (Cawood 1997). What women aspired to and what they had, were, unsurprisingly, quite different. I was interested in whether electricity made an impact of specific aspects of development by improving the quality of life through making domestic chores less arduous, facilitating non-formal education including improved general knowledge, and enabling the development of small and micro-enterprises. The women who had received grid connections were markedly more satisfied than those who had solar home systems – even though over half of them still collected wood regularly, but all either had or had plans to buy a stove whereas the SHS only allowed for lighting and a television or radio. Having light did make a difference to everyone, and women felt safer in moving about at night. However there was little reading and schoolwork happening and what there was depended on the school and teachers more than having an electric light. Television however had brought the anniversary of Princess Di's death and the OAU meeting in Durban right into their homes, just as it had brought a desire for designer clothes, four plate stoves with an oven, cell phones and the lottery. The most disappointing aspect was not having the wood collection burden alleviated and women complained bitterly that this was the hardest thing in their lives along with unemployment and in some cases having to collect water (Annecke 1997). Cecelski (2000:9) and others are right when they insist that fuel for cooking is a priority. There were very few income generating projects in the areas that I visited either with or without electricity. Those that there were included weaving traditional mats, knitting jerseys and making ice-lollies and chips to sell at local schools all of which made use of the electric light at night. Most women would have liked to make some money but did not know how. One group carried on their brick making and gardening project which had been started by an NGO even though it did not make a profit, it gave them a sense of identity and purpose. They noted, however, that as soon as the NGO pulled out and the market disappeared that the local men pulled out too. What I would like to do is interview those men and find out why, because the women claim they are now sitting around doing nothing or drinking all day.
Gender

Gender is a fundamental organizing principle and determinant of the individual in society, it should describe not only the asymmetrical relations between men and women but also between men (and men), women (and women) and men, women and children. Acknowledging that these relationships are frequently asymmetrical brings into focus the element of power in all relations. Power is mutually constituted, but power relations and balances are not static but constantly changing (McKie et al 1999:27). The roles that are ascribed to men and women are manifestations of these power relations. The roles are socially constructed, not inevitable. The roles ascribed to men and women are socially constructed, that is, that they are not inevitable (as for example biological sex makes it impossible for men to give birth) but are developed, structured, maintained and passed on through and by societies and individuals in societies. It may be that since time immemorial women have been subordinate to men, but this subordination takes many forms and changes over time, sometimes rapidly sometimes more slowly. For example the relationships between men and women at the beginning of the 20th century were quite different to the relations between young men and women at the turn of the millennium. This ability to change, adapt and convert men and women’s roles acknowledges the power of human agency and is an important point, because it indicates that it is possible to change behaviours and attitudes. However it is also important to remember that there are forces that act against change, and these are generally powers exercised by men (and sometimes by women and children too) to maintain women’s subordination in all spheres. This is relatively clear in the energy sector where women’s access to and control over energy services are severely curtailed by their structural position in society.

Gender does not displace other societal constructions such as race and class and age and culture (and indeed race must be acknowledged the primary principle in resource access in South Africa). I submit that we need to be more conscious of the ways in which power can be shifted in our everyday relations in order to make strategic and conscious interventions to change these.

Let’s look at how this applies to the energy sector.
The way the society, and in this case particularly the energy sector is organised means that women
and men have different access to and control over energy resources. The asymmetrical power relations between men and women are evident through a quick glance at who owns the big power generators, who works in them, who the nuclear physicists are and who runs the nuclear power stations, who owns the oil fields and oil companies and who does the drilling and negotiates the world and local trade agreements. The gender division of labour means that men are the owners and producers of energy services and that there are very few women in any of these powerful positions in either developed or developing countries.

The domestic sector accounts for the highest percentage of energy use in many developing countries and should logically receive significant attention in policy making and investment. Attention to biofuels and kerosene (the ‘fuels of the poor’) should be high on the agenda of developing countries policy agendas. But this has not been the case. Commercial and industrial interests receive attention of governments and investment of large institutions such as the International Monetary Fund while the domestic sector receives attention from the donor community and Non-Governmental Organisations. For a variety of reasons women have little control over or negotiating power in relation to pricing, production or convenience of the energy services they require. Men, traditionally working in more public and high profile spheres, make these decisions, seldom occupying themselves with mundane domestic matters.

If, however, one looks at who performs the key daily reproductive and productive services, essential for maintaining the male workforce and enabling them to do their work each day, this task falls to the women of the world, and in developing countries this division of labour is more marked and visible than in the developed countries. Women’s roles and responsibilities include cooking, cleaning, washing and caring for children, the sick and the elderly, growing food for consumption and for sale as well as producing crafts for barter or profit. Energy, in one form or another, is necessary for the fulfilment of almost all these tasks, and underpins numerous activities in women’s every day lives. Even when they are unemployed, men seldom concern themselves with ‘women’s work’ which has low social status and little commercial value.

Women are not a homogenous group and do not share the same experiences of subordination or domesticity. Some of the differences in experience are most obvious in the practicalities of providing cooked food and hot water for members of the household on a day-to-day basis. This is not an issue in the lives of middle-class women whose access to electricity permits a seamless range of activities. At the flick of a switch, there is electric lighting, hot water in the geyser, a meal cooked in a microwave, a computer turned off in favour of a television programme. A few finger movements and a car starts
or a friend answers a phone. Any other energy needed, be it avgas for private aeroplanes, petrol for cars, candles for ambience, gas or charcoal for barbecuing is as readily available as electricity, through an efficient systems of suppliers and distributors.

This is not the case for poor women who constitute the majority in the developing world. Despite the ratification of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) in 1979 by the UN General Assembly, gender disparities continue to be perpetuated. Poor women in developing countries have fewer choices than their wealthier counterparts, are more likely to be entrenched in conservative practices and relationships, are likely to depend on biomass and hydro-carbon fuels and have few options for relief. Improving poor women’s access to energy services is a necessary component of social and economic development and is important for all developing countries. Changing the structural relations of gender and power that keep women poor and subservient is a great deal more difficult, but, just as necessary for the achievement of a more just and equitable society.

Women were not always part of development thinking, and just as they gradually came to be included in development sectors such as water and health, so they came to be tacked onto energy for development projects when it was noticed and argued that some projects failed or would work better if women were included. ‘Women and energy’ applied to projects, policies or market institutions has meant targeting women for welfare, basic needs, and inclusion in male-dominated structures in terms of principles of equity. ‘Gender and energy’ has meant targeting women while taking into account what men think, usually in order to improve economic efficiency. Skutsch (1998: 948) explains the efficiency approach thus:

Awareness that men and women have different perspectives, needs and constraints can lead to a better fit of project intervention with the ‘clients’ and thus greater management efficiency in terms of delivery. Gender here is being used in an instrumental sense, essentially to raise the internal rate of return of the project.

Gender and energy terminology may also be used in the context of ‘empowering women’. Empowerment, supposedly an activity aimed at building capacity and self-esteem with the aim of challenging the gender status quo (Moser 1993:3-4), is too often understood in economic terms, or more baldly in the energy sector, energy-linked income-generating projects and policies. The problem is how does one address women’s subordinate position through development initiatives? Gender relations are complicated and funders are reluctant to get involved in forms of empowerment other than economic. All interventions cause shifts and disruptions – that is what they are designed to do, but some are less fearfully made than others. At a seminar on women and development a woman from
the Zimbabwean Resource Centre said:

In retrospect, I think donors did not want to deal with the 'hardware' of women's issues and preferred to remain darlings of the Government by capitalising on so-called income-generating projects which never generated any income. Issues of power and control were sidelined as non-issues or cultural issues (Agenda 1997).

The Women in Energy Ministers' Conference held in Durban in December 2000 was an opportunity to tackle the 'hardware' issues – along with donors, governments, business people, academics and development project participants. I argued:

As long as we describe domestic tasks as women's roles and attempt only to ameliorate poor women's burdens and not shift or share them, we will not meet our CEDAW obligations. There are men who collect wood for domestic use – let this be a custom which spreads. There are men who prepare food and cook over a fire or paraffin, or with electricity – let them be the models for the future. In South Africa the men in the Department of Minerals and Energy have signed a unique Pledge to end discrimination at home and in the workplace as a first step towards eliminating gender inequities in the sector. In Uganda interventions that would target poor rural women and make a difference to their energy needs have been suggested by the Honourable Minister (Bbumba 2000) and are due for implementation. Let these shining examples persuade all men and women that taking the right action is also taking the best action for all Africa's people.

**Globalisation**: the rise of a transnational economy with open borders and the impact on the energy sector in developing countries with a focus on poor women

Canaan was an illegal shack settlement in the city of Durban whose name belied the conditions of squalor. One afternoon in 1991 the committee from Canaan was invited to a meeting with the Mayor of Pinetown at the Pinetown municipal offices. The mayor sat at the head of the board room table in the ornately carved mayoral chair, flanked on his right by men in suits. The shack dwellers sat down the left side of the table in clothes newly washed in water from the storm water drain at the bottom of the land they had settled on. They accepted the offer of tea in china cups and sat, with their nervously twisting hands discreetly under the table, waiting. The group as a whole looked quiet, composed, and ready for business. The Mayor was in a genial mood. The Canaan settlement was being threatened with forced removal and the mayor's purpose was to offer land in the Marianridge area. He opened the meeting with every intention of making the Canaan Committee feel welcome in the plush Pinetown parlours. He smiled affably and, speaking slowly and deliberately, said: "I have an
aeroplane. I fly over you and your families in the bush at Canaan at least once a week on my way to Lanseria Airport. I come in low over the hill and can see where you live so I understand the conditions that you live in..."

The meeting in the mayor’s parlour reached a stalemated, then disintegrated. The Canaan Committee trailed out into the parking lot where they watched the mayor, less affable by then, jump into a sports car and race off to his next appointment. The shack dwellers hailed taxis to take them home, and while they waited, bemoaned the fact that they had missed prime tipping time at the dump and would have to buy food and paraffin at the spaza which they could ill afford. They debated whether it was worth being on the committee for the hot tea with milk and sugar and being able to use the toilets at the mayor’s parlour, and how they would be criticised for bringing no good news. As daylight faded the taxis dropped them back into their twilight world, where women carrying water were just visible through the acrid smoke which rose from the wood fires and mingled with the smell of paraffin burning and people peeing in the path. The Canaan Committee wondered aloud whether the authorities would ever understand their living conditions, and whether there would ever be any recognition of rights to services such as water, housing and electricity (Annecke 1997)

Whenever anyone says “market forces” I envisage a bogey man (sic) somewhere up high with omnipotent powers -- and for me the mayor of Pinetown with his view from the sky has come to embody the forces of globalisation: pervasive without being penetrating, uni-dimensional rather than insightful. His view did not understand the history or the context and his position convinced him that what he wanted was what was best for others.

The global imperatives which have compelled the liberalisation and privatisation of the electricity utility in South Africa are somewhat akin to the mayor’s perspective, ignorant of the historical, bent on divorcing the people from their structure, pervasive and homogenising. Wolfgang Sachs (2000:12) puts it better than I ever could:

The creation of a global competitive arena requires efforts for not only a quantitative expansion but also a qualitative restructuring. ... there is no other way for would-be globalizers than to dismantle the national regulatory apparatuses that have previously encompassed economic activity. These apparatuses, which generally reflect a country’s historical experiences, social sets of interests and political ideals, combine the logic of economics with other social priorities, in both fragile compromises and institutions built to last. At a later stage of the secular process that Karl Polanyi called ‘disembedding’, the dynamic of economic globalisation is intended to release market relations from the web of national norms and standards and to bring them under the law of worldwide competition. Whatever these norms cover – labour conditions, regional planning or environmental planning – they are neither wrong nor right but are seen as obstructing entry into the global competitive arena.
The forces of globalisation have not been kind to the energy sector – or at least not to low-income consumers of energy for domestic purposes. Many African countries are rich in energy resources or potential, hydro-power, oil, coal and gas, while most others have the potential to harness solar, biogas and wind. The problem is many of these resources are owned by foreign multinationals or ‘rented’ from the World Bank and few of the citizens of Africa benefit from them. Those who due are generally urban-based and better-off. Electricity reaches only 30% of the African population, kerosene and gas are usually imported and subject to the oil price fluctuations, and most women in Africa are affected by fuelwood scarcity. If you are poor then the energy service available depends a great deal on spatial location, urban or rural, legal or illegal. In South Africa if you have tenure you are 87% likely to have an electricity connection doesn’t mean you can afford to use it. Paraffin, LPGas and candles are standard, but it is socially unacceptable to be so poor that you cook on wood – except for special occasions. Thus is the power of universal status symbols.

Using South Africa as a case study, the effects of globalisation at the macro level have been intensified by a number of simultaneous demands including those for transparency, restructuring, accelerated electrification and the inclusion of environmental costs in the electricity tariff. The new dispensation required that the highly secretive and self-sufficient energy sector open itself to scrutiny at the same time as the accelerated national electrification programme got underway. Pressure for the liberalisation of the electricity supply industry and the introduction of competition begun to mount at the same time as the climate change negotiations and green house gas mitigation became international concerns. These different global concerns have produced new set of challenges. On the one hand pressures to restructure have threatened the capacity to deliver and subsidise new household connections (Barbeton 1998). On the other hand global concerns with CO2 emissions indicate that the current inadequate environmental safeguards will have to be addressed, in all likelihood through a tariff hike. In both cases the poor suffer the consequences.

As Sachs (2000:12) pointed out, deregulation is a bland phrase “for attempts to further global competition by dissolving links between economic actors and a particular place or a particular community”, severing these links could not have come at a worse time for the poor in South Africa. Where previously the political order (disorder) of apartheid acted to exclude them from the utility’s operations, now the new economic order acts on the utility to prevent the poor from benefiting from the expertise of the monopoly. That the giant parastatal was due for restructuring and an overhaul is not the issue, the question is the timing and the impact of this restructuring. There is what Wolfgang Sachs (2000:5) calls a “Utopian energy” working to create
a global arena for economic competition in which only efficiency counts, unfettered and undistorted by any special local conditions or structures.... There should be no blocking, weakening or interfering with market forces, because that leads to efficiency losses and sub-optimal welfare.

Is it co-incidental that it should affect the economy in South Africa just as it was the turn of the poor to be served?

By the 1990s the electricity industry had been operating profitably for almost a hundred years, albeit serving commerce and industry and only ten percent of the population. The national electricity utility Eskom had established itself as one of the largest utilities in the world responsible for generating, transmitting and distributing exceptionally cheap electricity. It was able to do this by building power stations designed to use the abundant low-grade coal produced in South Africa with little thought given including environmental or social costs in the tariff. This huge and profitable monopoly was well suited to the task of rolling out the grid to those previously bypassed. In 1991 only 30% of the households in South Africa were electrified, but by the turn of the century over 2.5 million domestic connections had been made, bringing the number of electrified households to about 67% (Marquard and Eberhard 2000:5). Financially robust and non-tax paying, Eskom was able to supply heavily subsidised connections at a nominal cost to the new consumers and to cross-subsidise low-consumption customers from high consumption ones (Davis1997:100). Until the end of 1997 it looked as if the ANC’s election promise of ‘electricity for all’ might be kept. But different pressures began to take their toll, and the 1998 White Paper on Energy Policy promised energy rather than electricity for all.

The pressure to deregulate has been significant but there were also miscalculations within the industry which have worked to the disadvantage of the poor. The first of these arose out of an incorrect assumption about uptake. Eskom anticipated an average consumption rate of 300 kWh per month, whereas the actual uptake has been about 80 kWh – an amount which fails to deliver a sustainable rate of return (Davis1997:100). Potential new consumers could have predicted their consumption patterns more accurately than the computer models: When questioned closely about what they thought they could afford or would be prepared to pay for electricity, most of the women at Canaan believed that having electricity would reduce their expenditure on multiple fuels. They said they were willing to pay between R20 and R30 per month which is close to what has been the case, but just more that a quarter of what planners anticipated (NER, 1996). Had the planners consulted more widely on this issue, the electrification programme might have been designed quite differently to accommodate low levels of recovery. A second miscalculation could have worked to the advantage of the poor: A
consequence of skills-enhancement, experience, regional competition and technological advances has been that instead of the cost per connection rising as it was assumed would be the case when higher-cost, more remote areas were reached, (Davis 1997:100), Eskom has stabilised its connection costs at around R4000 per household – less than it costs to supply and install an energization package (a solar home system and LPGas combination). But just as it has achieved this remarkable feat, Eskom finds itself in the throes of restructuring and handing over major responsibility for the continuation of the electrification process to the new Regional Electricity Distributors (REDs), the details of which are yet to be made known, and the poor are unlikely to benefit (Keswell-Burns 1998).

If the point of market liberalization is to ensure, through the selective power of competition, that capital, labour, intelligence and even natural resources are everywhere deployed in the most efficient manner (Sachs 200:8) then efficient must be questioned for its moral vacuousness.

At the local level the break-up of the utility has translated into a slowing of the electrification programme, uncertainty about jobs and a lack of information about how the electrification/energisation subsidies will operate - who will get them and how. In a country where the unemployment rate is over 50% in some areas, half the population live in poverty and the HIV/AIDS epidemic is taking its toll, it seem short-sighted to lay workers off there is still work to do. Handing over to the REDs who have neither the experience nor the infrastructure in place, and when the channels for subsidies have not been concluded is only going to exacerbate the problem. In industry-speak “the cherries have been picked”, that is the easy and affordable connections have been made, and the government has announced that 20 kWh of electricity and 6 kilolitres of water will be given free to all those connected. It is unclear how this is to be done, or what will happen to those not yet connected, the poorest of the poor, those in remote rural areas and those without tenure in urban areas.

There is a theme within globalisation that I would like to touch on because it is going to impact on the ability of poor women to fulfil their domestic tasks and in particular those requiring energy. It is climate change. Globalisation has meant opening the markets to trade so that the world is conceived as a single huge market place (Sachs 200:5). Anything can and will be traded, commodities, children and emissions. I want to spend just a short time bring to your attention what climate change and the trade in emissions might mean to the energy sources of women in developing countries.

Energy plays a double edged role in climate change. On the one hand, over-consumption of energy sources - primarily the inefficient and prolific combustion of fossil fuels - confirms the status of
energy as the primary culprit in producing the emissions that lead to climate change. On the other hand, everybody requires some energy every day to fulfil their everyday needs, and under-utilisation of energy through lack of availability or affordability leads to a variety of problems including health hazards. Suffice it to say that the north, or developed countries produce an ‘unfair share’ of the world’s emissions. The World Council of Churches provides an insightful analysis of the bias of the Kyoto Protocol which disadvantages developing countries (2000). In developed countries the issue is the impact of energy use on climate change, whereas in developing countries the issue is the impact of climate change on energy services.

According to the IPCC 2001 reports Africa should prepare for increased aridity, increase air temperatures, decreased runoff and increased climate ‘events’ such as droughts, floods and high winds. Changes in each of the vulnerable sectors: agriculture, bio-diversity, human health, forestry, ranging, and water are going to affect women’s access to bio-mass and ability to farm, and since women are the farmers in Africa, the responsibility is going to be doubly theirs, as is disaster management. Although as von Kotze (1995:26) points out, disaster responses invariably take the form of a male-dominated operations in terms of airlifts, truckloads of food, tents and first aid rather than engaging in disaster management planning which should address root causes and facilitate prevention.

Two examples of sector changes which will affect women may suffice:

1. In the agricultural sector an example of how growers could adapt to aridity would be to replace maize with sorgham. Maize is a staple of many countries, but more than that maize cobs provide fuel where wood is scarce and they also serve as candles in areas where cash and wax candles are scarce: women drip animal fat into maize cobs to provide their households with adequate light. Replacing one crop with another may have multiple unexpected consequences.

2. Increased air temperature is likely to have an adverse affect on urban as well as rural dwellers. Kerosene and candles are blamed for the regular and devastating occurrence of fires in shack settlements in urban areas, the concomitant loss of possessions and the stress of rebuilding homes. Most of the responsibility falls on women, who, in the absence of formal housing and electricity, must use open flames indoors for cooking and lighting. High winds will exacerbate the hazard which in Cape Town alone is responsible for up to three hundred shacks being burned each month.

Extreme conditions cause by climate change impact on the energy sector at a macro-scale too. Hydro-
power and electricity distribution networks are especially vulnerable to the flooding and silting of rivers and dams as has been the recent experience in Mozambique, Malawi and the northern parts of South Africa. In Kenya the electricity supply has been adversely affected by the drought. While the petroleum sector may appear to be immune from climate change, indirect impacts will be felt by developing countries. In Africa Nigeria and Angola have substantial oil reserves and South Africa manufactures some synthetic fuels from coal, but most developing countries import the petroleum products they require. Any changes in energy requirements (such as power failures) which increase the demand for petroleum imports is likely to impact negatively on developing countries balance of payments and economies. At the local level petroleum products are likely to be more expensive than electricity or bio-fuels. If there is insufficient electricity or bio-fuel supplies to meet the demand (through gradual climate change or disasters) and consumers are forced to buy imported kerosene and related products for their daily use, this will put a further strain on already over-burdened domestic budgets. (Annecke 2001)

Suggestions and Conclusion

My suggestions and conclusions are quite short. They are that each one of us can either ignore what is wrong or act, in whatever way, large or small, towards what is right. The best way to act is in as informed way as possible. Saying this to groups such as this in spaces that you have created precisely for such exchange is intended not as ignorance, but as gratitude, congratulations and a plea to go on spreading the word – through your students, colleagues, family, and friends, for I do believe that each person who learns about poverty, energy, development, gender and globalisation and acts – to understand, to analyse, to discuss, to re-cycle, to visit, to put a personal limit on ‘your’ emissions, to contribute financially or to exchange, to protest… whatever you do will be worthwhile.

Last year Dr Joy Clancy and Dr Margaret Skutch arranged an excellent workshop and meeting for the members of Energia (the international network for women working in the energy sector). Knowing as much as we do about energy poverty and the increased hardship it causes women, they posed the question – what would be the best way of addressing this energy poverty through policy, projects or the market? As a group we were recalcitrant in answering the question, but it is an excellent one. It wont be policy which delivers – we’ve seen excellent policy lie dormant while the resources, political will and capacity to implement it dwindle. It wont be projects – there are too few projects doing too many different things and seldom benefiting women in the long run. Those that do are, for a variety of reasons seldom replicable. It certainly wont be markets unless it is through intervention in them. But it will be through a combination of these, so there is scope to work with direction and dedication in any
of these. Solutions may also include:

- Lobbying to persuade men and women that everybody will benefit from doing the right thing for poor women is important, and the right thing may be to implement CEDAW, to allocate fiscal resources to women, to protect forests, to enforce good labour practices....

- Capacity building is already happening through women’s energy groups networking in Africa and internationally, but as the distances between global players decrease through the internet and cyber-money, so the distances between those playing and those excluded increase, so there can never be enough. This would include increasing the number of technically skilled women and women in decision-making positions.

- Valuing local knowledge (rather than myths or nostalgia). A workshop on Women and Sustainable Energy in Africa was held in Nairobi in March 2000 and hosted by the international Women and Energy network, Energia, ELCI and UNIFEM. This workshop demonstrated the substantial contribution that local women are making to solving their problems and the considerable insight, innovation and experience they bring to bear on the subject. Such initiatives should be supported and encouraged.

- Question global trends which advocate overwhelming commitment to the self, and prioritise efficiency.

In conclusion I draw attention to the structural changes which also have to be worked on. While it is true to say that in South Africa the number of women in all sub-sectors of energy has increased since 1990, there is no room for complacency. Generally solutions to what are seen as ‘women’s energy issues’ (the burden of biomass use and energy poverty), have been presented in terms of ways to alleviate the domestic burden or ameliorate energy poverty. Technologies such as efficient wood-stoves, solar cookers, safety caps for paraffin bottles, and even the electrification programmes have been offered as ways to alleviate women’s responsibilities. Little attention has been paid as to why women as a social category should bear the burden, or how the burden could be shared more equally. Technical solutions may ameliorate the problem, but they cannot provide long-term resolution to a structural problem of subordination. In South Africa’s prominence is given to the notion of human rights, and gender equity is perceived to be a human right, but there is a long hard road ahead before this is achieved. Research and development funding is still largely skewed in favour of industry and technology development, including nuclear energy, while planning, implementation and capacity
building for the poor lags behind. The majority of South African women, who are also the majority of the poor, still do not have access to, or cannot afford, the energy services they require on a daily basis, and are a long way from achieving equity with the privileged proportion of the population. (Annecke 2000)

References – gender, energy, poverty, development and globalisation

Agenda No 34, 1997 pp80-88
Annecke W 1997. Assistance to NREL regarding the non-economic determinants of energy use in rural areas of South Africa. Energy and Development Research Centre, University of Cape Town, South Africa
Annecke W 2000. Women and energy in South Africa in Energy for Sustainable Development Vol IV No 4 Special Issue on South Africa pp44-47
Annecke W 2001. Gender and climate change: the energy-related social impacts submitted to the IJGE
Barbenton C 1998 Restructuring the electricity distribution industry: an analysis of the proposed ownership and governance structures of regional electricity distributors. Development Southern Africa Vol 15 No 3 pp323-343
Davis M 1997 Financial analysis of the electrification programme. Development Southern Africa Vol 14 No 1 pp97-120
Davis M & Ward S 1995. Household energy-use patterns in rural areas: The effects of access to electricity. Energy and Development Research Centre, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa


Kiker GA (compiler) 2000. Draft South African County Study on Climate Change: Synthesis Report for the Vulnerability and Adaptation Assessment Section, School of Bioresources Engineering and Environmental Hydrology, University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg

Marquard, A. 1999. Making a difference: Reflections on the first ten years of the Energy and Development Research Centre at the University of Cape Town. EDRC occasional paper, Energy and Development Research Centre, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa

Marquard M & Eberhard A 2000 Towards energy equity, efficiency and environmental sustainability in South Africa: policy challenges. Introduction to Energy for Sustainable Development Vol IV No 4 Special issue on South Africa pp3-7

McKie L, Bowlby S & Gregory S (eds) Gender, power and the household. Macmillan, London


National Electricity Regulator 1996. Lighting up South Africa. Johannesburg


Skutsch, Margaret. 1998. The gender issue in energy project planning: welfare, empowerment or efficiency?" in Energy Policy, 26 (12): 945-955

Tinker I 1982. Women and energy and development. Equity Policy Centre, Washington DC

UN Inter-governmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) statement that the effects of climate change


Von Kotze A 1996. Why disasters are a gender issue in Agenda No 29 pp22-26

World Council of Churches (WCC) www.christian-aid.org The earth’s atmosphere – responsible caring and equitable sharing for a global commons. A justice statement regarding Climate Change, Summary from The Kyoto Climate Fraud - What’s wrong with the Kyoto Protocol?
Gender Mainstreaming in International Research Organisations:
the European Dimension

Charlotte Martin
for the KIT Gender Team, Royal Tropical Institute (KIT), Linnaeusstraat 35f, PO Box 95001, 1090 HA Amsterdam, The Netherlands, e-mail: www.kit.nl/gender, C.Martin@kit.nl

Contents:

1. Introduction and Context of the Study
2. EU Research Context
   a) Fifth Framework Programme
   b) The INCO Programme
3. Conceptual Approach to the Study
   b) Frameworks for Analysis:
      i) transformative approach
      ii) elements of a transformative approach
      iii) Institutional Framework
4. Status of Gender Mainstreaming in INCO: an assessment
5. Summary and Conclusions
   a) Findings
   b) Our Framework

Annexen

Bibliography

Tables:
Table 1: The activity areas in the INCO programme and share of overall budget.
Table 2: Elements of a transformative approach
Table 3: Building on the institutional analysis of the OECD/DAC framework to research
Table 4: Adapting the OECD/Framework for the study
1. Introduction and Context of the Study

- In early 2000 the EC commissioned ‘gender impact studies’ from eight different contractors in order to assess all parts of the EC’s Fifth Framework Programme (FP5), and to make available data that would help in designing future policies.
- The FP5 deals with scientific and technical research and runs from 1998-2002.
- The gender initiative arose out of the adoption of a communication on, ‘Women and science: mobilising women to enrich European research’ adopted in 1999, and the work was carried out for the ‘Women and Science Unit’, in the EC.
- KIT (Royal Tropical Institute) was commissioned to work on the study for the INCO programme, ‘Confirming the International Role of Community Research’.
- The KIT Gender Team works on all aspects of gender and development within an international context, and has worked for the EC before (DG8) on gender mainstreaming issues.

This presentation will focus on both our methodology and the main findings of the research on the status of gender mainstreaming in INCO. There are clear links into the themes of the conference and the concerns raised yesterday, particularly in relation to issues of methodology and partnership.

2. EU Research Context

a) Fifth Framework Programme

- A major focus of the FP5 is a concern to ensure that the EU is at the cutting edge of scientific advances and thus able to compete with the rest of the world. This is seen as vital in terms of the economy and employment for member countries.
- In terms of gender – there is a specific commitment to integrating women into the FP5 and the commissioned studies are part of this – a 40% target for the integration of women into all areas of research and procedures has been made.
- This approach is consistent with the overriding concern of the FP5 with a shortage of scientific talent and the need to bring women into research and keep them there.
- Several reports e.g. ETAN report on ‘Science Policies in the European Union’ (2000) and its follow ups, provide ample evidence of the difficulties women face in European scientific research and the ‘leaky pipe’ of qualified women leaving the field.
- The approach taken in documentation, including the Fifth Framework Programme itself, goes further than simply an Equal Opportunities approach and recognises the need to ensure that research meets the needs of all citizens and contributes to the understanding of gender relevant issues.
- The need to move beyond Equal Opportunities and to promote gender-relevant research is therefore acknowledged, although some argue that this is not reflected in the FP5 itself.
- For example the Dossier on the FP5 compiled by WISE (Women’s International Studies Europe) (Hoogland:1999) clearly states that, “a true integration of gender will affect the ways in which scientific knowledge is produced, the methodologies involved and the theoretical reflections to which such new modes of knowledge give rise”.
- In other words a transformation in science and learning will take place if gender relevant research is carried out. Gender cannot simply be ‘added on’ to existing paradigms.

b) The INCO Programme

- This is one of three horizontal programmes i.e. not on a particular theme or area (eg. energy or life science etc), but rather designed to compliment other programmes
- There are five distinct activity areas which are arranged on a geographic basis. As you can see, the budget of the INCO-Dev; NIS and CEBC countries and INCO-Med programmes form the largest part of the INCO programme. (see Table 1)
- The INCO programme is distinguished from the other research programmes in the FP5 by its international dimension and in fact the bulk of its funding goes to countries which outside Europe
- The INCO programme is therefore very important in terms of ‘development’ initiatives as it provides the only funding possibility within the FP5 for most developing countries doing research in science and technology.
- Issues of partnership as well as gender were therefore considered in some depth in our study.

3. Our Conceptual Approach

We were required by the terms of our contract to write four papers, the first of which had to include recommendations on priority issues and the approach for the study. The middle two papers were to look at the implementation of the programme in terms of the EU structure and programme and the partners and funding issues. The fourth paper is a synthesis paper which lays out the main findings and makes recommendations.
The first and last papers will be in the public domain and this talk draws on them: First we will look at the work done for the background study (Working Paper 1) and then I will report on our main findings (Working Paper 4)

a) WP1: Background and State of the Art

We had two aims: to develop a conceptual framework that we could use to make our analysis and to provide a contextual analysis of research in science and technology that was relevant to the developing world.

We sought to learn from both theory and practice. We looked at the relevant gender literature in the following areas.

1. **Academic literature**: in the areas of gender analysis frameworks, science, knowledge production and research issues

2. **Current practice** in institutions involved in carrying out and funding international research: a range of multi-lateral, bi-lateral and non-governmental organisations


**Academic literature** Here we chose to look at feminist and post colonial approaches to research and the production of knowledge. These approaches take as their starting point the idea that knowledge and its production is not ‘neutral’ and value free in the way that has been assumed in mainstream science and social science.

They point to the need for a shift in the whole way in which research is done to include the perspectives of minority groups and to give differing types of knowledge production some consideration and validity. For example to include a consideration of indigenous medicine and holistic approaches to health in health programmes.

The development literature shows that such approaches (i.e. those that include people and the local context in their design) are likely to be the most cost effective and successful.

**Current practice** We did some primary research into various institutions (multi-lateral, bi-lateral and
activist in partner countries) in order to learn from existing practice.

We focused on the areas in which we knew that there had been good practice. In effect this meant the institutions that had extensive partner links; that had recognised the need for a gender perspective of some kind and were involved in science/technology research.

We found that the approaches that were most likely to be effective in gender mainstreaming were those that took people (as actors and beneficiaries etc) as their starting point rather than technocratic considerations. This led to effective partnerships and problem solving approaches between donors and beneficiaries.

The practical experience of institutions involved in international cooperation and research led to the identification of three main models of practice:

*Dynamic*: where there is an understanding of the need for change and work on organisational development

*Static*: where the need for gender mainstreaming and redressing gender inequalities through a women and development approach has been recognised, but where the focus on Equal Opportunities does not impact on the institutional analysis, nor at the conceptual level

*Isolated*: this is an historical approach which uses a women and development analysis to fund ad hoc research and ‘adds on’ women and development units or personnel to existing practices.

*Past gender assessments* These were principally the ETAN and WISE reports that I mentioned above. These indicated that the EC was still at a rather early stage in the implementation of gender policies i.e. concentrating on Equal Opportunities rather than gender issues.

b) Frameworks for analysis

i) A transformative gender approach

There were similar lessons coming from theory, practice and existing assessments. Taken together they raised a comprehensive set of issues concerning women and science, and the international dimensions to gender integration in research.
They also pointed to the conclusion that effective gender mainstreaming, (or to borrow the approach of the EC itself) “research by, for and about women”, (Women and Science Feb 1999) is most likely to take place within a ‘transformative’ gender approach.

A transformative approach can be defined as one where we seek to go beyond integrating gender issues into the existing policy agenda and rather aim to transform the agenda and broaden its goals to enable us to address issues of social justice. (Kabeer 1999: 34)

ii) Elements of a ‘transformative’ approach
Taking the examples from practice we identified a transformative approach as having the following characteristics.
(see bullet points in Table 2)

A transformative approach needs to be holistic: i.e. actions at all levels – conceptual, institutional and implementing; work together to inform practice. We define these concepts below.

The conceptual understanding informs at two levels, that of the 5th Framework in general, and the ‘international cooperation’ (INCO) programme in particular. It raises issues concerning the nature of cooperation, the quality of partnerships and forms of participation. It also provides a framework for questioning the assumptions and criteria of the specific work programme.

The organisational analysis looks at people, processes and procedures. It incorporates both analytical tools, and the experiences of other agencies.

The implementation analysis draws on project level analytical tools, to provide a framework for assessing the project portfolio.

Many other approaches tend to focus change on only one or two levels, often missing the need to address the conceptual basis of women, science and research.

iii) Institutional Frameworks: Choice of OECD/DAC
Having identified the elements that were central to a transformative approach in gender and scientific research we then needed an analytical framework for the study.

It had to be able to provide the following features
i) bridge research, and hence work on knowledge
ii) analyse institutions at all levels, conceptual, institutional and implementing
iii) provide entry points and create space for gender mainstreaming
iv) provide recommendations for methodologies that can translate the analysis into changes in practice.

The OECD/DAC Framework (1998b) provides the most useful starting point for building such a framework as it is flexible and was developed as part of an understanding of the need to take a transformative approach.

The framework was adapted to take into account the specificities of the study, and the need to analyse the donor organisation, the development cooperation/research funding mechanism, and the research partners. The key levels of analysis in this framework are listed below and elaborated in Table 3 (left hand side)
i) External environment and pressures
ii) Policy, mandate and area of work
iii) Organisational history and culture
iv) Organisational routines and procedures
v) People and positions – current personnel
vi) Activities
vii) Resources

When we put the modified OECD framework together with our transformative concepts we come up with the following table (see Table 3)

We then divided the focus of the work between the three remaining working papers i.e. Working Papers 2,3, and 4. (see Table 4)

4. Status of Gender Mainstreaming in INCO – an assessment

The following findings are taken from our synthesis paper i.e. Working Paper 4.

- Gender equality in terms of equal opportunity for women and men is reflected and clearly understood in terms of the promotion of women on various structures/bodies, panels of evaluators etc. and the policy of equal opportunities is reflected in many of the
procedures.

- Attempts to mainstream gender in INCO are relatively recent, and while the relevance of gender is mentioned in some policy documents it is not yet systematically reflected in all related procedures and processes of the institution.

- As concerns the monitoring and evaluation of implementation of the proposals, there are currently no criteria or instructions for the monitoring of gender indicators and gender-aware monitoring is thus dependent on the individual gender competence of the officials concerned.

- The fact that gender mainstreaming is a strategy to reach gender equality goals (rather than a goal in itself) is not widely understood within INCO and it tends to be seen as an aim in itself.

- There is some confusion as to the operational implications of committing to a mainstreaming strategy. This is to be expected given the relatively early stage at which the process is within the Fifth Framework Programme generally and also within INCO.

- This is combined with the fact that there has not yet been any initiative to build gender competence among INCO staff through staff development of men and women programme officials.

- Partnerships are conceived of in a rather narrow way and partners do not really have a say in the setting of priorities for the programme. This is particularly the case for less developed countries that have weak regional links to research organisations and civil society.

- Capacity building is not part of the INCO remit – this belongs to the development programmes (DG) and relies on links between the particular development programmes and the corresponding geographical sectors of the INCO programme. The links made are personal ones and dependant on the individuals involved rather than institutional ones.

5. Summary and Conclusions

a) Findings

- Gender mainstreaming has yet to take place within INCO although it is possible to clearly see possible entry points. Some good work is being done by interested and committed individuals – despite a lack of training and information for staff.

- The emphasis within the INCO programme and the Fifth Framework Programme generally, is on obtaining the tools to do gender mainstreaming i.e. fitting gender into existing paradigms. There is in any case, little opportunity at programme level to change
the perception of knowledge production which underpins the current programme.

- In making suggestions for gender mainstreaming in this context we structured our recommendations around short, medium and long term measures, so as to cater to the needs of the current staff and also the changing situation in the EC and this area of research programming.

- It should be noted for example that the international dimension to research will be differently conceived in the 6th Framework Programme and there are fears that it will lose its distinct character.

b) Our Framework

- Our framework worked well for us in the course of doing the work as it was flexible and comprehensive.

- It seems that developing one’s own framework based on concepts and ideas current in the field of academia and practice is a necessary strategy as it is then relevant and individual to the work being undertaken.

Bibliography


Hoogland, R.C (1999) Gender and/or European Research R.C Hoogland in cooperation with M van der Steen. Amsterdam: WISE (Women’s International Studies Europe)


Work Programme Confirming the International Role of Community Research Fifth Framework Programme, Brussels: European Union
Table 1: The Activity Areas in the INCO Programme and share of overall budget.

A1. Pre-Accession Countries: 5.5% of budget

A2. New Independent States (NIS) and Central and Eastern European Countries (CEEC's): 23.6%

A3. Mediterranean Partner Countries: 11.5%

A4. Developing Countries: 44.2%

A5. Emerging Economy and Industrialised Countries: 1%

B1. Bursaries for Young Researchers: 3.2%

B2. Fellowships for EC researchers to Japan
Table 2: Elements of a transformative approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conceptual Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• An interaction between knowledge, gender and science that leads to transformation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Recognition of subjectivity and situated knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gender as linked to the agenda setting of all organisations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutional Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Gender analysis is proactive as well as reactive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• There is gender balance in personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gender mainstreaming infrastructure has become internalised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The complexity of institutional dimensions are understood and reflected upon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Institutional learning is related to structures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• There is decentralised power and resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Regional and external partnerships are valued and respected</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementing Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• There is both commissioned and responsive funding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• There is multi-disciplinary research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The three levels of analysis - conceptual, institutional and implementing - are linked</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A non-essentialist approach is adopted that recognises gender, age, ethnicity, class and race</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Partnership links are perceived as mutually beneficial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Local initiatives influence concepts and processes and there are local indigenous criteria in monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The justification for funding includes not only effectiveness, sustainability and efficiency arguments but also autonomy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3: Building on the institutional analysis of the OECD/DAC framework to research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>External environment and pressures</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- general political environment, and space for manoeuvre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy, mandate and area of work</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- policy on research, and gender integration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organisational history and culture</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- informal rules that guide the functioning of the institution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How the institution itself is viewed, the dominant and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>understandings of the goals and priorities and the working</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>methods needed to achieve them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- People’s understanding and knowledge, the personal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>opinions and beliefs of the actors involved.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Organisational routines and procedures**                     |
| - The structures of the organisation and channels of          |
| decision making                                              |
| - Formal rules                                               |
| - Divisions of responsibility                                |
| - Practices and procedures                                   |
| **People and positions – current personnel**                  |
| - people within their official positions in the organisation,|
| including age, background and perspective                     |

| **Activities**                                                |
| - cover the different tasks and actions undertaken under the |
| 5th Framework Programme, ‘Confirming the Role of             |
| International Research’                                       |
| **Resources**                                                 |
| - both human and financial                                    |

| **Conceptual**                                                |
| Transformation                                               |
| Empowerment                                                  |
| Located analysis                                             |
| Inter-disciplinarity                                         |
| Political understanding                                      |
| GAD approach                                                 |

| **Institutional**                                             |
| Social change process                                        |
| Reflexivity                                                  |
| Multi-disciplinarity                                         |
| Gender Mainstreaming                                          |
| Institutional learning                                       |
| Networks/partnerships                                        |
| Equal opportunities                                          |

| **Implementing**                                               |
| Interactive research                                          |
| Commissioned and responsive funding                          |
| Local initiatives                                            |
| Partnerships                                                 |
| Gender resources and activities                               |
| Learning cycle                                               |
|-------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|
| **External environment and pressures**                      | Conceptual                               | Conception and gender bias of policies and   | Conception and gender bias of partnerships    |
| Policy, mandate and area of work                            | Political                                | organisation of work programme              |                                              |
| Organisational history and culture                          | understanding GAD                        |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | approach                                 |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Located analysis                         |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Inter-disciplinarity                      |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Transformation                           |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Empowerment                               |                                              |                                              |
| **Organisational routines and procedures**                  | Institutional                             |                                              |                                              |
| People and positions – current personnel                    | Gender                                   | People, committees                          |                                              |
|                                                             | mainstreaming Equal                      | structures, procedures,                     |                                              |
|                                                             | opportunities Social                     | expert panels and                          |                                              |
|                                                             | change process                           | experts, criteria,                         |                                              |
|                                                             | Reflexivity                              | programme committee,                       |                                              |
|                                                             | Institutional learning                   | evaluation process                         |                                              |
|                                                             | Multi-disciplinarity                     |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Networks/partnerships                    |                                              |                                              |
| **Activities**                                              | Implementing                             |                                              |                                              |
| Resources                                                   | Partnerships                             |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Interactive research                     |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Commissioned and responsive funding      |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Local initiatives                        |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Gender resources and activities          |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             | Learning cycle                           |                                              |                                              |
|                                                             |                                          |                                              |                                              |
Mainland Brides: Marriages between Taiwan and Mainland China
in the Context of Transnational Marriage Migration
(research proposal)

Lu Chia Wen Melody

Jacob van der Doesstraat 28, 2518 XN The Hague, e-mail: melody1205@yahoo.com

A Research Proposal for the CNWS Ph.D Position
Research Clusters: East Asia: Central Traditions and Regional Diversity
Intercultural Gender Studies
Supervisors: Prof. Dr. Axel Schneider, Sinology Institute; Prof. Dr. Carla Risseeuw, Department of Social and Cultural Studies

Contents:
I. Introduction
II. Conceptual Framework
   1. Existing Frameworks on Marriage Migration
   2. Conceptualizing Chinese Kinship and Relatedness
   3. Marriage Transactions as Gift Exchange or Commodity?
   4. Change of Family Values—Companionate Marriage and Revival of Traditional Practices
III. Research Questions
IV. Research Methods and Data Collection
V. Research Output and Plan of Study

Appendix I: Table I, II
Bibliography
I. Introduction

This research project is about marriages between Mainland Chinese women and Taiwanese men. The "mainland bride phenomenon" is a recent development that started in the early 1990s. Due to the cross-strait political tension, the Taiwanese government set up restrictive measures to regulate this kind of marriages, including a quota system of residential permits. In spite of the mounting pressure from the public to relax the measure, the Taiwanese authorities granted residential permits to less than one fourth of the registered brides so far. Governmental policies and the public discourse in Taiwan often portray mainland brides as the "inferior other", putting them and their families in a marginalized and vulnerable situation. Meanwhile, the Chinese government defines commercial marriages as "trade in women" and has launched a campaign against it. However, little has been done to stop this trend.

This research is an important inquiry for the following reasons:

1) "Transnational" marriage migration, particularly the commercially arranged marriages, has been seriously understudied (Hsia, 1997; del Rosario, 1994). To my knowledge no research has been done on Chinese women's emigration through commercial marriages. The existing frameworks on marriage migration between mainland Chinese women and overseas Chinese men as well as on transnational marriages between people of different ethnicity, which I will elaborate in Section II.1 (p.2), are not sufficient in understanding the mainland brides phenomenon.

---

13 "Taiwanese" refers to people living in Taiwan, including all the ethnic groups, "mainlander", Minnan, Hakka and aborigines.

14 The "Mainland bride phenomenon" (Dà Lù Xīn Niáng) is a term used by the media to describe the rapid growth of marriages between mainland Chinese women and Taiwanese men, including both the earlier practice where couples met through business contacts, and the later ones through commercial arrangements.

15 This is in terms of the right to reside in Taiwan with their family, the right to work, to public health care, etc. These measures apply to mainland Chinese women, not mainland Chinese men or the spouses of other nationalities.

16 The quota has been loosened from 300 per year in 1993 to 3,600 per year in 1999. By 1999, there were 34,000 registered brides, among whom only 7,770 were granted permits. The Taiwanese authorities stated clearly that the current quota (3,600) is already the upper most limit, which is unlikely to be further increased (Mainland Affairs Council, Taiwan, R.O.C. 1999; Also see Appendix I: Table I). It is estimated that the current applicants will have to wait for eight to ten years before they can be interviewed. Until then they are only allowed to "visit" their family in Taiwan three to six months annually.

17 This was identified as one of "six evils" in the 1989 Anti-Six Evil Campaign (Croll, 1995).

18 Being aware of the broad and problematic definitions of marriage in anthropological debates (see Leach, 1982), I confine the definition of marriage here to that legitimized by modern legal institutions, because this is the only possible way for mainland brides to be socially recognized in Taiwan. "Transnational" marriage is broadly defined as marriages between two people from different countries. Whether Taiwan-mainland Chinese marriages qualify as "transnational" will be clarified below. Commercially arranged marriage refers to the system of introduction provided by commercial institutions for the prime purpose of marriage, with or without pre-marital courtship.
2) It concerns the resurgence of traditional values in rapidly modernizing societies that is not unique to China and Taiwan. The inherited perceptions toward marriage and gender roles, among others, are still persistent, or reappearing albeit in changing forms, despite the state's intervention in breaking away from traditions (in China) and Western influence. Is it a revival of tradition to fill the vacuum left by the collapse of socialist ideology in China and the social restructuring in Taiwan in the post-authoritarian era? Or is it a strategy people adopt to cope with new socio-economic realities within given opportunities, in other words, "new wine in old bottles"?

3) It provides a fresh perspective in understanding the cross-strait interaction between Taiwan and China in the context of rapid restructuring in both societies as well as heightened political tensions and rising nationalism against each other. Enormous amounts of literature\(^\text{19}\) on cross-strait relations focus either on political tension at the state-to-state level or on economic integration in the business sector, while little attention is paid to people-to-people, day-to-day interaction in the "private domain". Such studies will not only reveal how different political and socio-economic systems shape people's values and perceptions, but will also help us understand why the barriers caused by political hostility fail to stop people's frequent interaction.

This research will address the above issues by studying the experience of the actors involved, including the brides, husbands, families in both Taiwan and China, their friends, as well as brokers, governmental organizations and the public discourse. The study of Taiwanese-mainland Chinese marriages will yield important theoretical insights into the study of transnational marriages, Chinese migration and the reinvention of tradition(s). The linkage between macro socio-economic changes, cultural notions of marriages and gender relations, and people's living experience will be developed in this research.

II. Conceptual Framework

1. Existing Frameworks on Marriage Migration

Can the mainland bride phenomenon be seen as a form of marriage migration between mainland Chinese women and overseas Chinese men, that can be traced back to the past few centuries, particularly between the Pearl Delta region and Hong Kong/Macau in the past few decades? Or should

---

\(^{19}\) For literature on cross-strait political tensions, see, for example, China Quarterly, No. 148, 1996. For literature on rising nationalism in both Taiwan and China, see Unger, 1996; Zheng, Yongnian, 1999; Zheng, H.S., 2000.
it be treated as part of the global trend of transnational marriages between women from less developed countries and men of wealthier countries? Below I shall briefly discuss their emphases and weaknesses.

**The first framework**, the study on Chinese women’s marriage migration, emphasizes the “sameness” of ethnicity, culture and language as the dominant factor in mate choice (Davis and Harrell, 1993). This current of research mainly focuses on women from coastal China, such as Shanghai, Fujian and Guangdong, areas with a long tradition of emigration (IOM, 1995; Skeldon, 2000) and who join their husbands or fiancés emigrated previously, or who are brought abroad through overseas kin ties. This approach suffers three major weaknesses in analyzing the mainland bride phenomenon: 1) It underrates the role of the modern state in defining citizenship and regulating people’s private lives, especially in the case of Taiwan and China where the “borders” are constructed to scrutinize each other under the influence of nationalism. 2) It cannot explain the increasing percentage of Chinese women marrying non-Chinese foreigners (see appendix: Table I) and the growing number of women from inland provinces in “transnational” marriages (Table II). It also cannot explain the phenomenon of “foreign brides” in Taiwan. 3) It is not sufficient to understand how new forms of institutionalized, commercial arrangements by brokers and new social space created by globalisation, such as the internet and possibility of frequent travel, interweave with traditional marriage practices.

**The second framework**, the study of “mail-order brides” -- this refers to women from developing countries marrying European, North American, Australian and Japanese men through commercial arrangements since the 1970s. These study tends to center on the commercial aspects of marriage, emphasizing the role of organized criminals, and frames the issue as part of the global trend of trade and trafficking in women, that also includes female labour migration, prostitution and pornography under the same analytical category (Derks, 2000; Wijers and Lin, 1997). This current of research identifies colonialism, inequality and poverty caused by market-oriented economy as root causes, and stress how these brides are stereotyped as exotic, submissive women and suffer from slave-like treatment. This approach is problematic in three aspects: 1) It negates the agency of women who “voluntarily” enter into marriage or prostitution, even though some scholars argued that the seemingly “voluntary” action should be treated as manipulation of consent (Truong, 1999). 2) The equation of prostitution and commercial marriages carries a moral connotation about the monetary transaction in

---

20 Prior to mainland brides, the influx of “foreign brides” from Vietnam and Indonesia to Taiwan has been observed. Currently the foreign brides outnumber mainland brides. In legislation and public discourse, these foreign brides are treated all together as a different category from mainland brides. Recently there are many research done on the foreign brides. See Hsia, 1997; Shiao, 2000; Cheng, 2000; Tang and Tsai, 2000; Wang, 2000
marriage, derived implicitly from an ideal of conjugal relations based on romantic love between two independent individuals. This ideal is a modern Western construction (Goody, 1996; Giddens, 1992), and certainly does not apply to traditional Chinese culture, though current marriage laws and policies in China adopt the same discourse. 3) It overemphasizes the economic factors in out-migration, which cannot fully explain why middle-class, educated women\textsuperscript{21} choose to marry “out” when China is experiencing a booming economy.

2. Conceptualizing Chinese Kinship and Relatedness

Chinese society has been widely regarded as a typical example of “lineage theory” developed by Structural-Functionalists in the British Social Anthropological School in the 60s\textsuperscript{22}, that conceptualize kinship as a distinct unit separated from the rest of the society, whose members share natural reciprocal obligations derived from blood relations (Holy, 1997). Freedman argues that the ideology of patrilineal descent takes precedence over all other principles of social organization in China (1979). Chinese kinship can be characterized as the “Continuum of Descent”, which implies that (male) descent is a unity, and that a living man is the personification of all his forebears and of all his descendants yet to be born\textsuperscript{23}. The primary function of marriage therefore is to procreate and to carry on the patrilineal lineage (Baker, 1979). Under such ideology, Chinese women are “married out” (chujià 足腳) from the birth families and sometimes considered by the husband’s family as “polluting” outsiders (Stafford, 2000).

Kinship studies in anthropology have undergone a shift since the 60s with the ground-breaking work of Schneider, who successfully demonstrated that euro-centric assumptions were at the heart of the anthropological kinship studies (1968; 1984). For instance, one of basic premises in the kinship studies he challenged was the overarching meaning that all cultures would give to biological kinship as the sole form of recognized procreation. Following Schneider’s critique, further debates and insights are developed within anthropology, that alongside the “structure” of kinship, attention are paid to the more informal aspects of intimate domestic arrangements of the everyday (overview see Holy 1996). Carsten recently developed this theme further by introducing the term “cultures of

\textsuperscript{21} According to the preliminary data I collected from web-based database of four agencies specializing in arranging mainland bride’s marriages, the prospective brides are from diverse backgrounds; the majority aged between 20 to 30, and 97% of them with high school or tertiary education and working in cities and towns. To what extent these database represent the “real” situation has to be tested by empirical data.

\textsuperscript{22} This was developed mainly by Radcliffe-Brown and elaborated by Fortes and others (Eriksen, 1995; Holy, 1996).

\textsuperscript{23} It refers to mainstream ideas of kinship in China associated with the Neo-Confucian trends developed around 900 years ago and not necessarily applicable to ethnic minority groups (Baker, 1979).
relatedness\textsuperscript{24}, in which she attempts to move away from the pre-given euro-centric analytical opposition between the biological and the social on which much anthropological study of Kinship had rested (Carsten, 2000; Strathern, 1992). While noting the overemphasis on the formalist aspect of kinship studies, she elaborates the theme of a renewed focus on the everyday, small, seemingly trivial and taken-for-granted acts, coupled with an openness to indigenous meanings of kinship terms. In doing so she uncovers dynamics of interaction within the kinship domain, which can balance an overweighing of the formal and in this case patrilineal kinship structures. For this she extensively cited Stafford in his attempt to coin the concept of relatedness alongside the formal analysis of kin relations in China (Carsten, 2000; Stafford, 2000).

Another critique in the kinship studies is a shift from treating kinship as a distinct domain to studying the relations of kinship with other domains such as economics, politics, nationality and religion, etc. (Needham, 1971; Schneider, 1984). Several anthropologists have further studied how discourse and practices of kinship, gender, ethnicity and nationalism involve the naturalization of identity and difference (Collier and Yanagisako, 1987).

Given these trends, substantial effort in Sinological anthropology is directed at theorizing the concept of relatedness in Chinese societies, such as gift-giving, reciprocity, gāngqìng ( funcionaicións or feelings), rènqìng (moral norms and human feelings) and guānxi (personal networks)\textsuperscript{25}, etc. While the above few concepts are mainly used in describing non-kin relations, Stafford proposes the concept yáng ( ) to theorize the parent-child relations that challenge the traditional lineage theory. Yáng literally means “to raise” or “to care for” and in the context of parent-child relations it involves mutual obligations of providing each other with material assistance and emotional support. Yáng has a temporal aspect -- “cycle of yáng” -- parents provide yáng to children knowing that they will be provided for when they are old, and it is children’s obligation to “fēngyáng ( )” -- respectfully care for -- their parents. Yáng is not necessarily subordinated to notion of patriliney, because it can be applied to social kinship (foster parents/children) and the absence of yáng may end biological kinship (Stafford, 2000). In short, the nurturance for children and filial piety are not given, it needs to be fostered or cultivated. The same principle applies to the Chinese notion of friendship\textsuperscript{26}, that is strategically cultivated and invested, involving mutual interests. Chinese relatedness is different

\textsuperscript{24} “Relatedness” is broadly defined to include any kind of relation that normally would not be considered as kinship, such as neighbors, friends, but also informal sides within kin relations (Carsten, 2000; Stafford, 2000). In this context, Smart further calls for attention for the theme of anthropology of friendship (2000). See also Overing and Passes (2000).

\textsuperscript{25} For discussions on gāngqìng and rènqìng, see Yan, 1996:139-145; For discussions on guānxi, see King, 1991; Riley, 1994; Yan, 1996; Smart, 2000.
from the Western concept of friendship that stresses voluntary, spontaneous and unconstrained sentiments. However, the instrumental dimension of the Chinese sociability does not necessarily exclude the expressive dimension (Smart, 2000).

Recent scholarly work along this line argue that relatedness is an equal force, alongside patrilir, which characterizes Chinese society. At times though, it overrides patrilir especially in the Chinese immigrant communities. In view of drastic changes and disruptions to family structures and values in the past few decades in China (as a consequence of radical measures brought by socialist ideology followed by economic reforms) and in Taiwan (as a consequence of rapid industrialization), it might be more useful to analyze the resurgence of traditional values with the concept of relatedness together the traditional discourse of patrilineal kinship.

The concept of yōng portrays a fluid, negotiable, reciprocal, incorporative and processual system that is fundamentally different from the traditional male-dominated, rigidly defined kinship system. In this paradigm women are not invisible or seen as “outsiders”, rather, they are at the core of intergenerational relations since they are the ones actually carrying out care-giving practices. Contrary to the projection of the ideal woman as submissive and obedient in patrilineal societies, Chinese women have long been developing strategies to negotiate gender relations (Jaschok and Miers, 1994). As such, my research will not overemphasize the exclusion and alienation these brides suffer; rather I will focus on their strategies of cultivating relations with husbands, parents-in-laws and friends to secure support and recognition, and by doing so, challenge the Westernized discourse on mail-order brides as well as former formalist Kinship studies.

3. Marriage Transactions as Gift Exchange or Commodity?

Traditionally, Chinese marriages are arranged by the kin groups of both sides, often with the help of match-makers. Match-making was a sophisticated process, taking into account social status, wealth, age, appearance, personality and labour contributions of both brides and grooms. The quantity, contents and forms of marriage transaction, including brideprice and dowry, were carefully negotiated by both sides (Baker 1979; Yan, 1996). Many anthropologists studying Chinese society conclude that marriage transaction is part of the gift giving culture that plays a leading role in social life, especially in maintaining, reproducing and modifying interpersonal relations (Whyte, 1993; Yan, 1996).

26 In Chinese terminology there are several idioms describing the different levels of friendship, that cannot be concluded as guanxi (Smart, 2000).
Some sociologists argue that marriage is a means of upward social mobility for women and their birth families. Becker’s “exchange theory” sees marriage as a market, in which economic goods and services are exchanged. Females offer the characteristics sought after by males in exchange for the characteristics and status they desire from males (Thadani and Todaro, 1984). It is based on this conceptual framework of seeing woman’s body, labour and services as commodity that the discourse of anti-trade and trafficking in women is developed.

The anthropological debate on the differentiation between gift exchange and commodity offer a different approach to the issue. Mauss’s distinction between personalized gift giving and impersonalized commodity exchange has been widely accepted (1966). As Gregory elaborates, “commodity exchange establishes objective quantitative relationships between the objects transacted, while gift exchange establishes personal qualitative relationships between the subjects transacting.” (cited by Yan, 1996: 12) However, some anthropologists argue that the radical opposition between gifts and commodities is a result of the ideological construction of pure gift and the romanticization of gift relations in non-Western societies (Parry and Bloch, cited by Yan, 1996:13).

To apply the concept of yāng in the discussion of marriage transaction, the obligation (or “debt”) of yāng of the daughter to her parents is transferred to her parents in law at the moment of marriage, and the brideprice is paid to her parents to return the debt on her behalf. The bride then starts the new cycle of yāng with her husband’s family, and will expect yāng in return from her children and her future daughters-in-law. The transaction can also be applied in the concept of guanxi as a symbol of alliance and reciprocal relations between two families.

4. Change of family values -- Companionate Marriage and Revival of Traditional Practices

Right after the civil war, with the determination to create a new society and a new notion of personhood based on socialist ideology, the communist party of the PRC introduced a new marriage law that radically changed the perception of marriage. The 1950 marriage law outlawed concubinage, child betrothal, brideprice, parental control of mate choice, and condemned traditional rituals (Davis and Harrell, 1993; Yan, 1996). Following strong state propaganda, the meaning of marriage was then constructed as a union of two free individuals living out the ideals of socialist love, that is characterized as “broad mutual ambition, diligent study, hard work and mutual help” (Wang Wenbin et. al, cited by Evans, 1997: 88). Recent studies show that Chinese villages experience a rapid nuclearization of family, and familial relations gradually shifted from intergenerational networks to
conjugal independence (Yan, 1997). Similar trends have also been observed in Taiwan (Yi and Lu, 1999). Whether the phenomenon is a product of state policies, or as Goode suggests, the outcome of economic growth and industrialization (1982), or the influence of the “Western” model of the ideal nuclear family (Collier, Rosaldo and Yanagisako, 1982), or a combination of these factors, remains to be studied.

However, the practice of marriage transactions continues to be prevalent in both China and Taiwan. In China especially, a revival of these practices has been observed27, though it is noted that the forms and means of transaction have been transformed, and there is an increasingly direct participation of brides and grooms in negotiating transactions (Siu, 1993; Yan, 1996). In Taiwan, a rising emphasis on family values, such as filial piety, traditional gender roles and the division of labour, marriage fidelity, etc. has also been noted28. Furthermore, growing popularity of various mechanisms in intermediating marriages and romance, in both Taiwan and China, such as friendship websites, match-making clubs and TV shows, etc. also signal a trend that men and women from diverse backgrounds need facilitation in courtship and in finding ideal partners. Does the resurgence of traditional practices imply a setback for gender equality achieved in the past few decades? How does the notion of companionate love articulated by the above mechanisms affect the traditional perceptions?

Meanwhile, economic reform in China has led to cutbacks in public expenditure, and the responsibility of child-rearing, care of the aged, sick and needy has fallen back on the family. The financial burden of care has been increasing, especially since the implementation of one-child policy in 1979 (Davis and Harrell, 1993). Old practices of féngyǎng based on patriline may not be sustained, because the married-out daughter will have to take responsibility of caring for her own parents if she is the only child. Therefore the mainland brides may be expected to be responsible for caring for both sides of the family, either physically and/or financially. The concept of yāng then may overrule the responsibility of women within traditional Chinese kinship. Here we see an example of how social policies and the construction of traditional gender roles work together to put new pressures on individuals. This pressure is further reinforced by the increasing nationalism which accentuates the polarization of family conflicts.

27 In China, the custom of brideprice and dowry has increased as the result of the loosening of legal and local control after economic liberalization. A national survey in 1986 in rural China shows that the expenditures on brideprice increased tenfold between 1980 and 1986 (Various source, cited by Yan, 1996: 177).
28 This is according to a national Basic Survey on Social Changes carried out by Institute of Sociology, Academia Sinica, Taiwan. The survey investigates people’s views on family, education, social stratification and mobility, political culture, cultural values, religion, etc. The project started in 1984 and surveys are conducted once every five years. This data is available at http://140.109.196.2/sc1/home.htm
To summarize, the existing frameworks of “trade in women”, “alliance and gift exchange”, and “companionate marriage” construct sharp distinctions among various meanings and assumes that they cannot coexist. This research will challenge these discourses and adopt a processual framework. The meanings of marriage are multifold and plural, and should be analyzed as a constant process of negotiation among different actors, as well as their interaction with the wider social processes.

III. Research Questions

I pose four sets of twin questions to address different aspects of the research.

First of all, I attempt to study the factors in people’s decisions to enter such marriages. Contrary to common assumptions drawn from existing accounts on trafficking, mainland brides are not rural, uneducated women. Instead, they are more likely to be well-educated women working in the cities. Meanwhile, the men who turn to the agencies seeking foreign brides are predominately the socially disadvantaged, in terms of income, education, physical/mental fitness and geographical isolation -- the ones who have difficulties in marrying local women. Poverty, therefore, is not a sufficient factor to explain why these brides decide to marry foreigners or overseas Chinese.

1. Why do these brides opt to marry out and risk putting themselves in a vulnerable and disadvantageous situation? What are the aspiration and expectations of the brides, her birth family and community?

2. Why do Taiwanese men marry mainland brides? What do the husband and his family expect from the bride? Why choose mainland brides, and not Taiwanese women or other foreign brides?

Secondly, I want to study how the mainland brides cope with disadvantageous situation and what are their strategies to secure resources and social support. In the process of adjusting to their new lives, the brides are seen as “different” or “outsiders” by the families of their husbands. In the case of Taiwanese-mainland Chinese marriages, these differences are reinforced by varying process of socialization and discourse in two societies as well as the difficulties in living arrangements caused by restrictive governmental measures. Being a married woman yet having to live with her birth family in

---

29 According to research on Vietnamese and Indonesian brides in Taiwan, among all the couples registered and interviewed (by the immigration bureau), 8% of the husbands are physically disabled, and 0.7% are mentally disabled. This figure is far higher than the average 1.47% (both physical and mental) among Taiwanese (Wang, 2000).
China for a long period of time will also bring the bride certain stigmas. All these factors put their marriage life in a vulnerable situation, especially when family conflicts arise between the demands from the birth family and family-in-laws.

3. How do government policy and the public discourse in both Taiwan and China view and portray mainland brides? To what extent are they seen as “outsiders”, as compared with Taiwanese brides and other foreign brides? What are the differences being attributed to?

4. How do mainland brides negotiate their gendered positions versus husbands, family-in-laws and birth family, and social network?

Thirdly, I want to examine if and how, from the actors’ experience, modern commercially arranged marriages differ from the customary practice of match-making in Chinese societies. Whether monetary transaction equates to trade has to be examined in relation to the cultural logic shaped by traditional values and modern social changes, that in turn informs the actors’ behaviors.

5. What are the perceptions of marriage as reflected in changing laws and the public discourse?

6. What are the actors’ expectations and perceptions of gender roles, marriage life and functions? How are they reflected in the pre-marital negotiations, marriage ceremony and transactions, as well as marital life? Are these expectations met, or do perceptions change over time?

Lastly, I want to explore the factors contributing to the resurgence of certain traditional values in both Taiwan and China.

7. Why do inherited perceptions toward marriage and gender roles still persist and even resurface during/after successful modernization?

8. How “traditional” are these perceptions? How are they shaped, or “reinvented” by the modern social changes?

IV. Research Methods and Data Collection

This study will use ethnography as its main research methodology and supplement this with discourse analysis. The methods include in-depth and semi-structured interviews, group interviews, participant
observation, visual-ethnography and analysis of official documents and media representations. I am familiar with discourse analysis and has used this methodology in my MA thesis. I have also taken courses on visual-ethnography and ethnographic methodology during the Master Course at CNWS in order to strengthen my capacity to conduct this research. The research process will take three phases briefly sketched out below:

**Phase I. Overview and Pre-entry (January – March 2002)**

In this phase, I will work in one of the agencies brokering the marriages with mainland brides, who had already granted permission to do so. I will also build contacts with potential informants through the database of the agency as well as through my own network. I will collect secondary data, including existing research, government policies, statements, statistics, media representation, etc. from the Taiwan and China. From Taiwan the data will be found in the National Central Library, and the Institute of Ethnology and the Institute of Sociology in Academia Sinica in Taipei, Taiwan. In China the data will be collected from China Women’s News, the All China Women’s Federation and the Chinese Academy of Social Science. Contact has been established with these organizations and assistance will be provided. Dr. Han Jialing from Beijing Academy of Social Science, who has recently completed a preliminary study on mainland brides focusing on out-migration factors, has agreed to exchange her data and research findings with me.

**Objectives:**

1. Develop an overview of the social and economic backgrounds of married couples and prospective brides and grooms.
2. Identify the sampling and number of informants for in-depth interviews (phase II).
3. Prepare for entering into the main fieldwork site (phase II)
4. Gather public opinion about mainland brides in Taiwan.
5. Collect secondary data.

**Methods:**

1. Collect information on the background of married and prospective brides and grooms, including their age, profession, physical condition, income, education, origin, ethnicity, years of marriage and family members, etc. through the database of the agencies.
2. Document the common practices and arrangements of brokered marriages and marriage ceremonies (in both Taiwan and in China), registration and transactions through participant observation, (e.g. by joining match-making tours in China organized by the agency I work with).
3. Semi-structured interviews with those working in the agency as well as their customers (e.g.
prospective grooms and their family).

4. **Structured interviews** with officials in relevant government organizations such as the Mainland Affairs Council (MAC) and the Strait Exchange Foundation (SEF) in Taiwan, and Association for Relations Across the Taiwan Strait (ARATS) in China.

5. Collect the relevant regulations, policies and official statements released by Taiwanese and Chinese governments and the media representation. The legal documents include the marriage and family laws, the laws regulating cross-strait relations, the social welfare policies, etc. The media representation on mainland brides will be collected from two mainstream newspapers in Taiwan (China Times and Liberty Times), two mainstream newspapers in China (People’s Daily and China Women’s News), and selected visual images from TV news and magazines in the period from 1993 to 2000.

* The sampling of key informants will take into account of the socio-economic backgrounds, including the brides, grooms and key family members of the “successful” marriages as well as of the “failed” marriages. The latter includes runaway brides, brides who become illegal workers or prostitutes, etc.

**Phase II: Main Fieldwork (December 2002 –July 2003)**

In this phase, I will establish residence in the main fieldwork site, Pa-teh district, a town situated in the outskirts of the capital in Taiwan, where the Association of Mainland Brides is located, while travelling from time to time to other parts of Taiwan to conduct interviews with other informants.

Objective: gather information on the lives of mainland brides in Taiwan.

Methods:

1. Participate in the activities of the Association of Mainland Brides and observe the group dynamics and individual members through participant observation and group interviews.
2. Observe the daily activities of the focus group, including the brides, their husbands, family members and friends.
3. **In-depth Interviews** with the focus group.
4. Participate in the pre-marital arrangements and marriage ceremonies (in both China and Taiwan) of newlywed couples and observe the activities.
5. Participate in and observe the interviews of immigration officers with these couples.
6. Videotape the above mentioned activities, interviews and ceremonies.
In this phase I will visit and live with the brides’ and their birth families in China. I will choose two case studies on two brides whose families live in different provinces in China.

Objective:
1. Gather information on the lives of mainland brides in China.
2. Compare the brides’ living environment, social network and kinship relations in Taiwan with that in China.
3. Gather information on the expectation and perception of the brides’ birth family and community towards “transnational” marriages and the impact of these on the community.
4. Gather feedback from the informants and verify the information.

Methods:
1. Observe the daily activities of the brides, their families and communities.
2. In-depth interviews with the brides’ parents, relatives and friends.
3. Videotape the activities and interviews in China.
4. Show the video taped both in Taiwan and China to the brides and their family in China and collect their feedback and reactions.
5. Show the video to the Association and conduct group feedback interviews.

I schedule the fieldwork in three phases for the following reasons: 1) Preparatory work in Phase I is extremely important for identifying the number and sampling of the key informants, that needs be done as early as possible. However, the time may be adjusted according to the schedule of the course I will take. 2) Between Phase I and II, I need time to process the secondary data collected from Phase I that will be used for interviews in Phase II. 3) Between Phase II and III, I need time and equipment to do preliminary video editing for feedback. 4) Phase III is scheduled during the Chinese New Year because during which the brides are more likely to return to China. However, the time for Phase III may be adjusted depending on when the brides chosen as the case studies will return to China upon the expiry of their visiting visa.
V. Research Output and Plan of Study

Expected Output of the Research
2. An ethnographic film
3. 2-3 articles published in journals.

Plan of Study
The time frame of the research is as follows,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>September - December 2001</td>
<td>Course work; Prepare for the first phase of fieldwork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January - March 2002</td>
<td>Fieldwork: Phase I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April - December 2002</td>
<td>• Organize the data collected in Phase I.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Prepare the full PhD research plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Other course work, if necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2002 - July 2003</td>
<td>Fieldwork: Phase II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September - December 2003</td>
<td>• Organize the data collected in Phase II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Edit the video materials to be used in Phase III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2003 - February 2004</td>
<td>Fieldwork: Phase III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 2004 - 2005</td>
<td>Writing the PhD Thesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The end of year 2005</td>
<td>Complete the final draft of PhD Thesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Final Defense</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX I:

Table I Number of registered marriage between citizens of the PRC and other nationals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number/Sex of the PRC Citizens</th>
<th>Number and Nationalities of Spouses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>21670</td>
<td>2030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>23904</td>
<td>2438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>25979</td>
<td>3518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>29237</td>
<td>3331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>31100</td>
<td>2660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>40917</td>
<td>3059</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Compiled by Research Institute of All China Women’s Federation and Department of Social, Science and Technology Statistics, State Statistical bureau. Published by China Statistical Publishing House.

Table II Origins of the PRC citizens marrying non-Chinese foreigners and Taiwanese (Top five provinces/areas and numbers)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>With non-Chinese</th>
<th>With Taiwanese</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Beijing: 278 5. Sichuan: 52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Hunan: 50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Hunan: 114</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Jilin: 3426 5. Fujian: 386</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Gender Statistics in China 1990-1995
Bibliography


Cheng, Ya-Wen (2000) “From South China Sea to Taiwan: an exploration of South East Asian foreign brides’ marriage and life in Taiwan – a case study of Taiwan City” Master Thesis. National Tung-Hua University, Graduate School of Ethnic Relations and Culture. The full paper can be downloaded from http://datas.ncl.edu.tw (Original in Chinese, title translated by Melody LU.)


ANNEX 1

EADI Gender and Development Working Group

EADI - European Association of Development Research and Training Institutes
Kaiser Friedrich Strasse 11, 53113 Bonn, Germany
Tel: (+49) 228 261 81 01; Fax: (+49) 228 261 81 03
E-mail: busse@eadi.org (Susanne Busse)
Web-site: www.eadi.org

EADI - European Association of Development Research and Training Institutes - is an independent and non-profit making international non-governmental organisation. It is an active network of 170 organisations with over 20 working groups addressing key issues in Development Research, Training and Information. EADI’s purpose is to promote development research and training activities in economic, social, cultural, technological, institutional and environmental areas. Its objectives are to generate and stimulate exchange of information between European scientists and researchers concerned with development issues; to promote interdisciplinary studies on specific themes; to develop contacts with researchers from other regions of the world.

The network is managed from a small central Secretariat in Bonn, Germany, although its Executive Committee is drawn from throughout Europe. You can be part of this network as an individual member or if your institution joins.

To meet EADI’s aims, members and non-members take part in thematic working groups (more than 20 groups) which organise conferences, seminars, research projects, and publish their results in the EADI Book Series. The Gender and Development Working Group is one of the thematic working groups of EADI. For more information you can contact the convenors of the G&D Working Group:

Joy Clancy, Technology and Development Group, University of Twente
P.O. Box 217, 7500 AE Enschede, Netherlands
tel.: (+31)53 - 489 3537, fax: (+31)53- 489 3087
e-mail: J.S.Clancy@tdg.utwente.nl
website: www.utwente.nl/tdg

Gudrun Lachenmann, Universitit Bielefeld, Sociology of Development Research Center
Postfach 100131, 33501 Bielefeld, Germany
tel.: (+49)521 - 106 46 51, fax: (+49)521 - 106 29 80
e-mail: gudrun.lachenmann@post.uni-bielefeld.de
ANNEX II
Gender and Globalisation:
Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring

Workshop Programme
EADI Gender and Development Working Group
April 20/21 2001

Convenors:
Dr. Joy Clancy, Technology and Development Group, University of Twente;
Dr. Margaret Skutsch, Technology and Development Group, Univ. of Twente;
Prof. Dr. Gudrun Lachenmann, Sociology of Development Centre, Univ. of Bielefeld.

Exec. Comm. Member Netherlands:
Prof. Dr. Isa Baud, Inst. of Human Geography, Faculty of Environmental Sciences,
University of Amsterdam.

Friday April 20, 2001

09.00-09.30  Registration
09.30-09.45  Welcome
             Dr. J. Clancy

Part 1: Globalisation, macro-economic policy and gender
09.45-10.45

Moderator:  Dr. M. Skutsch
Discussant: Prof. Dr. I. Baud

Speaker:
09.45-10.45  Dr. I. van Staveren, Institute of Social Studies, The Hague
             Global Finances and Gender

10.45-11.15  Coffee break
Part 2: Local restructuring of gendered economics
11.15-12.45

Moderator: Prof. Dr. G. Lachenmann

Speakers:
11.15-12.00 Dr. P. Dannecker (SDRC Bielefeld)
*Feminisation of textile labour and migration patterns in Bangladesh and Malaysia*

12.00-12.45 Dr. S. Saloma (SDRC Bielefeld/Ateneo Manila University)
*Doing IT: a gender perspective*

12.45-14.00 Lunch

14.00-15.00 Dr. Wendy Harcourt (SID)
*Globalisation, women and the politics of place*

15.00-15.30 Tea break

Part 3: Globalisation and local identities: gender, religion and social security
15.30-17.00

Moderator: Prof. Dr. I. Baud

Speakers:
15.30-16.15 Prof. Dr. S. Leydesdorff, Belle van Zuylen Institute, University of Amsterdam
*Life stories of cultural change: gender and Islam in six countries*

16.15-17.00 Prof. Dr. C. Risseuw, Department of Social and Cultural Studies, University of Leiden
*Globalisation in The Netherlands through Indian feminist’ eyes*

18.00-20.00 Dinner

Friday evening lecture and discussion
20.00-21.30

Moderator: Prof. Dr. I. Baud

Speaker: Drs. E. Maan, General Secretary RAWOO
*Demand-driven research for development; an interactive approach to research programming*
Saturday April 21, 2001

"Work in Progress" on Gender and Development

Moderators: Dr. J. Clancy/Dr. M. Skutsch, Technology and Development Group, University of Twente

09.00 Welcome

09.15-10.15 Wendy Annecke, Gender, Energy and Environment, South Africa
Polishing the paper allows us to read: gender, poverty and energy

10.15-11.15 Dr. Charlotte Martin, Royal Tropical Institute, Amsterdam
Gender Mainstreaming in international research organisations: the European dimension

11.15-11.30 Coffee break

11.30-12.30 Lu Chia Wen Melody, prospective PhD student Leiden University
Mainland Brides: Marriages between Taiwan and Mainland China in the Context of Transnational Marriage Migration

12.30-13.30 Lunch
ANNEX III
List of addresses of speakers

Wendy Annecke, Gender, Energy and Environment, 270 Main Road, St James, South Africa, 7945
e-mail: glo-worn@iafrica.com

Isa Baud, Inst. of Human Geography, Faculty of Environmental Sciences, University of Amsterdam,
Nieuwe Prinsengracht 130, 1018 VZ Amsterdam, Netherlands, e-mail: i.s.a.baud@frw.uva.nl

Joy Clancy, Technology and Development Group, University of Twente, P.O. Box 217, 7500 AE
Enschede, Netherlands, www.utwente.nl/tdg, e-mail: j.s.clancy@tdg.utwente.nl

Petra Dannecker, Sociology of Development Research Centre, University of Bielefeld, P.O. Box
100131, D-33501 Bielefeld, e-mail: Petra.Dannecker@uni-bielefeld.de

Wendy Harcourt, Editor Development Director, Programmes
Society for International Development, Via Panisperna 207, 00184 Rome Italy
e-mail: wendyh@sidint.org

Gudrun Lachenmann, Sociology of Development Research Centre, University of Bielefeld, P.O. Box
100131, D-33501 Bielefeld, e-mail: gudrun.lachenmann@uni-bielefeld.de

Selma Leydesdorff, University of Amsterdam, Belle van Zuylen Institute, Rokin 84-90, 1012 KX
Amsterdam, the Netherlands, e-mail: leydesdorff@pscw.uva.nl

Ed Maan, RAWOO, PO Box 29777, 2502 LT The Hague, the Netherlands
e-mail: emaan@rawoo.nl

Charlotte Martin, KIT Gender Team, Royal Tropical Institute (KIT), Linnaeusstraat 35f, PO Box
95001, 1090 HA Amsterdam, The Netherlands, www.kit.nl/gender, e-mail: C.Martin@kit.nl

Carla Risseeuw, University of Leiden, Faculty of Social Sciences, Department of Social and Cultural
Studies, PO Box 955, 2300 RB Leiden, The Netherlands, e-mail: risseeuw@fsw.leidenuniv.nl

Czrina Saloma, Ph.D. student, Sociology of Development Research Center, Bielefeld University,
P.O. Box 10 01 31, D-33501 Bielefeld, Germany and faculty member, Department of Sociology and
Anthropology, Ateneo de Manila University, P.O. Box 154, 0917 Manila, Philippines.
e-mail: czrina.saloma@uni-bielefeld.de

Margaret Skutsch, Technology and Development Group, University of Twente, P.O. Box 217, 7500
AE Enschede, NL, www.utwente.nl/tdg, e-mail: m.m.skutsch@tdg.utwente.nl

Irene van Staveren, Institute of Social Studies, P.O. Box 29776, 2502 LT The Hague, Netherlands
e-mail: staveren@iss.nl

Melody Lu Chia Wen, Jacob van der Doesstraat 28, 2518 XN The Hague
e-mail: melody1205@yahoo.com
Globalisation and Gender


Critical perspectives on globalisation and neoliberalism in the developing countries. Hrsg., Harris, Richard L., u.a.: Leiden u.a., Brill 2000. 183 S., Reg., Tab., graph., Darst., bibliogr.


Civil society at the millennium. / CIVICUS, West Hartford/Cone.:Humanian Pr. 1999. XI+211 S.,


Globalisierung und Gender. / Vereinigung zur Kritik der politischen Ökonomie. Münster: Verl. Westfälisches Dampftoureno 1998. 164 S.,


Bang-Soon Yoon: Korean Women In the global


30 Information drawn from the ELAND service, see http://www.eadi.org/eland


Frauenarbeit in Lateinameerika, Gewinnmanner der Globalisierung?, eine Dokumentation / Forschungs- und Dokumentationszentrum Chile/Latinoamerika (FOCL). Berlin: FOCL 1996. 73 S., Bibliogr. S.73


Globalisation employment and Gender Oster, Sylle 1999

CHENG, Lucie: LA MONDIALISATION ET LE TRAVAIL REMUNERES DES FEMMES EN ASIE 1999

CARRASCO, Cristina (ed.): MUJERES Y ECONOMIA: NUEVAS PERSPECTIVAS PARA VILIOS Y NUEVOS PROBLEMAS 1998

LATINA FISCHER P., Amaia e.; FONTENIA, Marta; BELLOTTI, Mag., COOPERACION, FEMINISMO Y DESARROLLO EN AMERICA . .1999

Barton, Carol: Women's labour and economic globalisation Gender and Development, 8, 1, pp.35-44 2000


Harcourt, Wendy: The globalisation of the economyFOCUS ON GENDER: perspectives on women and development - an Oxfam journal, 2, 3, pp.6-14 1994

Labour market and Gender


BAUD, Isabelle Suzanne Antoinette Forms of production and women's labour: gender aspects of industrialisation in India and Mexico / door Isabelle Suzanne Antoinette Baud eindoven: Technische universiteit, [1989]


HEINSMAN, Rohini The gender division of labour in manufacturing industry: a case study in India / Rohini Heinisman Brighton : Institute of Development Studies. 1988 i. 31 p. ; tabl., 21 cm (Discussion paper ; 235) bibliogr. : p. 30-31


EADI-Workshop Gender and Globalisation: Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring

156
Evers, Barbara; Walters, Bernard The model of a gender-segregated low-income economy reconsidered: evidence from Uganda
In: Review of development economics, 5.no.1 (2001), 76-88

Spring, Anita Women farmers and commercial ventures: increasing food security in developing countries
Boulder: Lynne Reiner. 2000 Directions in applied anthropology: adaptations and innovations

Sheltra, Sonia Is child work necessary? DEEPS Development economic Research Programme series : no. 26

Aganwal, Bina Group functioning and community forestry In South Asia: a gender analysis and conceptual WIDER working papers ; no. 172

Papola, T.S.; Shama, Alakh N., Gender and employment in India
Indian Society of Labour economics. Institute of economic Growth (Delhi, India)/New Delhi: Vikas Publishing House Pvt. Ltd., 1999 439 p

Ziegler, Joseph e.; Fodreg, Yvonne van der Meuten. Occupational segregation and the gender earnings gap
Asian Development Bank. economics and Development Resource Center Manila: ADB, 1999 38 p Occasional papers; no. 21

Mirza, Jasmin Accommodating purdah to the workplace: gender relations in the office sector in Pakistan
In: Pakistan development review : an international journal of development economics / Pakistan Institute of Development economics, 38.no.2 (1999), 187-206

Ibrahim, Sabia, Anthropometric patterns and correlates of growth attainment in under-five Pakistani children
Pakistan development review : an international journal of development economics / Pakistan Institute of Development economics, 38,no.2 (1999), 131-02

de Sousa, Clara. Rebuilding rural livelihoods and social capital: Mozambique’s experience
Heidelberg: WIDER, 1999 WIDER working papers no. 171

Larsson, Pia . , Conflict, cooperation and female empowerment: a multilevel comparative study of urban employed and semi-rural self-employed women in Senegal Lund: Department of economics, University of Lund: 1998 80 p


Bharadwaj, J.J.; Bharadwaj, Seema,Gender related development index for major states of India: an economic analysis In: Indian Journal of economics, no.312 (1998), 9-19

Kim, Kyong; Du, A critical review on measuring gender and human development In: Journal of rural development / Korea Rural economics Institute. 21.no 1 (1998), 89-114

Lukas, Kerin; Perlski, Gerti. Gender and Development : entwicklungslosik im Interesse der Frauen 2000
Neuhold, Brita; Henkli, Birgit; Weyss, Birgit; Frauenrechte - Menschenrechte: Vom Traum zur Wirklichkeit 1e999


Kingdon, Geeta Gandhi: Does the labour market explain lower female schooling In India?35 (1996),1,5,39-55
A selection from the ELD@ND catalogue - http://www.eadi.org/eland

Tasikata, Dzodzi Mensah-Kutin, Rosal: Draft research report FNV/CIV research project on organising women in precarious labour conditions in the south: The case of women rural agricultural workers in the General and Agricultural Workers Union (GAWU) of the Traders Union Congress (TUC) of Ghana 1998


Fendrich, Sabine: FrauenArbeit und Gendersstrategien - Kurzbericht 1997

Hoodfar, Homa: Between marriage and the market: intimate politics and survival in Cairo 1997


Gluck, Peter; Sahn, David e.: Gender and education: Impacts on employment and earnings in West Africa: evidence from Guinea 45(1997).4, S.753-823

Sphargan, Thomas: Floating population and migration in China: The impact of economic reforms 1997

Strachan, Peter; Peters, Chris: Empowering communities: A casebook from West Sudan 1997

Esplinu, Yen Le: Asian American women and men: Labor, laws, and love 1986


Joekes, Susan: Does taste liberalisation carry a gender price tag? S.22-30 I A 1376


Frauen werden ein wichtiger Wirtschaftsfaktor II A 490 S.4-10

Pedreiro, Mercedes; Reiel-n., Teresa; Barr-n., Antonia: Desigualdad en el acceso a oportunidades de empleo y segregar con ocupacional por genero. Situacion actual en Mexico y propuestas S.99-112, II F 332

Campanile, Veronica: Gender profile of scudtor 1995

International Labour Organisation, Geneva: Gender, Poverty and employment: Towards Capabilities into entitlements 1995


Sszasz, Ikhone: Women and migrants: Inequalities in the labour market of Santiago, Chile Nr.56(1995),S.185-196


Brah, Avtar: "Race" and "Culture" in the Gendering of Labour Markets, South Asian Young Muslim Women and the Labour Market S. 151-171 I A 90

Braunstein, elissa: Engendering foreign direct investment: Family structure, labor markets and international capital mobility World development, 28, no.7 (2000), 1157-72


Pagan, Jose A.; Sanchez, Susana M.: Gender differences in labor market decisions: evidence from rural Mexico In: Economic development and cultural change, 48, no.3 (2000), 818-37

Liu, Joseph Y.: The effects of the East Asian crisis on the employment of women and men: the Philippine case In: World development, 28, no.7 (2000), 1285-1306

Benton, Carol; Nazombe, Elinn: Women's labour and economic globalisation: a participatory workshop created by Alternative Women In Development (Ab-WID) In: Gender and development, 8, no.1 (2000), 35-44


Salazar Parremas, Rhieta: Migrant Filipino domestic workers and the International division of reproductive labor In: Gender and society, 14, no.4 (2000), 560-81


CHENG, Lucie: LA MONDIALISATION ET LE TRAVAIL REMUNERE DES FEMMES EN ASIE 1988

GENEROS Y CIENCIAS SOCIALES ALBERDI, Ines; CASTAJO, Cecilia, VILA, Fegu; CONABLE ...1999

CRAFTS, ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND GENDERED ECONOMIC RELATIONS IN SOUTHERN XINJIANG IN THE BELLEHANN, Idel— 1998 39354-C.AS 4/98

RURAL LIVELIHOODS AND SOCIAL NETWORKS IN UZBEKISTAN PERSPECTIVES FROM ANDIJAN KANDYOTI, Dent 1998 39346-C.AS 4/98

L'ECONOMIE DU COTE DES FEMMES DE L'OUEST DE LA TUNISIE 1986

MUIRHEADS Y ECONOMIA: NUEVAS PERSPECTIVAS PARA VIETNAM Y MERCADO DE LA HIDROCARBURO, (K) 1998 38999-L

MERCADOS GLOBALES, GENERO Y EL HOMBRE MANTE 1999 38578-I.B. 2999

"NO SE NACE MUJER... " BEAUVOIR, Simone de 1999
A selection from the EL@ND catalogue - http://www.eadl.org/eland

ACCION PRODUCTIVA, BIENESTAR Y DESIGUALDAD. REFLEXIONES SOBRE LAS DIMENSIONES DE GENE. ... KABEER. Nella 1999

Gender and economics


Les silences pudiques de l'économie : économie et rapports sociaux entre hommes et femmes = economics and gender = economia y género = textes / réunis par Yvonne Præstvedt : avec la collab. de Anne Zwahlen Berne ; Commission nationale suisse pour l'Unesco ; DOC. (Direction du développement et de la coopération) ; Genève : IUED (Institut universitaire d'études du développement), 1998

Schafgans, Marcia M. Gender wage differences in Malaysia /Journal of Development economics, 83, 2, pp.351-378 2000


Seguíno, Stephanie The effects of structural change and economic liberalisation on gender wage differentials in South Korea and Taiwan. Cambridge Journal of economics, 24, 4, pp.437-459 2000

Zhang, Jursen Gender bias and economic development in an endogenous growth model /Journal of Development economics, 59, 2, pp.497-526 1999

Kibria, Nazir Culture, social class, and income control in the lives of women garment workers in Bangladesh /GENDER AND SOCIETY. 9, 3, pp.280-300 1995

Benjamin, Dwayne Markets, discrimination, and the economic contribution of women in China /ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND CULTURAL CHANGE, 44, 1, pp.92-104 1995


Tibuluke, Anna The Cost of differential gender roles in African agriculture /Agricultural Economics, 45, 1, pp.69-81 1994

Jokres, Susan Retire or advance? JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT, 8, 5, pp.687-727 1996


Armit, Philip Indian urban poverty /JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT: Policy, economics and international relati, 6, 5, pp.635-643 1994

Cagatay, Niller Gender and international labor standards in the world economy /REVIEW OF RADICAL, POLITICAL ECONOMICS, 28, 3, pp.92-101 1996

Jackson, Cecile Questioning synergism /JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT, 5, 8, pp.651-668 1993

Singh, Ram D. Female agricultural workers' wages, male-female wage differentials, and agricultural growth in a developing country /ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND CULTURAL CHANGE, 45, 1, pp.89-123 1996


Waylen, Georgina Gender, feminism and political economy /NEW POLITICAL ECONOMY, 2, 2, pp.205-220 1997

Maurer, Bill. Symbolic sexuality and economic work in Dominica, West Indies /REVIEW OF RADICAL, POLITICAL ECONOMICS, 23, 3/4, pp.1-19 1991

Udry, Christopher Gender differentials in farm productivity /FOOD POLICY, 20, 5, pp.407-423 1995

Cilibrass, Mozaffar A weakness of the capability approach with respect to gender justice /JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT: Policy, economics, and international relati, 9, 2, pp.201-202 1997

Silberschmidt, Marjoleine Have men become the weaker sex? JOURNAL OF MODERN AFRICAN STUDIES: a Quarterly Survey of Politics, economics & culture, 45, 2, pp.273-292 1992

Nelson, Julie A. Feminism and economics /JOURNAL OF ECONOMIC PERSPECTIVES, 9, 2, pp.131-148 1995

Yvonne Præstvedt (ed.) ; Anne Zwahlen (avec la collaboration de) ; Les silences pudiques de l'économie /Publications de la Commission nationale suisse pour l'Unesco, 1998

Hennetlta, J. Moore, Todd Sanders; Bvire Kaara (eds.) Those who play with fire /London School of Economics, 20, 3, pp.95-110 1999

Moghdam, Valerie M. Gender, development and policy Research for Action 1991 (©)World Institute for Development Economics Research

Gender and Islam

Islam, Sadaf Noor E. The gendered construction of language /The Journal of Social Studies, 90, pp.30-50 2000

Shehabuddin, elora Beware the bed of fire /The Journal of Social Studies, 87, pp.17-46 2000

Shehabuddin, elora Contesting the illigit Sign. /Journals, 4, pp.1001-1044 1999


Ahmed, Rahnuma "Women's awakening" /The Journal of Social Studies, 80, pp.1-27 1999

Sangari, Kunum Gender lines /Social Scientist, 27, 312-313 (58), pp.17-61 1999

Rahman, Russhid Islam Determinants of the gender composition of employment in manufacturing enterprises /The Bangladesh Development Studies, 24, 1/2, pp.25-58 1998

Ahmed, Saida Islam and development Gender and Development, 7, 1, pp.69-72 1999

Ademu, Fatima I. A double-edged sword Gender and Development, 7, 1, pp.56-61 1999

Hashim, Imran Reconciling Islam and feminism Gender and Development, 7, 1, pp.7-14 1993

Santen, Jose C.M. van Islam, gender and urbanisation among the maas of North Cameroon Africa, 58, 3, pp.403-424 1998

Nanda R. Shrestha; Vasant Kaur; Suchita Mazumdar Nepal (special section) /South Asia Bulletin, 13, 1/2, pp.5-92 + pp.93-172 1993

Nationalism and national identities /Feminist Review, 44, pp.1-111 1993

MacLeod above, Arlene Hegemonic relations and gender resilience /SIGNS: a journal of women in culture and society, 17, 3, pp.533-557 1992
A selection from the EL@ND catalogue - http://www.eadi.org/eland

Tskata, Dzodzi; Mereah-Kulin, Rose: Draft research report FNV/CONV research project on organizing women in precarious labour conditions in the south: The case of women rural agricultural workers in the General and Agricultural Workers Union (GAWU) of the Trades Union Congress (TUC) of Ghana 1998

Amin, Sajeda: The poverty-purtleach trap in rural Bangladesh: implications for women's roles in the family 28(1997),2,5,213-232

Fendrich, Sabine: Frauenförd rung und Genderstrategien - Kurzbericht 1997

Hoodfar, Homay: Between marriage and the market: Intimate politics and survival in Cairo 1997


Lockwood, Matthew: Reproduction and poverty in sub-Saharan Africa 28(1997),3,5,91-100

Mahmud, Simeen: Women's work in urban Bangladesh: is there an economic rationale? 28(1997),1,1,235-250

Rogerly, Ben: Linking home and market: Towards a gendered analysis of changing labour relations in rural West Bengal 28(1997),3,5,66-72

Glick, Peter; Sahn, David e: Gender and education impacts on employment and earnings in West Africa: evidence from Guine 45(1997),4,783-823

Scharping, Thomas: Floating population and migration in China: The impact of economic reforms 1997

Sirachen, Peter; Peters, Chris: empowering communities: A casebook from West Sudan 1997

Esteban, Yen Le: Asian American women and men: Labor, laws, and love 1997


Katz, Birgit: Vom Regen in die Traufe? Staat und Frau im ubergang am Beispiel der Beschligtungsallotration in Ru ssland S.53-71 1,5,180

Frauen werden ein wichtiger Wirtschaftsfaktor II 1 A 490 5,4-10

Pedroso, Mercedes, Rand-with, Teresa; Barn-with, Antonie: Desigualdad en el acceso a oportunidades de empleo y seguros de ocupacional por genero. Situaci- con actualizuya en Mexico y pueblos S.99-112 II 5,332

Campanile, Veronica: Gender profile of ecuador 1995

International Labour Organization, Geneva: Gender, Poverty and employment: Turning Capabilities into entitlements 1995

Katz, elizabeth G.: Gender and trade within the household: Observations from rural Guatemala 23(1995),2,5,327-342

Ward, Kathryn B., Pyle, Jean L.: Gender, industrialisation and development (1995),1,6,37-71

Szasz, Ivonne: Women and migrants: Inequalities in the labour market of Santiago, Chile Nr.56(1995),5,185-190


Brah, Avtar: "Race" and "Culture" in the Gendering of Labour Markets, South Asian Young Muslim Women and the Labour Market S.151-171 I A 90

Braunstein, elissa: Engendering foreign direct Investment: family structure, labor markets and international capital mobility 26,1,700(2000),1157-72


Pagan, Jose A.; Sanchez, Susana M.: Gender differences in labor market decision: evidence from rural Mexico 42,1, Economic development and cultural change, 48,1,3(2000),619-37

Lim, Joseph Y.: The effects of the east Asian crisis on the employment of women and men: the Philippine case In: World development, 1,5,1,1300 (2000),1285-1306

Barton, Carol; Nazombol, Elmira: Women's labour and economic globalisation: a participatory workshop created by Alternative Women In Development (All-WID) In: Gender and development, 8,1,4(2000),35-44


Salarz Parraenas, Ruchi: Migrant Filipino domestic workers and the International division of reproductive labor In: Gender and society, 1,4,4(2000),560-81


CHENG, Lucie, LA MONDIALISATION ET LE TRAVAIL: REMUNERATION DES FEMMES EN AFRICA 1996

GENERO Y CIENCIAS SOCIALES ALBERDI, Ines; CASTAJ, Cecilia; VILA, Faga; CONABLE, ... 1999

CRAFTS, ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND GENDERED ECONOMIC RELATIONS IN SOUTHERN CHINA AND IN THE ... BELLER-HANN, Idka-- 1998 39354-C.A. S. 4/8

RURAL LIVELIHOODS AND SOCIAL NETWORKS IN UZBEKISTAN PERSPECTIVES FROM ANDJUY KANDIYOTI, Deniz 99 39346-C.A. S. 4/8

L'ECONOMIE DU COTE DES FEMMES COLIN, Christel; CHENG, Lucie, FOLBRE, Nancy; CONABL ... 2000 38059-P.Ec. 285500


MUJERES Y ECONOMIA: NUEVAS PERSPECTIVAS PARA VIEJOS Y NUEVOS PROBLEMAS CARRASCO, Cristina (Ed.) 1998 38999-L

MERCADOS GLOBALES, GENERO Y EL HOMBRE DE DAVOS BENERIA, Lourdes 1999 38878-L:E. 2899

"NO SE NACE MUJER..." BEAUVOR, Simone de 1999

EADI-Workshop Gender and Globalisation: Processes of Social and Economic Restructuring

160